STINFO COPY

AFRL-HE-WP-SR-2007-0001

Knowledge Based Systems (KBS) Verification, Validation, Evaluation, and Testing (VVE&T) Bibliography: Topical Categorization

S. Y. Harmon

Zetetix
6547 Bayberry Street
Oak Park CA 91301

A. J. Gonzalez

University of Central Florida
4000 Central Florida Blvd.
Orlando FL 32816

R. Knauf

Technische Universitat Ilmenau
98693 Ilmenau Germany

March 2003

Air Force Research Laboratory
Human Effectiveness Directorate
Warfighter Interface Division
Cognitive Systems Branch
Wright-Patterson AFB OH 45433-7604

20071019518

NOTICE

Using Government drawings, specifications, or other data included in this document for any purpose other than Government procurement does not in any way obligate the U.S. Government. The fact that the Government formulated or supplied the drawings, specifications, or other data does not license the holder or any other person or corporation; or convey any rights or permission to manufacture, use, or sell any patented invention that may relate to them.

This report was cleared for public release by the Air Force Research Laboratory, Det 1, Wright Site, Public Affairs Office and is available to the general public, including foreign nationals. Copies may be obtained from the Defense Technical Information Center (DTIC) (http://www.dtic.mil).

AFRL-HE-WP-SR-2007-0001

HAS BEEN REVIEWED AND IS APPROVED FOR PUBLICATION IN ACCORDANCE WITH ASSIGNED DISTRIBUTION STATEMENT.

FOR THE DIRECTOR

//SIGNED//

DANIEL G. GODDARD
Chief, Warfighter Interface Division
Human Effectiveness Directorate
Air Force Research Laboratory

REPORT DOCUMENTATION PAGE

Public reporting burden for this collection of information is estimated to average 1 hour per response, including the time for reviewing instructions, searching existing data sources, gathering and maintaining the data needed, and completing and reviewing this collection of information. Send comments regarding this burden estimate or any other aspect of this collection of information, including suggestions for reducing this burden to Department of Defense, Washington Headquarters Services, Directorate for Information Operations and Reports (0704-0188), 1215 Jefferson Davis Highway, Suite 1204, Arlington, VA 22202-4302. Respondents should be aware that notwithstanding any other provision of law, no person shall be subject to any penalty for failing to comply with a collection of information if it does not display a currently valid OMB control number. **PLEASE DO NOT RETURN YOUR FORM TO THE ABOVE ADDRESS.**

1. REPORT DATE (DD-MM-YYYY) March 2003	2. REPORT TYPE Interim	3. DATES COVERED (From - To) May 2002 – March 2003

4. TITLE AND SUBTITLE
Knowledge Based Systems (KBS) Verification, Validation, Evaluation, and Testing (VVE&T) Bibliography: Topical Categorization

5a. CONTRACT NUMBER

5b. GRANT NUMBER

5c. PROGRAM ELEMENT NUMBER
63832D

6. AUTHOR(S)
[1]S.Y. Harmon, [2]A.J. Gonzalez, [3]R. Knauf

5d. PROJECT NUMBER

5e. TASK NUMBER

5f. WORK UNIT NUMBER
0476DM00

7. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES)
[1]Zetetix
6547 Bayberry Street
Oak Park CA 91301

[2]University of Central Florida
4000 Central Florida Blvd.
Orlando FL 32816

[3]Technische Universitat Ilmenau
98693 Ilmenau Germany

8. PERFORMING ORGANIZATION REPORT NUMBER

9. SPONSORING / MONITORING AGENCY NAME(S) AND ADDRESS(ES)
Air Force Materiel Command
Air Force Research Laboratory
Human Effectiveness Directorate
Warfighter Interface Division
Cognitive Systems Branch
Wright-Patterson AFB OH 45433-7604

Defense Modeling and Simulation Office
1901 N. Beauregard Street, Suite 500
Alexandria VA 22311-1705

10. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S ACRONYM(S)
AFRL/HECS, DMSO

11. SPONSOR/MONITOR'S REPORT NUMBER(S)
AFRL-HE-WP-SR-2007-0001

12. DISTRIBUTION / AVAILABILITY STATEMENT
Approved for public release; distribution is unlimited.
AFRL/PA cleared on 26 June 2007, AFRL/WS-07-1524.

13. SUPPLEMENTARY NOTES

14. ABSTRACT
This report contains a topical categorization of the bibliography of the literature about verification, validation, evaluation and test of knowledge-based systems. This bibliography contains 800 entries. This categorization identifies more than 50 different techniques and 69 different tools. The literature discusses 20 different application categories including analytical chemistry, management decision aiding, space, telecommunications, financial, computer configuration, law, medical, laboratory data analysis, product design, manufacturing, speech and text understanding, scheduling, software engineering, mineral exploration, and natural language generation. By far, the most cited application was medical with 153 reference citations. Thirty different specific expert systems were cited in this literature. Eleven different system types were identified including embedded, neural network, control, hybrid and production systems. Of these, production systems were the most cited with 68 explicit references.

15. SUBJECT TERMS Human Behavior Modeling, Knowledge Based Systems, Verification Validation Evaluation and Test (VVE&T), Bibliography

16. SECURITY CLASSIFICATION OF:			17. LIMITATION OF ABSTRACT	18. NUMBER OF PAGES	19a. NAME OF RESPONSIBLE PERSON John L. Camp
a. REPORT UNCLASSIFIED	b. ABSTRACT UNCLASSIFIED	c. THIS PAGE UNCLASSIFIED	SAR	126	19b. TELEPHONE NUMBER (include area code)

Standard Form 298 (Rev. 8-98)
Prescribed by ANSI Std. 239.18

i

THIS PAGE LEFT INTENTIONALLY BLANK

INTRODUCTION

This document contains a topical categorization of the bibliography of the literature about verification, validation, evaluation and test of knowledge-based systems. This bibliography currently contains 800 entries. This categorization identifies more than 50 different techniques and 69 different tools. The literature discusses 20 different application categories including analytical chemistry, management decision aiding, space, telecommunications, financial, computer configuration, law, medical, laboratory data analysis, product design, manufacturing, speech and text understanding, scheduling, software engineering, mineral exploration, and natural language generation. By far, the most cited application was medical with 153 references citing it. Thirty different specific expert systems were cited in this literature. Eleven different system types were identified including embedded, neural network, control, hybrid and production systems. Of these, production systems were the most cited with 68 explicit references.

SURVEYS & GENERAL

Reports

ESPRIT II, <u>Report on Validation Tools Evaluation</u>, Deliverable D9, COG/D/3.2, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, Cognitech, 1991. [26]

ESPRIT II, <u>Tools Identification Report</u>, Deliverable D3, COG/D/3.2, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, December 1989. [28]

ESPRIT II, <u>Validation Methods and Tools for Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, Deliverable D5, CEAB/D/3.1, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, 1990. [5, 26]

ESPRIT II, <u>Validation Methods and Tools for Knowledge-Based Systems: State of the Art</u>, Deliverable D1, CEAB/D/1.1, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, 1989. [26, 28]

ESPRIT II, <u>Validation Methods and Tools for Knowledge-Based Systems: Tools Description Report</u>, Deliverable D5, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, July 1990. [28]

Lafon, P., <u>Methodes de Verification de Bases de Connaissances</u>, These de Doctorat, Ecole Nationale des Ponts et Chaussees, Chaussees, France, 1991. [5]

Nazareth, D.L., <u>An Analysis of Techniques for Verification of Logical Correctness in Rule Based Systems</u>, Ph.D. Dissertation, Department of Managerial Studies, Case Western Reserve University, January 1988. [12, 14]

Preece, A.D., <u>Methods for Verifying Expert System Knowledge Bases</u>, Technical Report, Bell Canada, Centre for Pattern Recognition and Machine Intelligence, Concordia University, Montreal, Canada, 1991. [5]

Preece, A.D., Shinghal, R. & Grogono, P., <u>A Perspective On Validation of Expert Systems</u>, Technical Report, Bell Canada, Centre for Pattern Recognition and Machine Intelligence, Concordia University, Montreal, Canada, June 1991. [5]

Rushby, J., <u>Quality Measures and Assurance for AI Software</u>, Technical Report SRI-CSL-88-7R, NASA Contractor Report CR-4187, SRI Project 4616, SRI International, Menlo Park CA, October 1988. [6, 20, 29]

Shortliffe, E.H., <u>Evaluating Expert Systems</u>, Report STAN-HPP-81-9; Stanford University, Stanford, CA, 1981. [20]

Stachowitz, R., Chang, C. & Combs, J., <u>Performance Evaluation of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, Technical Report A-58, Lockheed Software Technology Center, Austin, TX, 1987. [16]

Books

Adelman, L., <u>Evaluating Decision Support and Expert Systems</u>, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1991. [6, 29]

Anderson, J.G., Aydin, C.E. & Jay, S.J., eds., <u>Evaluating Health Care Information Systems: Approaches and Applications</u>, Sage Publications, Thousand Oaks, CA, 1994. [29]

2

Ayel, M.C. & Laurent, J.-P., eds., <u>Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1991. [5, 15, 17, 20, 29]

Bahill, A.T., <u>Verifying and Validating Personal Computer-Based Expert Systems</u>, Prentice Hall, Englewood Cliffs, NJ, 1991. [15, 16, 29]

Cohen, P.R., <u>Empirical Methods for Artificial Intelligence</u>, MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 1995. [29]

Friedman, C.P. & Wyatt, J.C., <u>Evaluation Methods in Medical Informatics</u>, Springer-Verlag, New York, NY, 1997. [29]

Gupta, U.G., ed., <u>Validating and Verifying Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, IEEE Computer Society Press, Los Alamitos, CA, 1992. [5, 15, 29]

Knauf, R., <u>Validating Rule-Based Systems, A Complete Methodology</u>, Shaker Verlag, Aachen, Germany, 2000. [30]

Smith, S. & Kandel, A., <u>Verification and Validation of Rule-Based Expert Systems</u>, CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL, 1993. [4, 15]

Thaller, G.E., <u>Verifikation und Validation</u> (in German), Vieweg Verlag, Stuttgart, Germany, 1994. [30]

Van Gennip, E.M.S.J. & Talmon, J.L., <u>Assessment and Evaluation of Information Technologies in Medicine</u>, IOS Press, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1995. [29]

Articles

<u>Survey Articles</u>

Brender, J., Larsen, H., Lopez, B., Meseguer, P., Nonfjall, H., Plaza, E., Vaudet, J.-P. & Vesoul, P., <u>Validation: State Of The Art</u>, ESPRIT II Project VALID, Deliverable No 1, 1989. [5]

Constantine, M. & Ulvila, J., "Testing Knowledge-Based Systems: The State of the Practice and Suggestions for Improvement," <u>Expert Systems with Applications</u>, 1(3), 1990, pp237-48. [29]

Fox, J., ed. Special Issue, "Knowledge Base Verification," <u>Knowledge Engineering Review</u>, 7, 1992. [29]

Greenwood, S. & Nealon, J.L., "A Comparative Evaluation of Knowledge Elicitation Techniques for Expert Systems," <u>Moving Towards Expert Systems Globally in the 21st Century</u>, J. Liebowitz, ed., Cognizant Communications Corp., Elmsford, NY, 1994 , pp60-65. [29]

Grogono, P., Batarekh, A., Preece, A., Shinghal, R. & Suen, C., "Expert System Evaluation Techniques: A Selected Bibliography," <u>Expert Systems</u>, 9(4), November 1992, pp227-239. [6, 16, 29]

Grogono, P., Preece, A.D., Shinghal, R. & Suen, C.Y., "A Survey of Evaluation Techniques Used for Expert Systems in Telecommunications," <u>Expert Systems with Applications</u>, 5(2/3), 1992, pp395-401. [5]

Grogono, P.D., Preece, A.D., Shinghal, R., et al., "A Review of Expert Systems Evaluation Techniques," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-93 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, AAAI Report WS-93-05, A.D. Preece, ed., Washington, DC, July/August 1993, np. [29]

Gupta, U.G., "Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems: A Survey," <u>Jour. of Applied Intelligence</u>, 3, 1993, pp343-363. [19]

Guyot, J. & Mariot, P., "Validating Expert Systems: Difficulties, Solutions and Tools," <u>Tutorial 5 for the 11th Int. Conf. on Artificial Intelligence</u>, Avignon, France, 1991, np. [26, 28, 29]

Hamilton, D. & Kelley, K., "State-of-the-Practice in Knowledge-Based System Verification and Validation," <u>Expert Systems with Applications</u>, 3, 1991, pp403-410. [5, 6, 20, 29]

Hamilton, D., Kelley, K. & Culbert, C., "Knowledge-Based System Verification and Validation: State-of-the-Practice and Implications for Verification and Validation Standards," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-91 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, Anaheim, CA, July 1991, np. [5]

Hopkin, V.D., "Verification and Validation: Concepts, Issues, and Applications," <u>Verification and Validation of Complex Systems: Human Factors Issues</u>, NATO ASI Series F, Computer and System Sciences, Vol. 110, Springer-Verlag, 1993, pp9-33. [30]

Laurent, J.-P., "Tutorial on Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," <u>Tutorial Notes</u>, 10th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-92), Vienna, Austria, August 1992. [5]

Lopez, B., Meseguer, P. & Plaza, E., "Knowledge-Based Systems Validation: A State of the Art," <u>AI Communications Jour.</u>, 3(2), 1990, pp58-72. [5, 6, 20, 26, 29]

Lydiard, T.J., "Overview of Current Practice and Research Initiatives for the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," <u>Knowledge Engineering Review</u>, 7(2), June 1992, pp101-113. [5]

Nazareth, D.L. & Kennedy, M.H., "Knowledge-Based System Verification, Validation and Testing: The Evolution of a Discipline," <u>Int. Jour. of Expert Systems - Research and Applications</u>, 6(2), 1993, pp143-162. [16, 20]

O'Keefe, R.M. & O'Leary, D.E., "Expert System Verification and Validation: A Survey and Tutorial," <u>Artificial Intelligence Review</u>, 7, 1993, pp3-42. [6, 16, 20, 23, 29]

O'Leary, D.E., "Methods of Validating Expert Systems," <u>Interfaces</u>, 18(6), November/December 1988, pp72-79. [16, 19]

O'Leary, D.E., "Verifying and Validating Expert Systems: A Survey," <u>Expert Systems in Business and Finance: Issues and Applications</u>, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1993, pp181-208. [20, 23]

Preece, A.D. & Suen, C.Y., eds., "Special Issue on Verification and Validation," <u>Int. Jour. of Expert Systems - Research and Applications</u>, 6(2/3), 1993. [9, 29]

Preece, A.D., "Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems: The State-of-the-Art in North America," Jour. of Communication and Cognition - Artificial Intelligence, 11(4), 1994, pp381-413. [9]

Preece, A.D. & Shinghal, R., "Analysis of Verification Methods for Expert Systems," Working Notes, AAAI-92 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, San Jose, CA, 1992, np.

Rousset, M.-C. & Craw, S., "ECAI-96 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Refinement of Knowledge-Based Systems: A Short Report," Knowledge Engineering Review, 12, 1997, np. [22]

Sharma, R.S. & Conrath, D.W., "Evaluating Expert Systems: A Review of Applicable Approaches," Artificial Intelligence Review, 7, 1993, pp77-91. [20]

Talmon, J.L. & van der Loop, R.P., "Literature on Assessment of Information Technology and Medical Knowledge-Based System Evaluation," Assessment and Evaluation of Information Technologies in Medicine, E.M.S.J. van Gennip & J.L. Talmon, eds., IOS Press, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1995, pp283-327. [29]

Zlatareva, N. & Preece, A., "State of the Art in Automated Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," Expert Systems with Applications, 7(2), 1994, pp151-167. [5, 9]

General

Andert, E.P., "Expert System Software Verification, Validation and Test," Proc. of the 2nd ASQC Int. Conf. on Software Quality, 1992, np. [27]

Berry, D. & Hart, A., "Evaluating Expert Systems," Expert Systems, 7(4), November 1990, pp199-208. [29]

Bonnet, A., Haton, J.P., Truong-Ngoc, J.M. & Howlett, J., "Validation of Expert Systems," Expert Systems: Principles and Practice, Prentice-Hall, Englewood Cliffs, NJ, 1988, pp168-183. [20]

Childress, R., "Knowledge-Based Systems: Verification, Validation, and Testing," IEEE Expert, 7, February 1992, pp73-75. [19, 27]

Culbert, C., "Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," Expert Systems with Applications, 1(3), 1990. [30]

Franklin, W.R., Bansal, R., Gilbert, E. & Shroff, G., "Debugging and Tracing Expert Systems," Proc. of the 21st Annual Hawaii Int. Conf. on System Sciences, Honolulu, HI, 1988, pp159-167. [16, 19]

Geissman, J.R. & Schultz, R.D., "Verification and Validation of Expert Systems," AI Expert, 3(2), February 1988, pp26-33. [5, 16, 19, 29]

Gonzalez, A.J. & Barr, V., "Validation and Verification of Intelligent Systems – What are They and how They are Different?," Jour. of Experimental & Theoretical Artificial Intelligence, Special Issue on AI for Systems Validation and Verification, 12(4), 2000, pp407-420. [30]

Gottinger, H.W., "Technology Assessment and Forecasting of Medical Expert Systems (MEST)," Methods of Information in Medicine, 27(2), 1988, pp58-66. [3, 25]

Green, C.J.R. & Keyes, M.M., "Verification and Validation of Expert Systems," Proc. of the IEEE Western Conf. on Expert Systems (WESTEX-87), Anaheim, CA, June 1987, pp38-43. [5, 16, 20, 26, 29]

Grisoni, M., "The Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the Colloq. on the Computing and Control Division, Testing Expert Systems, December 1987, pp4/1-4/6. [20]

Grogono, P., Preece, A., Shinghal, R. & Suen, C., "Building Expert Systems: from Specification to Evaluation," Proc. of the 2nd World Congress on Expert Systems (WCES-94), Lisbon, Portugal, January 1994, np. [9]

Hollnagel, E., "Evaluation of Expert Systems," Topics in Expert System Design, G. Guida & C. Tasso, eds., Elsevier North-Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1989, pp377-416. [20, 29]

Jafar, M.J., "Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-93 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Report WS-93-05, A.D. Preece, ed., Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp127-128. [29]

Jantke, K.P. & Keller, O., "Secure Systems Development – The Evolving Integration of Validation and Verification, "Proc. of the 14th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp, Key West, FL, May 2001, pp630-634. [30]

Johnson, R., Joly, G. & King, P., "Validation and Verification in Expert System Rule Sets," Proc. of the Colloq. on the Computing and Control Division, Testing Expert Systems, December 1987, pp. 3/1-3/3. [20]

Knauf, R., Jantke, K.P., Abel, T. & Philippow, I., "Fundamentals of a Turing Test Approach to Validation of AI Systems," Proc. of 42nd Int. Ilmenau Scientific Colloq., Ilmenau, Germany, 1997, pp59-64. [30]

Levy, A. & Rousset, M.-C., "Verification of Knowledge Bases: A Unifying Logical View," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10, 24]

Lundsgaarde, H.P., "Evaluating Medical Expert Systems," Social Science in Medicine, 24(10), 1987, pp805-819. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Martin-Mattei, C., "Validation, Verification and Testing: Procedures in the Life Cycle of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, np. [5]

Miller, P.L., "Evaluation of Artificial Intelligence Systems in Medicine," Computer Programs and Methods in Biomedicine, 22, 1986, pp5-11. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Miller, P.L., "Evaluation of Artificial Intelligence Systems in Medicine," Selected Topics in Medical Artificial Intelligence, P.L. Miller, ed., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1988, pp203-211. [3, 25, 29]

Miller, P.L., "Evaluation of Artificial Intelligence Systems in Medicine," Proc. of the 9th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-85), Baltimore, MD, 1985, pp281-286. [20]

Nguyen, T.A., Perkins, W.A., Laffey, T.J. & Pecora, D., "Knowledge Base Verification," AI Magazine, 8(2), Summer 1987, pp69-75. [5, 6, 16, 19, 20, 26, 29]

Nykänen, P., Chowdhury, S. & Wigertz, O., "Evaluation of Decision Support Systems in Medicine," Computer Programs and Methods in Biomedicine, 34, 1991 pp229-238. [20, 29]

O'Keefe, R.M. & Lee, S., "An Integrative Model of Expert System Verification and Validation," Expert Systems with Applications, 1(3), 1990, pp231-236. [6, 29]

O'Keefe, R.M. & O'Leary, D.E., "The Verification and Validation of Expert Systems," Proc. of the IJCAI-89 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, Detroit, MI, August 1989, np. [5]

O'Keefe, R.M. & Preece, A.D., "The Development, Validation and Implementation of Knowledge-Based Systems," European Jour. of Operational Research, 92, 1996, pp458-473. [9]

O'Moore, R.R. & Engelbrecht, R., "The Evaluation of Medical Decision Support/Expert Systems," System Engineering in Medicine, J. Talmon & J. Fox, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1990, pp263-273. [20, 29]

Ohmann, C., Otterbeck, R., Franke, C. et al., "Evaluation of Knowledge-Based Systems," Theoretical Surgery, 9, 1994, pp230-237. [29]

Parsaye, K. & Chignell, M., "Expert Systems for Experts," Measuring Expert System Performance, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1988, pp365-374. [20]

Pau, L.F., "Prototyping, Validation and Maintenance of Knowledge-Based Systems Software," Proc. of the 3rd Annual IEEE Expert Systems in Government Conf., Washington, DC, October 1987, pp248-253. [5, 20]

Perkins, W.A., Laffey, T.J., Pecora, D. & Nguyen, T.A., "Knowledge Base Verification," Topics in Expert System Design, G. Guida & C. Tasso, eds., Elsevier North-Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1989, pp353-376. [5, 20]

Plaza, E., ed. Special Issue, "Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems," IEEE Expert, 8(3), June 1993, np. [29]

Ramsey, C.L., Reggia, J.A., Nau, D.S. & Ferrentino, T., "A Comparitive Analysis of Methods for Expert Systems," Int Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 24, 1986, pp475-499. [20]

Richer, M.H., "An Evaluation of Expert System Development Tools," Expert Systems, 3(3), August 1986, pp166-182. [3, 20, 25]

Richer, M.H., "An Evaluation of Five Commercial Expert Systems Tools: KEE, SRL+, S.1, ART, DUCK," AI Report, 2(8), 1985, np. [29]

Sorgaard, P., "Evaluating Expert System Prototypes," Proc. of the 9th Scandinavian Seminar on Use-and-Development of Information Systems, Bastad, Sweden, August, 1986, pp19-22. [3, 20, 25]

Talbot, S. & Ayel, M., "Vèrification et Validation de Bases de Connaissances," Proc. of EXPERTSYS-89, Paris, France, October 1989, pp127-132. [17]

Tsuruta, S, Onoyama T., Kubota, S. & Oyanagi, K., "Validation Method for Intelligent Systems," Proc. of 13th Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 2000, pp361-365. [30]

van Bemmel, J., "Systems Evaluation for the Health of All," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-88), R. Hansen, B.G. Solheim, R.R. O'Moore & F.H. Roger, eds., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1988, pp27-34. [3, 20, 25]

van Harmelen, F. & ten Teije, A., "Validation and Verification of Diagnostic Systems," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, pp117-128. [10, 30]

van Harmelen, F. & ten Teije, A., "Validation and Verification of Conceptual Models of Diagnosis," Proc. of the IJCAI-97 Workshop on Validation, Verification & Refinement of AI Systems and Subsystems, Nagoya, Japan, August 1997, pp53-60. [30]

Vicat, C., Brezillon, P. & Nottola, C., "Knowledge Validation in the Building of a Knowledge-Based System," Proc. of the 2nd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-93), J. Cardenosa & P. Meseguer, eds., Palma de Mallorca, Spain, March 1993, np. [5]

Waterson, A. & Preece, A., "Knowledge Reuse and Knowledge Validation," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp33-39. [8]

Wise, J.A. & Wise, M.A., "Basic Considerations in Verification and Validation," Verification and Validation of Complex Systems: Human Factors Issues, NATO ASI Series F: Computer and System Sciences, Vol. 110, Springer-Verlag, Heidelberg, Germany, 1993, pp87-95. [30]

Wood, W. & Frankowski, N., "Verification of Rule-Based Expert Systems," Expert Systems with Applications, 1(3), 1990, pp317-322. [29]

Wyatt, J.C., "Clinical Data Systems, Part III: Developing and Evaluating Clinical Data Systems," Lancet, 344, 1994, pp1682-1688. [29]

Principles, Practices & Guidelines

Atsumi, K., "Health and Hospital Information Systems Should Be Evaluated: How to, for What, and by Whom," Proc. of the World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-83), J. van Bemmel, M.J. Ball & O. Wigertz, eds., North Holland Publishing Co., Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1983, pp50-53. [3, 25]

Bell, M.Z., "Why Expert Systems Fail," Jour. of the Operational Research Society, 36(7), 1985, pp613-19. [29]

Boehm, B. & Bose, P., "Some Critical Success Factors in Knowledge-Based Software Engineering Applications," Proc. of the IEEE Int. Workshop on Software Engineering Education, IEEE Computer Society Press, Los Alamitos, CA, 1994, pp89-95. [29]

Bologna, S., Ness, E. & Sivertsen, T., "Dependable Knowledge-Based Systems Development and Verification: What We Can Learn from Software Engineering and What We Need," Proc. of the 2nd IEEE Int. Conf. on Tools for Artificial Intelligence (TAI-90), A. Dollas, W.T. Tsai, & N.G. Bourbakis, eds., Washington, DC, 1990, pp86-95. [29]

French, S.W., Culbert, C. & Hamilton, D., "Experiences in Improving the State of Practice in Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-93 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Report WS-93-05, A.D. Preece, ed., Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp78-86. [4, 29]

Mengshoel, O.J. & Delab, S., "Knowledge Validation: Principles and Practice," IEEE Expert, 8(3), June 1993, pp62-68. [5, 19, 20, 29]

Miller, L., "Guidelines for the Verification and Validation of AI Systems," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-93 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Report WS-93-05, A.D. Preece, ed., Washington, DC, July/August 1993, np. [29]

Miller, P.L. & Sittig, D.F., "The Evaluation of Clinical Decision Support Systems: What Is Necessary Versus What Is Interesting," Medical Informatics, 15(3), July-September 1990, pp185-1990. [20, 29]

Nykänen, P., et al., "Guidelines for the Evaluation of Computer-Based Support to Clinical Decision Making," Proc of the Scandinavian Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (SCAI-89), Tampere, Finland, 1989, pp395-402. [3, 20, 25]

O'Keefe, R.M., "The Evaluation of Decision-Aiding Systems: Guidelines and Methods," Information and Management, 17, 1989, pp217-226. [20]

O'Leary, D.E. & O'Keefe, R.M., "Performing and Managing Expert Systems Validation," Advances in Expert Systems for Management, 1993, pp141-176. [23]

O'Moore, R., Clarke K., Smeets, R., Brender, J., Nykanen, P., McNair, P., Grimson, J. & Barber B., Items of Relevance for the Evaluation of Knowledge Based Expert Systems and Influence from Domain Characteristics, KAVAS (A1021) Report EM 1.1, EEC AIM Office, Brussels, Belgium, 1990. [20]

Pedersen, K., "Well-Structured Knowledge-Bases: Part I," AI Expert, 4(4), April 1989, pp44-55. [5, 29]

Preece, A., Shinghal, R. & Batarekh, A., "Principles and Practice in Verifying Rule-Based Systems," Knowledge Engineering Review, 7(2), June 1992, pp115-141. [4, 5, 9]

Preece, A.D. & Shinghal, R., "Foundation and Application of Knowledge Base Verification," Int. Jour. of Intelligent Systems, 9(8), 1994, pp683-702. [5, 9]

St. Johanser, J.T. & Harbidge, R.M., "Validating Expert Systems: Problems and Solutions in Practice," Proc. of the Int. Conf. on Knowledge-Based Systems (KBS-86), London, England, October 1986, pp215-229. [5]

St. Johanser, J.T. & Harbidge, R.M., "Validating Expert Systems: Problems and Solutions in Practice," Proc. of the Int. Conf. on Knowledge-Based Systems (KBS-86), London, England, October 1986, pp215-229. [5]

Terano, T., "The JIPDEC Checklist-Based Guidelines for Expert System Evaluation," Int. Jour. of Intelligent Systems, 9, 1994, pp893-925. [30]

Terano, T., "Checklist-Based Guidelines for Expert System Validation," Proc. of 42nd Ilmenau Scientific Colloq., Ilmenau, Germany, 1997, pp337-342. [30]

Wyatt, J. & Spiegelhalter, D., "Evaluating Medical Decision Aids: What to Test, and How?," Systems Engineering in Medicine, J. Talmon & J., Fox, eds., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1990, np. [3, 25]

Wyatt, J. & Spiegelhalter, D., "Evaluating Medical Expert Systems: What to Test and How?" Medical Informatics, 15(3), July-September 1990, pp205-217. [20, 29]

Reflections, Perspectives & Issues

Barr, V., "Applying Reliability Engineering to Expert Systems," Proc. of 12th Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 1999, pp494-498. [30]

Bench-Capon, T., Coenen, F., Nwana, H., Paton, R. & Shave, M., "Two Aspects of the Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems," IEEE Expert, 8(3), June 1993, pp76-81. [20]

Brender, J. & McNair, P., "Watch the System: An Opinion on User Validation of Computer Based Decision Support Systems in Clinical Medicine," Proc. of the 5th World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-89), B. Barber, C. Dexian, Q. Dulie & G. Wagner, eds., Elsevier North Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1989, pp275-279. [20]

Buchanan, B.G. & Shortliffe, E.H., "The Problem of Evaluation," Rule-Based Expert Systems, B.G. Buchanan & E.H. Shortliffe, eds., Addison Wesley, Reading, MA, 1984, pp571-588. [16]

Bundy, A. & Clutterbuck, R., "Raising the Standards of AI Products," Proc. of the 9th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-85), Los Angeles, CA, August 1985, np. [20]

Bundy, A. & Clutterbuck, R., Raising the Standards of AI Products, Research Paper No. 261, Dept. of Artificial Intelligence, Univ. of Edinburgh, Edinburgh, Scotland, 1985. [20]

Bundy, A., "How to Improve the Reliability of Expert Systems," Proc. of 4th Int. Expert Systems Conf., D.S. Moralee, ed., Brighton, England, December 1987, pp3-17. [20]

Chandrasekaran, B., "On Evaluating AI Systems for Medical Diagnosis," AI Magazine, 4(2), Summer 1983, pp34-38. [16, 19, 20, 29]

Cohen, P.R. & Howe, A.E., "How Evaluation Guides AI Research," <u>AI Magazine</u>, 9(4), Winter 1988, pp35-43. [3, 20, 25]

de Dombal, F.T., "Towards a More Objective Evaluation of Computer Aided Decision Support Systems," <u>Proc. of the World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-83)</u>, J. van Bemmel, M.J. Ball & O. Wigertz, eds., North Holland Publishing Co., Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1983, pp436-439. [20]

Dowie, J., "The Evaluation of Decision Aids: The Role of the Decision Owner," <u>Medical Informatics</u>, 15(3), July-September 1990, pp219-228. [20]

Fieschi, M. & Joubert, M., "Some Reflections on the Evaluation of Expert Systems in Medicine," <u>Methods of Information in Medicine</u>, 25(1), 1986, pp15-21. [3, 20, 25]

Fieschi, M., "Towards Validation of Expert Systems as Medical Decision Aids," <u>Int. Jour. of Biomedical Computing</u>, 26, 1990, pp93-108. [20]

Finlay, P.N., Forsey, G.J. & Wilson, J.M., "The Validation of Expert Systems: Contrasts with Traditional Methods," <u>Jour. of the Operational Research Society</u>, 39(10), 1988, pp933-938. [5, 20, 29]

Forsythe, D.E. & Buchanan, B.G., "Broadening Our Approach to Evaluating Medical Expert Systems," <u>Proc. of the 15th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-91)</u>, Washington, DC, November 1991, pp8-12. [29]

Foster, H.D., "Resilience Theory and System Evaluation," <u>Verification and Validation of Complex Systems: Human Factors Issues</u>, NATO ASI Series F: Computer and System Sciences, Vol. 110, Springer-Verlag, Heidelberg, Germany, 1993, pp35-60. [30]

Fox, J., "Decision Support Systems as Safety-Critical Components: Towards a Safety Culture for Medical Informatics," <u>Methods of Information in Medicine</u>, 32, 1993, pp345-48. [29]

Fox, J., "On the Soundness and Safety of Expert Systems," <u>Artificial Intelligence in Medicine</u>, 5, 1993, pp159-79. [29]

French, R.M., "Peeking behind the Screen: The Unsuspected Power of the Standard Turing Test," <u>Jour. of Experimental & Theoretical Artificial Intelligence,</u> 12, 2000, pp331-340. [30]

Gaschnig, J., Klahr, P., Pople, H., Shortliffe, E. & Terry, A., "Evaluation of Expert Systems: Issues and Case Studies," <u>Building Expert Systems</u>, F. Hayes-Roth, D.A. Waterman & D.B. Lenat, eds., Addison Wesley, Reading, MA, 1983, pp241-280. [3, 6, 16, 19, 20, 25, 26, 29]

Hart, A. & Wyatt, J., "Evaluating Black-Boxes as Medical Decision Aids: Issues Arising from a Study of Neural Networks," <u>Medical Informatics</u>, 15(3), July-September 1990, pp229-236. [20, 29]

Hilden, J. & Habbema, J.D.F., "Evaluation of Clinical Decision Aids: More to Think about," <u>Medical Informatics</u>, 15(3), July-September 1990, pp274-284. [20, 29]

Hollnagel, E., "The Formalization of Knowledge-Based Systems Validation and Verification: Promises and Pitfalls," IFIP Trans. A (Computer Science and Technology), A-14, 1992, pp220-230. [5]

Jamieson, R., "Perspectives on Auditing Operational Knowledge-Based Systems," Expert Systems in Business and Finance: Issues and Applications, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1993, pp249-266. [20]

Kaplan, B. & Lundsgaarde, H.P., "Toward an Evaluation of a Clinical Imaging System: Identifying Benefits," Methods of Information in Medicine, 35, 1996, pp221-229. [29]

Kulikowski, C., "Medical Expert Systems: Issues of Validation, Evaluation and Judgment," Record of the IEEE Symp. on Policy Issues in Information and Communication Technologies in Medical Applications, IEEE Press, New York, NY, 1988, pp45-56. [3, 20, 25]

Lane, N.E., "Global Issues in Evaluation of Expert Systems," Proc. of the 1986 IEEE Int. Conf. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, Atlanta, GA, 1986, pp121-125. [16, 29]

Miller, E.F., "Expert System Validation : Issues and Approaches," Proc of the 7th Int. Conf. on Expert Systems and Their Applications, Avignon, France, May 1987, pp233-236. [3, 5, 20, 25]

Moeller, R.R., "Expert Systems: Auditability Issues," Expert Systems in Business and Finance: Issues and Applications, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1993, pp233-247. [20]

Nazareth, D.L., "Issues in the Verification of Knowledge in Rule-Based Systems," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 30(3), 1989, pp255-271. [5, 16, 19, 29]

Nykänen, P., ed., Issues in Evaluation of Computer-Based Support to Clinical Decision Making, Sydpol Working Group 5, Oslo, University Press, 1990. [20]

O'Leary, D.E. & O'Keefe, R.M., "Performing and Managing Expert Systems Validation," Advances in Expert Systems for Management, 1993, pp141-176. [23]

Plant, R.T., "On the Verification, Validation and Testing of Knowledge-Based Systems," Heuristics, 3(1), Spring 1990, pp59-67. [5]

Preece, A.D., "Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems: Current Trends and Issues," Knowledge Engineering Review, 10(1), 1995, pp69-71. [9]

Rossi-Mori, A. & Ricci, F.L., "On the Assessment of Medical Expert Systems," Expert Systems and Decision Support in Medicine, Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics, 36, O. Rienhoff, V. Piccolo & B. Schneider, Springer-Verlag, 1988, pp292-295. [3, 20, 25]

Rossi-Mori, A. & Ricci, F.L., "Some Comments on the Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems," Proc of the AIM Workshop 6, EEC, Brussels, Belgium, November 1987, np. [20]

Rossi-Mori, A., Pisanelli, D.M. & Ricci, F.L., "The Role of Knowledge-Based Systems in Medicine: Epistemological and Evaluation Issues," Proc. of the COMAC Meeting, Maastricht, The Netherlands, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1989, pp16-18.3. [20]

Sellini, F. & Vargas, C., "Considerations about Validation of Knowledge Models in KBE Systems," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Shadbolt, N., "Building Valid Knowledge Bases: An Acknowledge Perspective," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, pp195-210. [5, 29]

Treur, J. & Willems, M., "On Verification in Compositional Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 11th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-94), A.G. Cohn, ed., Amsterdam, The Netherlands, August 1994, np. [5]

van den Acker, C. & Vanthienen, J., "The Need for a New Approach for the Audit of Expert Systems: Belgian Evidence," New Review of Applied Expert Systems, 4, 1998, pp79-90. [18]

Vermesan, A.I., "Knowledge-Based Systems: Verification and Validation in the View of Certification," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

METHODOLOGIES

Carson, E.R. & Flood, R.L., "Model Validation: Philosophy, Methodology and Examples," Trans. on Instrumentation and Measurement for Control, 12, 1990, pp178-185. [20]

Clarke, K., O'Moore, R., Smeets, R. et al., "A Methodology for Evaluation of Knowledge-Based Systems in Medicine," Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 6, 1994, pp107-21. [29]

Cross, S. & Grisoni, M., "VORTEX: A Methodology for Producing Validated Real-Time Expert Systems," Proc. of the NATO Conf. on Knowledge-Based Systems, Applications for Guidance and Control, N. 474. NATO Advisory Group for Aerospace Research and Development, The Hague, Belgium, 1990, np. [5]

Enand, R., Kahn, G.S. & Mills, R.A., "A Methodology for Validating Large Knowledge Bases," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 33, 1990, pp361-371. [5, 20]

Fitter, M.J. et al., Report on Methodology for Assessment of Suitability of Knowledge-Based Systems for Chronic Health Care, Eurodiabeta Report A1019 (ed/wp/Ass.Met.), nd. [20]

Guida, G. & Mauri, G., "Evaluating Performance and Quality of Knowledge-Based Systems: Foundations and Methodology," IEEE Trans. on Knowledge and Data Engineering, 5(2), April 1993, pp204-224. [20, 29]

Hoffman, R.R., Shadbolt, N.R., Burton, A.M. et al., "Eliciting Knowledge from Experts: A Methodological Analysis," Organizational Behavior & Human Decision Processes, 62(2), 1995, pp129-158. [29]

Jonckers, V., Geldof, S. & Devroede, K., "The COMMET Methodology and Workbench in Practice," Proc. of the 5th Int. Symp. on Artificial Intelligence, Cancun, Mexico, 1992, pp341-348. [29]

Knauf, R., Validating Rule-Based Systems, A Complete Methodology, Shaker Verlag, Aachen, Germany, 2000. [30]

Knauf, R., Gonzalez, A.J. & Abel, T., "A Framework for Validation of Rule Based Systems," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, 32(3), June 2002, pp281-295. [30]

Knauf, R., Gonzalez, A.J. & Jantke, K.P., "Validation of Rule-Based AI Systems: A Complete Methodology," Proc. of the 1999 IEEE Int. Conf. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, Tokyo, Japan, October 1999, ppV744 - V749. [30]

Knauf, R., Philippow, I., Gonzalez, A.J. & Jantke, K.P., "Towards Validation of Rule-Based Systems – The Loop is Closed," Proc. of 13th Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL,, May 2000, pp331-335. [30]

Knauf, R., Philippow, I. & Gonzalez, A.J., "Towards Validation and Refinement of Rule-Based Systems," Jour. of Experimental & Theoretical Artificial Intelligence, 12(4), 2000, pp421-431. [30]

Leicester, H., Roudsari, A., Lehmann, E. et al., "Methodological Issues in Validating Decision-Support Systems for Insulin Dosage Adjustment," Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 6, 1994, pp161-173. [29]

O'Keefe, R.M. & Lee, S., "Developing a Strategy for Expert System Verification and Validation," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, 24(4), 1994, pp643-655. [6, 29]

Onoyama, T. & Tsuruta, S., "Validation Method for Intelligent Systems," Jour. of Experimental & Theoretical Artificial Intelligence, 12(4), 2000, pp461-472. [30]

Prakash, G.R., Subramanian, E. & Mahabala, H.N., "A Methodology for Systematic Verification of OPS5-Based AI Applications," Proc. of the 12th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-91), Sydney, Australia, August 1991, pp3-8. [5, 6]

Preece, A.D., "Towards a Methodology for Evaluating Expert Systems," Expert Systems, 7(4), November 1990, pp215-223. [2, 5, 16, 20, 29]

Silverman, B.G., "Evaluating and Refining Expert Critiquing Systems: A Methodology," Decision Sciences, 23(1), January/February 1992, pp86-110. [20]

Simborg, D. & Whiting-O'Keefe, Q., "Evaluation Methodology for Ambulatory Care Information Systems," Medical Care, 20, 1982, pp255-265. [29]

Smeets, R., Talmon, J. & O'Moore, R., "General Methodology for the Assessment of Decision Support Systems," Proc. of MIC 90, R. O'Moore, ed., Glasgow, Scotland, 1990, np. [20]

Tsuruta, S. & Onoyama, T., "Intelligent Systems Validation Tool Based on Bi-Directional Many-Sided Explanation Typed Multi-Step Validation Method," Proc. of the

14th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp, Key West, FL, May 2001, pp650-654. [30]

Tsuruta, S., Onoyama, T. & Taniguchi, Y., "Knowledge-Based Validation Method for Validating Intelligent Systems," Proc. of 15th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Pensacola Beach, FL, May 2002, pp226-230. [30]

Wyatt, J., "The Evaluation of Clinical Decision Support Systems: A Discussion of the Methodology Used in the ACORN Project," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (AIME-87), J. Fox, M. Fieschi & R. Engelbrecht, eds., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1987, pp15-24. [20]

APPROACHES, METHODS & PROCESSES

Abe, A., Terano, T. & Yoshizawa, T., "QFD Approach to Managing Prototyping Processes for Knowledge-Based Scheduling Systems," Proc. of the IJCAI-97 Workshop on Validation, Verification & Refinement of AI Systems and Subsystems, Nagoya, Japan, August 1997, pp61-64. [30]

Ayel, M. & Laurent, J.-P., "Spècificitès des Processus de Validation et de Vèrification des Systèmes à Bases de Connaissances," Proc. of EXPERTSYS-90, Grenoble, France, October 1990, pp261-268. [17]

Ayel, M.C. & Vignollet, L., "A Common Approach for Verifying and Testing Knowledge-Based Systems," Artificial Intelligence and Software Engineering, J.J.P. Tsai, T. Weigert, & H.-C. Jang, eds., World Scientific Publishing Co., 1993, np. [5, 17]

Bailey, J.J., Itscoitz, S.B., Hirschfeld, J.W., Grauer, L.E. & Horton, M.R., "A Method for Evaluating Computer Programs for Electrocardiographic Interpretation. I. Application to the Experimental IBM Program of 1971," Circulation, 50, July 1974, np. [20]

Bochsler, D.C. & Goodwin, M. A., "A Software Engineering Approach to Expert System Design and Verification," Proc. of the NASA/STID Conf. on Artificial Intelligence for Space Applications, Huntsville, AL, November 1986, pp47-60. [5, 20]

Brender, J., Information Systems Validation, Master's Thesis, Report No. 89-1-22, Institute of Computer Science, University of Copenhagen, Denmark, 1989. [20]

Brunessaux, L., "A Pragmatic Approach to Validation: The Industrial Experience of ALPIN," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, np. [26, 29]

Detmer, W.M., Shiffman, S., Wyatt, J.C. et al., "A Continuous Speech Interface to a Decision Support System: An Evaluation Using a Wizard of Oz Experimental Paradigm," JAMIA, 2(1), 1995, pp46-57. [29]

Feldman, M. & Barnett, G., "An Approach to Evaluating the Accuracy of DXplain," Computer Programs and Methods in Biomedicine, 35, 1991, pp261-66. [29]

Fontaine, D., Le Beux, P., Strauss, A. & Morizet, P., "An Approach for Maintaining the Coherence in a Medical Knowledge Base," Proc. of the 5th World Conf. on Medical

Informatics (MEDINFO-89), B. Barber, C. Dexian, Q. Dulie & G. Wagner, eds., Singapore, Elsevier North Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1989, pp44-48. [20]

François, P., Robert, C., Weil, G. & Demongeot, J., "A Protocol for Testing Expert-System Reliability," Technology and Health Care, 2, 1994, pp19-26. [20]

Geyres, S., "Une Approche Industrielle de la Validation et de la Verification des Systemes a Base de Connaissances," Revue Genie Logiciel et Systemes Experts, 16, September 1989, pp25-35. [5]

Ginsberg, A, "A Metalinguistic Approach to the Construction of Knowledge Base Refinement Systems," Proc. of the 5th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-86), 1986, pp436-441. [26, 29]

Ginsberg, A., "A New Approach to Checking Knowledge Bases for Inconsistency and Redundancy," Proc. of the 3rd Annual Expert Systems in Government Conf., Washington, DC, 1987, pp102-111. [16, 20]

Ginsberg, A., "Knowledge-Base Reduction: A New Approach to Checking Knowledge Bases for Inconsistency and Redundancy," Proc. of the 7th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-88), August 1988, pp585-589. [5, 6, 19, 20, 26, 29]

Ginsberg, A., Weiss, S. & Politakis, P., "SEEK2: A Generalized Approach to Automatic Knowledge Base Refinement," Proc. of the 9th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-85), Los Angeles, CA, August 1985, pp367-374. [20]

Hoppe, T., "Hypotheses Generation for Knowledge Validation," Proc. of the 9th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-90), L.C. Aiello, ed., Stockholm, Sweden, August 1990, pp354-356. [30]

Kinkielele, D. & Ayel, M.C., "Methodes de Verification des Bases de Connaissances Floues," Actes du 4es Congres sur les Applications des Ensembles Flous, Lille, France, December 1994, np. [5, 17]

Laita, L., Ramirez, B., Ledesma, L. et al., "An Approach to Knowledge Based Systems Verification," Zeitschrift fur Math. Logic und Grundlagen der Math, 1990, np. [29]

Levi, K., "Expert Systems Should Be More Accurate than Human Experts: Evaluation Procedures from Human Judgement and Decision Making," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, 19(3), May/June 1989, pp647-657. [20, 29]

Liebowitz, J., "Useful Approach for Evaluating Expert Systems," Expert Systems, 3(2), May 1986, pp86-96. [3, 6, 16, 20, 25, 29]

Llinas, J. & Rizzi, S., The Test and Evaluation Process for Knowledge Based Systems, Technical Report Prepared under Contract F30602-85-C-0313, Task 86-001-01, Calspan Corporation, June 1987. [20]

Loiseau, S., "A Method for Checking and Restoring the Consistency of Rule Bases," Int. Jour. of Human-Computer Studies, 40(3), 1994, pp425-442. [4, 29]

Marcos, M., Moisan, S. & Pobil, A.P., "A Model-Based Approach to the Verification of Program Supervision Systems," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification

and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Matsumoto, K., Takano, T. & Sakaguchi., "A Dynamic Verification Method for Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the IFIP Conf. on Dependability of Artificial Intelligence Systems (DAISY-91), 1991, pp93. [20]

Merlevede, P. & Vanthienen, J., "A Structured Approach to Formalization and Validation of Knowledge," Proc. of the IEEE/ACM Int. Conf. on Developing and Managing Expert System Programs, Washington, DC, September/October 1991, pp149-158. [18]

Miller, L.A., "A Comprehensive Approach to the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the IJCAI-89 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, Detroit, MI, August 1989, np. [5, 6, 29]

Miller, P., A Critiquing Approach to Expert Computer Advice: ATTENDING, Pitman, Boston, 1984. [29]

Miskell, S.G., Happell, N. & Carlisle, C., "Operational Evaluation of an Expert System: The FIESTA Approach," Heuristics, 2(2), Winter 1989, np. [19]

Norris, J., Cuddigan, J. & Ryan, S., "Developing a Method for Validating the Output of Computerized Expert Systems in Nursing," Proc. of the 7th Conf. on Classification of Nursing Diagnoses, A.M. McLane, ed., St. Louis, MO, C. V. Mosby, 1987, pp160-167. [5, 20]

Pearce, D., "A Model Based Approach to Validation," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, pp55-67. [5]

Polat, F. & Guvenir, H.A., "A Unification-Based Approach for Knowledge Base Verification," Expert Systems, 8(4), November 1991, pp251-259. [5]

Preece, A.D. & Shinghal, R., "Practical Approach to Knowledge Base Verification," Proc. of the 9th SPIE Conf. on the Applications of Artificial Intelligence, M. Trivedi, ed., SPIE, Bellingham, WA, 1991, pp608-619. [5]

Suwa, W., Scott, A.C. & Shortliffe, E.H., "An Approach to Verifying Completeness and Consistency in a Rule-Based Expert System," AI Magazine, 3(4), Winter 1982, pp16-21. [3, 5, 6, 16, 19, 20, 25, 26, 29]

Valluy, L., Nykänen, P., Rantanen, J., Salmela, J., Gränroos, P. & Lumio, J., "An Approach to Combine Knowledge Validation and Evaluation with Development in Medical AI," Proc of the Scandinavian Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (SCAI-89), Tampere, Finland, 1989, pp865-875. [3, 20, 25]

van Bemmel, J.H., Plokker, H.W., Hengeveld, S.J. & Talmon, J.L., "Structured Evaluation of ECG Processing Packages," Proc of MEDIS-78, Osaka, Japan, 1978, pp259-260. [20]

Vanthienen, J., Aerts, A., Mues, C. & Wets, G., "A Modelling Approach to Knowledge-Based System Verification," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and

Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5, 18]

Vanthienen, J., Aerts, A., Mues, C. & Wets, G., "A Modelling Approach to Knowledge-Based Systems Verification," Proc. of the 11th IEEE Conf. on Artificial Intelligence for Applications (CAIA-95), Verification and Validation Workshop, Los Angeles, February 1995, np. [18]

Vanthienen, J., Mues, C., Aerts, A. & Wets, G., "A Modularization Approach to the Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, pp96-102. [18]

FRAMEWORKS

Benbasat, I. & Dhaliwal, J. S., "A Framework for the Validation of Knowledge Acquisition," Knowledge Acquisition, 1(2), 1989, pp215-233. [5, 29]

Knauf, R., Validating Rule-Based Systems, A Complete Methodology, Shaker Verlag, Aachen, Germany, 2000. [30]

Knauf, R., Abel, T., Jantke, K.P. & Gonzalez, A.J., "A Framework for Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the Int. Workshop on Aspects of Intelligent Systems Validation, Ilmenau, Germany, January 1998, pp1-19. [30]

Knauf, R., Gonzalez, A.J. & Abel, T., "A Framework for Validation of Rule Based Systems," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, 32(3), June 2002, pp281-295. [30]

Maybury, M.T., "Evaluation Spaces: A Framework for Evaluating Natural Language Generation Systems," Proc. of the AAAI-90 Workshop on Evaluating Natural Language Generation Systems, Boston, MA, July 1990, np. [29]

Meseguer, P., "Towards a Conceptual Framework for Expert System Validation," AI Communications Jour., 5(3), 1992, pp119-135. [5, 6, 26, 29]

Preece, A.D., "Towards a Quality Assessment Framework for Knowledge-Based Systems," Jour. of Systems and Software, 29(3), June 1995, pp219-234. [9]

Preece, A.D., Shinghal, R. & Batarekh, A., "Verifying Expert Systems: A Logical Framework and a Practical Tool," Expert Systems with Applications, 5(2/3), 1992, pp421-436. [5, 6, 9, 29]

Zlatareva, N. & Preece, A., "An Effective Logical Framework for Knowledge-Based Systems Verification," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems: Research and Applications, 7(3), 1994, pp239-260. [9]

Zlatareva, N., "VVR: A Uniform Framework for Expert System Knowledge Bases Verification, Validation and Refinement," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-91 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, Anaheim, CA, July 1991, np. [4]

THEORY

Jantke, K.P., "Relating Validation Expertise to Domain Expertise," Proc. of the Int. Workshop on Future Trends in Intelligent System Validation, Sapporo, Japan, September 1998, pp64-68. [30]

Meseguer, P. & Verdaguer, A., "Verification of Multi-Level Rule-Based Expert Systems: Theory and Practice," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 6(2), 1993, pp163-192. [2, 16, 20, 26, 29]

O'Leary, D.E., "Artifacts: Toward a Theory of Verification and Validation," Int. Jour. of Intelligent Systems, 9(9), 1994, pp 853-866. [16, 23]

Treur, J. & Willems, M., "A Logical Foundation For Verification," Proc. of the 11th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-94), A.G. Cohn, ed., Amsterdam, The Netherlands, August 1994, pp745-749. [5]

SPECIFICATION

Antoniou, G. & MacNish, C.K., "Some Specification Techniques for Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases - Preliminary Report," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-96 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems and Subsystems, Portland, ME, August 1996, pp116-121. [21]

Antoniou, G. & MacNish, C.K., "Specification Morphisms for Nonmonotonic Knowledge Systems," Proc. of the 10th Australian Joint Conference on Artificial Intelligence, LNAI 1342, Springer-Verlag, 1997, pp246-254. [21]

Batarekh, A., Preece, A., Bennett, A. & Grogono, P., "Specifying an Expert System," Expert Systems with Applications, 2(3), 1991, pp285-303. [6, 16, 29]

Baughman, D., Gamble, R. & Murphy, A., "Using Formal Specification to Design Verifiable Expert Systems from Specifications," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-94 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, R.T. Plant, ed., Seattle, WA, July/August 1994, np. [5]

Gamble, R.F., Roman, G.-C. & Ball, W.E., On Extending the Application of Formal Specification and Verification Methods to Rule-Based Programming, Technical Report WUCS-91-1, Department of Computer Science, Washington University, St. Louis, MO, 1991. [5]

Gamble, R.F., Roman, G.-C., Ball, W.E. et al., "The Application of Formal Specification and Verification to Rule-Based Programs," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems - Research and Applications, 7(3), 1994, pp303-38. [29]

Grogono, P., Preece, A., Shinghal, R. & Suen, C., "Building Expert Systems: From Specification to Evaluation," Proc. of the 2nd World Congress on Expert Systems (WCES-94), Lisbon, Portugal, January 1994, np. [9]

Krause, P., Fox, J., O'Neil, M. & Glowinsky, A., "Can We Formally Specify a Medical Decision Support System?" IEEE Expert, 8(3), June 1993, pp56-61. [20]

Meseguer, P. & Preece, A., "Assessing the Role of Formal Specifications in Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc of the 3rd IFIP Int. Conf. on Achieving Quality in Software (AQuIS'96), Chapman and Hall, 1996, pp317-328. [9]

Meseguer, P. & Preece, A., "Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems with Formal Specifications," Knowledge Engineering Review, 10(4), 1995, pp331-343. [9]

Preece, A., "Specification of Expert Systems," Encyclopedia of Microcomputers, A. Kent and J.G. Williams, eds., Vol. 16, 1995, pp301-322. [9]

Preece, A., "Specifications and Tools for Building Reliable Expert Systems," Int. Jour. of Software Engineering and Knowledge Engineering, 3(1), 1993, pp17-52. [9]

Preece, A.D., "On the Role of Formal Specifications in Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the Workshop on Modelling Languages for Knowledge-Based Systems, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, January 1995, np. [5]

Rousset, M.-C., "Knowledge Formal Specifications for Formal Verification: A Proposal Based on the Integration Of Different Logical Formalisms," Proc. of the 11th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-94), A.G. Cohn, ed., Amsterdam, The Netherlands, August 1994, pp739-743. [5]

Slagle, J.R., Gardiner, D.A. & Han, K., "Knowledge Specification of an Expert System," IEEE Expert, 5(5), August 1990, pp29-38. [6, 29]

Vermesan, A. & Meldhal, S., "An Algebraic Approach to Refinement of Knowledge-Based System Specification," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

CONCEPTUAL MODELS

Buratto, F. & Chabaud, C., "Les Representations en Jeu dans les Activites de Conception et de Validation des Systemes a Base de Conaissance," Actes des 2[cme] Journees Validation des Systemes a Base de Connaissances (JVAL-93), Saint Raphael, France, 1993, np. [5]

Canamero, D. & Geldof, S., "Modelisation et Validation dans COMMET: une Integration des Deux Approches," Actes des 4[es] Journees Acquisition des Connaissances, Saint Raphael, France, 1993, np. [5]

Canamero, D., Geldof, S. & McIntyre, A., "Coupling, Modeling and Validation in COMMET," Proc. of the 2nd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-93), J. Cardenosa & P. Meseguer, eds., Palma de Mallorca, Spain, March 1993, np. [5, 29]

Carson, E.R. & Flood, R.L., "Model Validation: Philosophy, Methodology and Examples," Trans. on Instrumentation and Measurement for Control, 12, 1990, pp178-185. [20]

Forsyth, G.F., Larkin, M.D. & Wallace, G.A., "Verification of Heuristic Diagnostic Knowledge by Comparison with a Causal/Qualitative Model," Proc. of the 3rd Int. Conf.

on Industrial and Engineering Applications of Artificial Intelligence and Expert Systems (IEA/AIE-90), Charleston, SC, July 1990, pp751. [20]

Larsen, H.L. & Nonfjall, H., "Modeling in the Design of a Knowledge-Based System Validation System," Int. Jour. of Intelligent Systems, 6(3), June 1991, pp759-775. [5, 20, 26, 28, 29]

Preece, A.D., "Verifying and Testing Expert System Conceptual Models," Proc. of the 1992 IEEE Int. Conf. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, IEEE Press, New York, NY, 1992, pp922-927. [9]

Preece, A.D., "Verifying Expert Systems Using Conceptual Models," Proc. of the 5th Annual Knowledge-Based Software Assistant (KBSA) Conf., Rome Air Development Center, Griffiss AFB, NY, 1990, pp280-289. [5]

Richards, D. & Compton, P., "Finding Conceptual Models to Assist Validation," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp53-62. [8]

Vanthienen, J., Aerts, A. & Mues, C., "An Illustration of Verification and Validation in the Modeling Phase of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc of the 3rd World Congress on Expert Systems (WCES-96), Seoul, South Korea, February 1996, pp1024-1031. [18]

Vanthienen, J., Aerts, A., Mues, C. & Wets, G., "A Modelling Approach to Knowledge-Based Systems Verification," Proc. of the 11th IEEE Conf. on Artificial Intelligence for Applications (CAIA-95), Verification and Validation Workshop, Los Angeles, February 1995, np. [18]

Vanthienen, J., Mues, C. & Aerts, A., "An Illustration of Verification and Validation in the Modelling Phase of Knowledge-Based System Development," Data and Knowledge Engineering, 27(3), August 1998, pp337-352. [18]

Vignollet, L. & Ayel, M., "A Conceptual Model for Building Sets of Test Samples for Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the 9th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-90), L.C. Aiello, ed., Stockholm, Sweden, August 1990, pp667-675. [6, 17, 29]

Wielinga, B.J., Akkermans, H. & Schreiber, G., "Validation and Verification of Knowledge Models," Proc. of the 2nd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-93), J. Cardenosa & P. Meseguer, eds., Palma de Mallorca, Spain, March 1993, np. [5, 29]

HUMAN EXPERTS

Brender, J. & McNair, P., "Watch the System: An Opinion on User Validation of Computer Based Decision Support Systems in Clinical Medicine," Proc. of the 5th World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-89), B. Barber, C. Dexian, Q. Dulie & G. Wagner, eds., Elsevier North Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1989, pp275-279. [20]

Catanzarite, V., Greenburg, G. & Bremermann, H., "Computer Consultation in Neurology: Subjective and Objective Evaluations of "NEUROLOGIST" System," Computer Programs in Biomedicine, 12, 1982, pp343-55. [29]

de Dombal, F., Leaper, D., Horrocks, J. et al., "Human and Computer-Aided Diagnosis of Abdominal Pain: Further Report with Emphasis on Performance of Clinicians," British Medical Jour., 1, 1974, pp376-80. [29]

de Dombal, F., Leaper, D., Horrocks, J. et al., "Human and Computer-Aided Diagnosis of Lower Gastro-Intestinal Disorders in 468 Patients," British Jour. of Surgery, 60, 1973, p915. [29]

Dowie, J., "The Evaluation of Decision Aids: The Role of the Decision Owner," Medical Informatics, 15(3), July-September 1990, pp219-228. [20]

Elstein, A. et al., "Comparison of Physicians' Decisions Regarding Estrogen Replacement Therapy for Menopausal Women and Decisions Derived from a Decision Analytic Model," American Jour. of Medicine, 80, 1986, pp246-58. [29]

François, P., Robert, C., Astruc, J., Begeu, P., Borderon, J-C., Floret, D., Lagardere, B., Mallet, E., Pautard, J-C. & Demongeot, J., "Comparative Study of Human Expertise and a Expert System: Application to the Diagnosis of Child's Meningitis," Computers and Biomedical Research, 26, 1993, pp383-392. [20]

Giuse, N., Giuse, D., Miller, R. et al., "Evaluating Consensus among Physicians in Medical Knowledge Base Construction," Methods of Information in Medicine, 32, 1993, pp137-145. [29]

Greenwood, S. & Nealon, J.L., "A Comparative Evaluation of Knowledge Elicitation Techniques for Expert Systems," Moving Towards Expert Systems Globally in the 21st Century, J. Liebowitz, ed., Cognizant Communications Corp., Elmsford, NY, 1994 , pp60-65. [29]

Hoffman, R.R., Shadbolt, N.R., Burton, A.M. et al., "Eliciting Knowledge from Experts: A Methodological Analysis," Organizational Behavior & Human Decision Processes, 62(2), 1995, pp129-158. [29]

Khan, M.C., Steib, S.A., Dunagan, W.C. et al., "Monitoring Expert System Performance Using Continuous User Feedback," JAMIA, 3(3), 1996, pp216-23. [29]

Knauf, R., Jantke, K.P., Gonzalez, A.J. & Philippow, I., "Fundamental Considerations of Competence Assessment for Validation," Proc. of 11th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Sanibel Island, FL, May 1998, pp457-461. [30]

Levi, K., "Expert Systems Should Be More Accurate than Human Experts: Evaluation Procedures from Human Judgement and Decision Making," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, 19(3), May/June 1989, pp647-657. [20, 29]

O'Leary, D.E., "Determining Differences in Expert Judgment: Implications for Knowledge Acquisition and Validation," Decision Sciences, 24(2), March/April 1993, pp395-407. [16, 23]

O'Leary, D.E., "Soliciting Weights or Probabilities from Experts for Rule Based Expert Systems," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 30, 1990, pp293-301. [16]

Parsaye, K. & Chignell, M., "Expert Systems for Experts," <u>Measuring Expert System Performance</u>, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1988, pp365-374. [20]

Rees, P.L., "User Evaluation of Expert Systems," <u>Industrial Management and Data Systems</u>, 92(6), 1992, pp17-23. [20, 29]

Veit, C.T. & Callero, M., <u>Criteria for Validating Human Judgments and Developing Behavioral Representation Models</u>, The Rand Corporation, Santa Monica, CA, 1993.

Waxman, H. & Worley, W., "Computer-Assisted Adult Medical Diagnosis: Subject Review and Evaluation of a New Microcomputer-Based System," <u>Medicine</u>, 69, 1990, pp125-136. [29]

White, R., Hong, R., Venook, A. et al., "Initiation of Warfarin Therapy: Comparison of Physician Dosing with Computer-Assisted Dosing," <u>Jour. of General Internal Medicine</u>, 2, 1987, pp141-148. [29]

Willems, J., Abreu-Lima, C. & Arnaud, P., "Evaluation of ECG Interpretation Results Obtained by Computer and Cardiologists," <u>Methods of Information in Medicine</u>, 29, 1990, pp308-316. [29]

Yu, V.L., Fagan, L.M., Wraith, S.M., Clancey, W.J., Scott, A.C., Hannagan, J.F., Blum, R.L. & Cohen, S.N., "Antimicrobial Selection by a Computer: A Blinded Evaluation by Infectious Disease Experts," <u>Jour. of the American Medical Association</u>, 242(12), 1979, pp1279-1282. [19, 29]

DESIGN

Andert, E.P., "Integrated Knowledge-Based System Design and Validation for Solving Problems in Uncertain Environments," <u>Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies</u>, 36(2), 1992, pp357-373. [7, 16, 27]

Baughman, D., Gamble, R. & Murphy, A., "Using Formal Specification to Design Verifiable Expert Systems from Specifications," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-94 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, R.T. Plant, ed., Seattle, WA, July/August 1994, np. [5]

Chen, G., Vanthienen, J. & Wets, G., "Using Fuzzy Decision Tables to Build Valid Intelligent Systems," <u>Proc. of the 6th Int. Fuzzy Systems Association World Congress (IFSA-95)</u>, Sao Paulo, Brazil, July 1995, np. [18]

Larsen, H.L. & Nonfjall, H., "Modeling in the Design of a Knowledge-Based System Validation System," <u>Int. Jour. of Intelligent Systems</u>, 6(3), June 1991, pp759-775. [5, 20, 26, 28, 29]

O'Leary, D.E., "The Relationship between Errors and Size and between Different Types of Errors in Expert Systems," <u>Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies</u>, February 1996, pp171-185. [23]

Preece, A.D., <u>Comparative Approaches to Building Expert Systems for Health Care</u>, PhD Thesis, University College, Swansea, Wales, 1989. [3, 20, 25]

Rossi-Mori, A. & Ricci, F.L., "Comprehensive Criteria for Evaluation and Design of Knowledge Based Systems in Medicine," System Engineering in Medicine, J. Talmon & J. Fox, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1990, np. [20]

Rossi-Mori, A., Pisanelli, D.M. & Ricci, F.L., "Evaluation Stages and Design Steps for Knowledge-Base Systems in Medicine," Medical Informatics, 15(3), July-September 1990, pp191-204. [20, 29]

Valluy, L., Nykänen, P., Rantanen, J., Salmela, J., Gränroos, P. & Lumio, J., "An Approach to Combine Knowledge Validation and Evaluation with Development in Medical AI," Proc of the Scandinavian Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (SCAI-89), Tampere, Finland, 1989, pp865-875. [3, 20, 25]

TESTING

General

Antoniou, G. & Jack, O., "Testing Production System Programs," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, np. [21]

Antoniou, G. & Jack, O., "Testing Production System Programs," Proc. of the 9th IEEE Int. Symp. on Software Reliability Engineering, IEEE Press, 1998, np. [21]

Ayel, M. & Vignollet, L., "Le Test des Systèmes à Base de Connaissances," Le Gènie Logiciel et Ses Applications, 18, March 1990, pp72-73. [17]

Childress, R., "Knowledge-Based Systems: Verification, Validation, and Testing," IEEE Expert, 7, February 1992, pp73-75. [19, 27]

Constantine, M. & Ulvila, J., "Testing Knowledge-Based Systems: The State of the Practice and Suggestions for Improvement," Expert Systems with Applications, 1(3), 1990, pp237-48. [29]

Laurent, J.-P., Ayel, M. & Vignollet, L., "Knowledge-Based Systems Testing," Proc. of the 6th IASTED Int. Conf., USA, August 1990, np. [17]

Testing Issues

Ayel, M.C. & Stalker, R.A., "Mutants in the Knowledge-Based System Testing Process," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, pp7-18. [5, 17]

Bailey, J.J., Horton, M. & Itscoitz, S.B., "The Importance of Reproducibility Testing of Computer Programs for Electrocardiographic Interpretation: Application to the Automatic Vectorcardiographic Analysis Program (AVA 3.4)," Computers and Biomedical Research, 9, 1976, pp307-316. [20]

Bellman, K.L. & Landauer, C., "The Modelling Issues Inherent in Testing and Evaluating Knowledge-Based Systems," Expert Systems with Applications, 1(3), 1990, pp199-216. [4, 6, 29]

Marcot, B., "Testing Your Knowledge Base," <u>AI Expert</u>, 2(8), July 1987, pp42-47. [5, 29]

Steven, E., Hoenen, M. & Kloth, M., "Testability of Expert Systems in System Development and Application," <u>Artificial Intelligence and Society</u>, 6, 1992, pp337-344. [20]

Test Case Generation

Abel, T., Knauf, R. & Gonzalez, A.J., "Generation of a Minimal Set of Test Cases that is Functionally Equivalent to an Exhaustive Set, for Use in Knowledge-Based System Validation," <u>Proc. of the 9th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp.</u>, Key West, FL, May 1996, pp280-284. [30]

Abel, T. & Gonzalez, A.J., "Utilizing Criteria to Reduce a Set of Test Cases for Expert System Validation," <u>Proc. of the 10th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp.</u>, Daytona Beach, FL, May 1997, pp402-406. [7]

Auzins, A., Barzdins, J., Bicevskis, J., Cerans, K. & Kalninf, A., "Automatic Construction of Test Sets: Theoretical Approach," <u>Baltic Computer Science</u>, Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence, Vol. 502, J. Barzdins & J. Bjorner, eds, Springer-Verlag, Heidelberg, Germany, 1991, pp286-359. [30]

Ayel, M. & Vignollet, L., "Automatic Building of Test-Samples," <u>Proc. of the IJCAI-89 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, Detroit, MI, August 1989, np. [17]

Ayel, M. & Vignollet, L., "SYCOJET: A Tool for Building Automatically Sets of Test of Knowledge Bases," <u>Proc. of the 8th SPIE/IEEE Conf. on the Applications of Artificial Intelligence</u>, Orlando, FL, April 1990, np. [17]

Bendou, A., "CT-DATAGEN: A Constraint-Based Test Data Generator," <u>Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95)</u>, Chambery, France, June 1995, pp19-29. [5]

Chen, H.Y., "On Effectiveness of Equivalent Fundamental Pairs as Test Cases for Object Oriented Software," <u>Proc. of the 1999 IEEE Int. Conf. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics</u>, Tokyo, Japan, October 1999, pp1933-1937. [30]

Gonzalez, A.J., Gupta, U. & Chianese, R.B., "Performance Evaluation of a Large Diagnostic Expert System Using a Heuristic Test Case Generator," <u>Engineering Applications of Artificial Intelligence</u>, 9(3), 1996, pp275-284. [7]

Guerin, F. & Dumon, B., "Reduction of the Number of Tests by Coupling Together the Sequential and the Bayesian Method," <u>Proc. of the 1999 IEEE Int. Conf. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics</u>, Tokyo, Japan, October 1999, pp1954-1958. [30]

Gupta, U.C. & Biegel, J., "RITCaG: A Rule-Based Intelligent Test Case Generator," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-90 Workshop on Verification, Validation and Testing of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, Boston, MA, July 1990, np. [4, 16, 19]

Laurent, J.-P. & Vignollet, L., "Aspects Statiques et Dynamiques des Generateurs de Cas de Test," <u>Actes des 3eme Journees Validation des Systemes a Base de Connaissances (JVAL-94)</u>, Strasbourg, France, March 1994, np. [5]

Laurent, J.-P. & Vignollet, L., "Static and/or Dynamic Test Case Generators," <u>Proc. of the 2nd World Congress on Expert Systems (WCES-94)</u>, Lisbon, Portugal, January 1994, np. [5]

Michels, J-E., Abel, T., Knauf, R. & Gonzalez, A.J., "Investigating the Validity of a Test Case Selection Methodology for Expert System Validation," <u>Proc. of 11th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp.</u>, Sanibel Island, FL, May 1998, pp462-466. [30]

Vignollet, L. & Ayel, M., "Construction de Jeux de Tests pour les Bases de Connaissances," <u>Proc. of the 9th Int. Conf. on Expert Systems and Their Applications</u>, Avignon, France, 1989, pp247-257. [17]

Vignollet, L. & Ayel, M., "A Conceptual Model for Building Sets of Test Samples for Knowledge Bases," <u>Proc. of the 9th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-90)</u>, L.C. Aiello, ed., Stockholm, Sweden, August 1990, pp667-675. [6, 17, 29]

Vignollet, L. & Lelouche, R., "Test Case Generation Using Knowledge-Based System Strategy," <u>Proc. of the 13th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-93)</u>, R. Bajcsy, ed., Chambery, France, August/September 1993, pp483-488. [5]

Zlatareva, N., "Distributed Verification and Automated Generation of Test Cases," <u>Proc. of the IJCAI-93 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Expert Systems</u>, Chambery, France, August/September 1993, np. [5]

Testing Approaches

Ayel, M. & Vignollet, L., "A Specific Knowledge for Testing Knowledge Bases," <u>Proc. of the 2nd Int. Conf. on Software Engineering and Knowledge Engineering (SEKE-90)</u>, Skokie, IL, June 1990, np. [17]

Ayel, M.C. & Vignollet, L., "A Common Approach for Verifying and Testing Knowledge-Based Systems," <u>Artificial Intelligence and Software Engineering</u>, J.J.P. Tsai, T. Weigert, & H.-C. Jang, eds., World Scientific Publishing Co., 1993, np. [5, 17]

Barr, V., "Rule-Based Coverage Measures Applied to Testing Rule-Bases with Uncertainty," <u>Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [4]

Coward, P.D., "Symbolic Execution and Testing," <u>Information and Software Technology</u>, 33(1), 1991, pp53-64. [20]

de Raedt, L., Sablon, G. & Bruynooghe, M., "Using Interactive Concept Learning for Knowledge Base Validation and Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based-Systems," <u>Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, M. Ayel & J.-P. Laurant, eds, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1991, pp177-190. [4]

Lancaster, F.W., Ulvila, J.W., Humphrey, S.M. et al., "Evaluation of Interactive Knowledge-Based Systems: Overview and Design for Empirical Testing," <u>Jour. of the American Society for Information Science</u>, 47(1), 1996, pp57-69. [29]

Llinas, J. & Rizzi, S., <u>The Test and Evaluation Process for Knowledge Based Systems</u>, Technical Report Prepared under Contract F30602-85-C-0313, Task 86-001-01, Calspan Corporation, June 1987. [20]

Long, J.A. & Neale, I.M., "Validating and Testing in Knowledge-Based Systems - A Case Study," <u>Proc. 2nd Int. Conf. on Industrial and Engineering Applications of Artificial Intelligence and Expert Systems (IEA/AIE-89)</u>, Tullahoma, TN, June 1989, pp875-880. [5]

Martin-Mattei, C., "Validation, Verification and Testing: Procedures in the Life Cycle of Knowledge-Based Systems," <u>Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-91)</u>, M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, np. [5]

Miller, L.A., "Dynamic Testing of Knowledge Bases Using the Heuristic Testing Approach," <u>Expert Systems with Applications</u>, 1(3), 1990, pp249-269. [6, 29]

Pazzani, M.J., "A Set Covering Approach to Testing Rule-Based Expert Systems," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-90 Workshop on Verification, Validation and Testing of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, Boston, MA, July 1990, np. [4]

Shultz, A.C., "Test and Evaluation by Genetic Algorithms," <u>IEEE Expert</u>, 8, 1993, pp9-14. [29]

Titt, E., "Testing Algorithms and Programs of Multivariate Statistical Procedures - Necessary Assumption of Building Expert Systems," <u>Int. Jour. of Pattern Recognition and Artificial Intelligence</u>, 3(1), 1989, pp121-133. [29]

Zualkernan, I., Tsai, W.T. & Kirani, S., "Testing Expert Systems Using Conventional Techniques," <u>Proc. of the 16th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-92)</u>, Washington, DC, November 1992, pp320-325. [29]

Zualkernan, I., Tsai, W.T. & Kirani, S., "Testing Expert Systems Using Conventional Techniques," <u>Proc. of the 16th Annual Computer Software and Applications Conf. (COMPSAC-92)</u>, 1992, pp320-325. [6]

TERMINOLOGY & STANDARDS

Standards

Beach, S.S. & Gevarter, W., "Standards for Evaluating Expert Systems Tools," <u>Expert Systems with Applications</u>, 2, 1991, pp259-267. [20]

Hamilton, D., Kelley, K. & Culbert, C., "Knowledge-Based System Verification and Validation: State-of-the-Practice and Implications for Verification and Validation Standards," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-91 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, Anaheim, CA, July 1991, np. [5]

Harrison, P.R. & Ratcliffe, P.A., "Towards Standards for the Validation of Expert Systems," <u>Expert Systems with Applications</u>, 2, 1991, pp251-258. [19]

van Bemmel, J.H. & Willems, J.L., "Standardization and Validation of Medical Decision-Support Systems: The CSE Project," Methods of Information in Medicine, 29, 1990, pp261-262. [20]

Terminology

Barr, V., "A Quagmire of Terminology: Verification & Validation, Testing, and Evaluation," Proc. of the 14th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp, Key West, FL, May 2001, pp625-629. [30]

Gonzalez, A.J. & Barr, V., "Validation and Verification of Intelligent Systems – What are They and how They are Different?" Jour. of Experimental & Theoretical Artificial Intelligence, 12(4), 2000, pp407-420. [30]

Hoppe, T. & Meseguer, P., "On the Terminology of Verification, Validation and Testing," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, np. [5, 26, 28, 29]

Hoppe, T. & Meseguer, P., "Verification, Validation and Testing Terminology: A Proposal," IEEE Expert, 8(3), June 1993, pp48-55. [6, 20, 29]

Laurent, J.-P., "Proposals for a Valid Terminology in Knowledge-Based System Validation," Proc. of the 10th European Conf on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-92), B. Neumann, ed., Vienna, Austria, August 1992, pp829-834. [5, 6, 29]

Laurent, J.-P., "Vers une Terminologie Valide dans le Domaine de la Validation, "Actes des 1^{ier} Journees Validation des Systemes a Base de Connaissances (JVAL-92), Dourdan, France, April 1992, np. [5]

Laurent, J.-P., First Entries for the VIVA Glossary, TN-610, November 1992. [5]

PERFORMANCE EVALUATION

Adlassnig, K.-P. & Scheithauer, W., "Performance Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems Using ROC Curves," Computers and Biomedical Research, 22, 1989, pp297-313. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Alonso-Betanzos, A., Devoe, L., Castillo, R., Moret-Bonillo, V., Hernández-Sande, C. & Searle, N., "FOETOS in Clinical Practice: A Retrospective Analysis of its Performance," Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 1, 1989, pp93-99. [20]

Barbaliscia, F., Masullo, P.G. & Fornari, M., "Software Package for the Performance Evaluation of Satellite Communications Systems with Adaptive Allocation of On-Board Common Source," IEEE Trans. on Communications, 40(6), 1992, p1003. [29]

Berner, E., Webster, G., Shugerman, A. et al., "Performance of Four Computer-Based Diagnostic Systems," New England Jour. of Medicine, 330(25), 1994, pp1792-1796. [29]

Camma, C., Garofalo, G. & Almasio, P., "A Performance Evaluation of the Expert System 'JAUNDICE' in Comparison with That of Three Hepatologists," Jour. of Hepatology, 13, 1991, pp279-85. [29]

Chander, P.G., Shinghal, R. & Radhakrishnan, T., "Performance Assessment and Incremental Evaluation of Rule-Based Systems," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp40-46. [8]

Chinchor, N., Hirschman, L. & Lewis, D.D., "Evaluating Message Understanding Systems: An Analysis of the Third Message Understanding Conference (MUC-3)," Computational Linguistics, 19(3), 1993, pp410-49. [29]

Gaschnig, J., "Preliminary Performance Analysis of the PROSPECTOR Consultant System for Mineral Exploration," Proc. of the 6th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence, Morgan Kaufmann, San Mateo, CA, 1979, pp308-310. [19]

Georgakis, D., Trace, D., Naeymi-Rad, F. et al., "A Statistical Evaluation of the Diagnostic Performance of MEDAS - The Medical Emergency Decision Assistance System," Proc. of the 14th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-90), Washington, DC, November 1990, pp815-19. [29]

Gonzalez, A.J., Gupta, U. & Chianese, R.B., "Performance Evaluation of a Large Diagnostic Expert System Using a Heuristic Test Case Generator," Engineering Applications of Artificial Intelligence, 9(3), 1996, pp275-284. [7]

Guida, G. & Mauri, G., "Evaluating Performance and Quality of Knowledge-Based Systems: Foundations and Methodology," IEEE Trans. on Knowledge and Data Engineering, 5(2), April 1993, pp204-224. [20, 29]

Guida, G. & Mauri, G., "Evaluating Performance and Quality of Knowledge-Based Systems: Foundations and Methodology," IEEE Trans. on Knowledge and Data Engineering, 5(2), April 1993, pp204-224. [20, 29]

Habbema, J., Hilden, J. & Bjerregaard, B., "The Measurement of Performance in Probabilistic Diagnosis," Methods of Information in Medicine, 20(2), 1981, pp97-100. [29]

Indurkhya, N. & Weiss, S.M., "Models for Measuring Performance of Medical Expert Systems," Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 1, 1989, pp61-70. [20, 29]

Kahn, M.G., Bailey, T.E., Steib, S.A. et al., "Statistical Process Control Methods for Expert System Performance Monitoring," JAMIA, 3(4), 1996, pp258-269. [29]

Khan, M.C., Steib, S.A., Dunagan, W.C. et al., "Monitoring Expert System Performance Using Continuous User Feedback," JAMIA, 3(3), 1996, pp216-23. [29]

Kononenko, I. & Bratco, I., "Information-Based Evaluation Criterion for Classifiers' Performance," Machine Learning, 6(1), 1991, pp67-80. [29]

Lau, L. & Warner, H., "Performance of a Diagnostic System (ILIAD) as a Tool for Quality Assurance," Computers and Biomedical Research, 25, 1992, pp314-23. [29]

Lehnert, W. & Sundheim, B., "A Performance Evaluation of Text-Analysis Technologies," AI Magazine, 12, 1991, pp81-94. [29]

Meseguer, P., "Structural and Performance Metrics for Rule-Based Expert Systems," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, np. [5]

Middleton, B., Shwe, M. & Heckerman, D., "Probabilistic Diagnosis Using a Reformulation of the INTERNIST-1/QMR Knowledge Base. II: Evaluation of Diagnostic Performance," Methods of Information in Medicine, 30, 1991, pp256-267. [29]

O'Keefe, R.M., Balci, O. & Smith, E.P., "Validating Expert System Performance," IEEE Expert, 2(4), Winter 1987, pp81-90. [5, 6, 16, 20, 29]

Quaglini, S., Stefanelli, M., Barosi, G. & Berzuini, A., "A Performance Evaluation of the Expert System ANEMIA," Computers and Biomedical Research, 21(4), 1988, pp307-323. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Quaglini, S., Stefanelli, M., Barosi, G. & Berzuini, A., "Evaluating the Performance of ANEMIA," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (AIME-87), J. Fox, M. Fieschi & R. Engelbrecht, eds., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1987, pp229-238. [3, 20, 25]

Reggia, J.A. & Tuhrim, R.S., "Performance Assessment," Computer-Assisted Medical Decision Making, J.A. Reggia & R.S. Tuhrim, eds., Springer-Verlag, New York, NY, 1985, pp32-34. [20]

Reggia, J.A., "Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems: A Case Study in Performance Assessment," Proc. of the 9th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-85), Baltimore, MD, 1985, pp287-291. [6, 20, 29]

Reggia, J.R., "Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems: Case Study in Performance Assessment," Selected Topics in Medical Artificial Intelligence, P.L. Miller, ed., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1988, pp222-230. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Schewe, S., Scherrmann, W. & Gierl, L., "Evaluation and Measurement of Benefit of an Expert System for Differential Diagnosis in Rheumatology," Expert Systems and Decision Support in Medicine, Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics, 36, O. Rienhoff, V. Piccolo & B. Schneider, Springer-Verlag, 1988, pp352-354. [20, 25]

Sharma, R.S. & Conrath, D.W., "Soft Measures for Performance Analysis: The Core Dimensions of Expert System Quality," Microelectronics and Reliability, 36(6), 1996, pp775-796. [29]

Stachowitz, R., Chang, C. & Combs, J., Performance Evaluation of Knowledge-Based Systems, Technical Report A-58, Lockheed Software Technology Center, Austin, TX, 1987. [16]

Straatman, R. & Beys, P., "A Performance Model for Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

Suen, C.Y., Grogono, P.D., Shinghal, R. & Coallier, F., "Verifying, Validating and Measuring the Performance of Expert Systems," Expert Systems with Applications, 1(2), June 1990, pp93-102. [5, 20, 29]

Tao, Y., Zhijun, H. & Ruizhao, Y., "Performance Evaluation of the Inference Structure in Expert System," Proc. of the 10th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-87), August 1987, pp945-950. [6, 29]

Valdiguie, P.M., Rogari, E., Corberand, J.X. et al., "The Performance of the Knowledge-Based System VALAB Revisited: An Evaluation after Five Years," European Jour. of Clinical Chemistry & Clinical Biochemistry, 34(4), 1996, pp371-376. [29]

Vinze, A.S., Vogel, D. & Nunamaker, J., "Performance Evaluation of a Knowledge-Based System: A Validation Study," Information and Management, 21, 1991, pp225-235. [20, 29]

Weber, J., Bartels, P., Griswold, W. et al., "Colonic Lesion Expert System: Performance Evaluation," Analytical and Quantitative Cytology and Histology, 10, 1988, pp150-159. [29]

Wehrens, R., Buydens, L. & Kateman, G., "Performance Validation and Optimization of Expert Systems in Analytical Chemistry," Proc. of the 11th Int. Conf. on Expert Systems and Their Applications, Avignon, France, May 1991, pp279. [20]

Willems, J., Abreu-Lima, C. & Arnaud, P., "The Diagnostic Performance of Computer Programs for the Interpretation of Electrocardiograms," New England Jour. of Medicine, 325, 1991, pp1767-1773. [29]

Yu, V.L., Buchanan, B.G., Shortliffe, E.H., Davis, R., Scott, A.C. & Cohen, N., "Evaluating the Performance of a Computer-Based Consultant," Computer Programs in Biomedicine, 9, 1979, pp 95-102. [16, 20, 29]

Zlatareva, N.P., "Improving Knowledge-Based System Performance by Reordering Rule Sequences," Proc. of the 14th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Key West, FL, May 2001, pp655-659. [30]

EXPERIENCE

Experience with Specific Tools & Techniques

Cardevosa, J. & Juisto, N., "General Overview of the VALID Project," Proc. of the 2nd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-93), J. Cardenosa & P. Meseguer, eds., Palma de Mallorca, Spain, March 1993, pp53-67. [4]

Chang, C.L., Combs, J.B. & Stachowitz, R.A., "A Report on the Expert Systems Validation Associate (EVA)," Expert Systems with Applications, 1(3), 1990, pp217-230. [5, 6, 26, 29]

de Dombal, F.T. & Horrocks, J.C., "Use of Receiver Operating Characteristics (ROC) Curves to Evaluate Computer Confidence Threshold and Clinical Performance in the

Diagnosis of Appendicitis," Methods of Information in Medicine, 17, 1978, pp157-161. [20, 29]

ESPRIT II, Validation Methods and Tools for Knowledge-Based Systems: State of the Art, Deliverable D1, CEAB/D/1.1, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, 1989. [26, 28]

ESPRIT II, General Formal Model, Deliverable D2, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, 1989. [28]

ESPRIT II, Tools Identification Report, Deliverable D3, COG/D/3.2, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, December 1989. [28]

ESPRIT II, VALID: VETA Definition, Report Deliverable D4, CEAB/D/1.1, ESPRIT II Project 2148, 1990. [5, 26, 28]

ESPRIT II, Validation Methods and Tools for Knowledge-Based Systems: Tools Description Report, Deliverable D5, CEAB/D/3.1, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, July 1990. [5, 26, 28]

ESPRIT II, VETA Implementation, Deliverable D6, CEAB/D/4, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, February 1991. [26, 28]

ESPRIT II, Knowledge-Based System Interfacing, Deliverable D7, CRI/D/3.1, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, February 1990. [28]

ESPRIT II, Quality Manual, Deliverable D8, COG/D/5.1, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, Cognitech, December 1991. [26]

ESPRIT II, Report on Validation Tools Evaluation, Deliverable D9, COG/D/3.2, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, Cognitech, 1991. [26]

ESPRIT II, The VALID Environment, Deliverable D10, CRI/D/4.3, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, 1991. [26]

ESPRIT II, Final Report: Knowledge-Based System Validation, Deliverable D12, COG/D/4.2, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, Cognitech, 1991. [26, 29]

Gonzalez, A.J., Gupta, U. & Chianese, R.B., "Performance Evaluation of a Large Diagnostic Expert System Using a Heuristic Test Case Generator," Engineering Applications of Artificial Intelligence, 9(3), 1996, pp275-284. [7]

Guyot, J., Vaudet, J.P., Petitjean, S., Brunessaux, L. & Mariot, P., "Vers une Caractérisation des Outils de Validation des Systèmes à Base de Connaissances, Application à Deux Outils," Proc. of the 11th Int. Conf. on Expert Systems and Their Applications, Avignon, France, May 1991, np. [26, 28]

Khan, M.C., Steib, S.A., Dunagan, W.C. et al., "Monitoring Expert System Performance Using Continuous User Feedback," JAMIA, 3(3), 1996, pp216-23. [29]

Klessens, P., Binkhuysen, F., Ottes, F. et al., "Diagnostic Evaluation of a PACS Subsystem Using Mammographs: An ROC Analysis," Medical Informatics, 13, 1988, pp323-326. [29]

Kramer, S, Kaindl, H. & Schlee, S., "Can We Benefit from Metrics in KBS Development?," Proc. of the IJCAI-97 Workshop on Validation, Verification & Refinement of AI Systems and Subsystems, Nagoya, Japan, August 1997, pp47-52. [30]

Loiseau, S. & Rousset, M.-C., "Formal Verification of Knowledge Bases Focused on Consistency: Two Experiments Based on ATMS Techniques," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 6(3), 1993, np. [5]

Perez, R.A., Hall, L.O., Romaniuk, S. & Lilkendey, J.T., "Evaluation of Machine Learning Tools Using Real Manufacturing Data," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 5(4), 1992, pp299-317. [20]

Preece, A.D. & Shinghal, R., "Verifying Knowledge Bases by Anomaly Detection: An Experience Report," Proc. of the 10th European Conf on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-92), B. Neumann, ed., Vienna, Austria, August 1992, pp835-839. [5, 6, 9, 29]

Preece, A.D., Bell, R.D. & Suen, C.Y., "Experiences in Using an Expert System Verification Tool," Proc. of 1991 Bell Canada Quality Engineering Workshop, Ottawa, Canada, 1991. [5]

Preece, A.D., Bell, R.D. & Suen, C.Y., "Verifying Knowledge Bases by Anomaly Detection: An Experience Report," Proc. of the ECAI-92 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, Vienna, Austria, August 1992, np. [5]

Preece, A.D., Grossner, C., Chander, P.G. & Radhakrishnan, T., "Structural Validation of Expert Systems: Experience Using a Formal Model," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-93 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Report WS-93-05, A.D. Preece, ed., Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp19-26. [4, 5]

Comparison of Multiple Evaluations

Adelman, L., "Experiments, Quasi-Experiments, and Case Studies: A Review of Empirical Methods for Evaluating Decision Support Systems," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man and Cybernetics, 21(2), March/April 1991, pp293-301. [6, 20, 29]

Antoniou, G., van Harmelen, F., Plant, R. & Vanthienen, J., "Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems: Report on Two 1997 Events," AI Magazine, 19(3), Fall 1998, pp123-126. [18, 21]

Auramo, Y. & Juhola, M., "Comparison of Inference Results of Two Otoneurological Expert Systems," Int. Jour. of Biomedical Computing, 39(3), 1995, pp327-335. [29]

Berner, E., Webster, G., Shugerman, A. et al., "Performance of Four Computer-Based Diagnostic Systems," New England Jour. of Medicine, 330(25), 1994, pp1792-1796. [29]

Cohen, P. & Howe, A., "Toward AI Research Methodology: Three Case Studies in Evaluation," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, 19(3), May/June 1989, pp634- 46. [29]

French, S.W., Culbert, C. & Hamilton, D., "Experiences in Improving the State of Practice in Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-93 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Report WS-93-05, A.D. Preece, ed., Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp78-86. [4, 29]

Fryback, D. & Thornbury, J., "Evaluation of a Computerized Bayesian Model for Diagnosis of Renal Cyst vs. Tumor vs. Normal Variant from Urogram Information," Invest Radiol., 11, 1976, pp102-11. [29]

Gaschnig, J., Klahr, P., Pople, H., Shortliffe, E. & Terry, A., "Evaluation of Expert Systems: Issues and Case Studies," Building Expert Systems, F. Hayes-Roth, D.A. Waterman & D.B. Lenat, eds., Addison Wesley, Reading, MA, 1983, pp241-280. [3, 6, 16, 19, 20, 25, 26, 29]

Gindi, G., Darken, C., O'Brien, K. et al., "Neural Network and Conventional Classifiers for Fluorescence-Guided Laser Angioplasty," IEEE Trans. on Biomedical Engineering, 38, 1991, pp246-252. [29]

Meseguer, P. & Verdaguer, A., "Verification of Multi-Level Rule-Based Expert Systems: Theory and Practice," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 6(2), 1993, pp163-192. [2, 16, 20, 26, 29]

Prerau, D.S., Papp, W.L., Bhatnagar, R. & Weintraub, M.A., "Verification and Validation of Expert Systems: Experience with Four Diverse Systems," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems - Research and Applications, 6(2), 1993, pp251-269. [16, 20]

Ramsey, C.L. & Basili, V.R., "An Evaluation of Expert Systems for Software Engineering Management," IEEE Trans. on Software Engineering, 15(6), June 1989, p747. [29]

Rautaharju, P.M. & Smets, P.H., "Evaluation of Computer ECG Programs. The Strange Case of the Golden Standard," Computers and Biomedical Research, 12, 1979, pp39-46. [20]

Reggia, J.A., "Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems: A Case Study in Performance Assessment," Proc. of the 9th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-85), Baltimore, MD, 1985, pp287-291. [6, 20, 29]

Reggia, J.R., "Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems: Case Study in Performance Assessment," Selected Topics in Medical Artificial Intelligence, P.L. Miller, ed., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1988, pp222-230. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Willems, J., Abreu-Lima, C. & Arnaud, P., "The Diagnostic Performance of Computer Programs for the Interpretation of Electrocardiograms," New England Jour. of Medicine, 325, 1991, pp1767-1773. [29]

Wyatt, J. & Spiegelhalter, D., "Field Trials of Medical Decision-Aids: Potential Problems and Solutions," Proc. of the 15th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-91), Washington, DC, November 1991, pp3-7. [29]

Comparison with Human Expertise

Chiarelli, F., Tumini, S., Morgese, G. et al., "Controlled Study in Diabetic Children Comparing Insulin-Dosage Adjustment by Manual and Computer Algorithms," Diabetes Care, 13, 1990, pp1080-84. [29]

de Dombal, F., Leaper, D., Horrocks, J. et al., "Human and Computer-Aided Diagnosis of Lower Gastro-Intestinal Disorders in 468 Patients," British Jour. of Surgery, 60, 1973, p915. [29]

de Dombal, F., Leaper, D., Horrocks, J. et al., "Human and Computer-Aided Diagnosis of Abdominal Pain: Further Report with Emphasis on Performance of Clinicians," British Medical Jour., 1, 1974, pp376-80. [29]

Elstein, A. et al., "Comparison of Physicians' Decisions Regarding Estrogen Replacement Therapy for Menopausal Women and Decisions Derived from a Decision Analytic Model," American Jour. of Medicine, 80, 1986, pp246-58. [29]

François, P., Robert, C., Astruc, J., Begeu, P., Borderon, J-C., Floret, D., Lagardere, B., Mallet, E., Pautard, J-C. & Demongeot, J., "Comparative Study of Human Expertise and a Expert System: Application to the Diagnosis of Child's Meningitis," Computers and Biomedical Research, 26, 1993, pp383-392. [20]

Van der Lei, J., Musen, M., van der Does, E. et al., "Comparison of Computer- Aided and Human Review of General Practitioners' Management of Hypertension," Lancet, 338, 1991, pp1504-1508. [29]

White, R., Hong, R., Venook, A. et al., "Initiation of Warfarin Therapy: Comparison of Physician Dosing with Computer-Assisted Dosing," Jour. of General Internal Medicine, 2, 1987, pp141-148. [29]

Willems, J., Abreu-Lima, C. & Arnaud, P., "Evaluation of ECG Interpretation Results Obtained by Computer and Cardiologists," Methods of Information in Medicine, 29, 1990, pp308-316. [29]

Yu, V.L., Fagan, L.M., Wraith, S.M., Clancey, W.J., Scott, A.C., Hannagan, J.F., Blum, R.L. & Cohen, S.N., "Antimicrobial Selection by a Computer: A Blinded Evaluation by Infectious Disease Experts," Jour. of the American Medical Association, 242(12), 1979, pp1279-1282. [19, 29]

Experience with Specific KBSs

ALPIN

Brunessaux, L., "A Pragmatic Approach to Validation: The Industrial Experience of ALPIN," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, np. [26, 29]

ACORN

Wyatt, J., "Lessons Learned from the Field Trial of ACORN, An Expert System to Advise on Chest Pain," Proc. of the 5th World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-89), B. Barber, D. Cao, D. Qin & G. Wagner, eds., Singapore, Elsevier North Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1989, pp111-115. [20, 29]

Wyatt, J., "The Evaluation of Clinical Decision Support Systems: A Discussion of the Methodology Used in the ACORN Project," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics

(AIME-87), J. Fox, M. Fieschi & R. Engelbrecht, eds., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1987, pp15-24. [20]

AI/RHEUM

Bernelot-Moens, H.J. & van der Korst, J., "Comparison of Rheumatological Diagnoses by a Bayesian Program and by Physicians," Methods of Information in Medicine, 30, 1991, pp187-93. [29]

Bernelot-Moens, H.J. & Kingsland, L.C., "Evaluation and Further Development of AI/RHEUM with Data from 1570 Consecutive Patients of a Dutch Rheumatological Outpatient Clinic," Proc. of the 8th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-90), Stanford, CA, 1990, pp141-144. [20]

Bernelot-Moens, H.J., "Validation of the AI/RHEUM Knowledge Base with Data from Consecutive Rheumatological Outpatients," Methods of Information in Medicine, 31(3), 1992, pp175-181. [20, 29]

Kingsland, L., "The Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems: Experience with the AI/RHEUM Knowledge-Based Consultant System in Rheumatology," Computer-Assisted Medical Decision Making, J. Reggia & S. Tuhrim, eds., Springer-Verlag, New York, NY, 1985 , pp212-221. [29]

Kingsland, L.C., Sharp, G.C., Capps, R.J., Benge, J.M., Kay, D.R., Reese, G., Hazelwood, S.E. & Lindberg, D.A.B., "Testing of a Criteria-Based Consultant System in Rheumatology," Proc. of the World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-83), J. van Bemmel, M.J. Ball & O. Wigertz, eds., North Holland Publishing Co., Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1983, pp21-26. [20, 29]

Kingsland, L.C., "Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems: Experience with the AI/RHEUM Knowledge-Based Consultation System in Rheumatology," Selected Topics in Medical Artificial Intelligence, P.L. Miller, ed., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1988, pp212-221. [3, 20, 25]

Porter, J., Kingsland, L.I. & Lindberg, D., "The AI/RHEUM Knowledge-Based Computer Consultant System in Rheumatology: Performance in the Diagnosis of 59 Connective Tissue Disease Patients from Japan," Arthritis and Rheumatology, 31, 1988, pp219-226. [29]

ANEMIA

Quaglini, S., Stefanelli, M., Barosi, G. & Berzuini, A., "A Performance Evaluation of the Expert System ANEMIA," Computers and Biomedical Research, 21(4), 1988, pp307-323. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Quaglini, S., Stefanelli, M., Barosi, G. & Berzuini, A., "Evaluating the Performance of ANEMIA," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (AIME-87), J. Fox, M. Fieschi & R. Engelbrecht, eds., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1987, pp229-238. [3, 20, 25]

AVA

Bailey, J.J., Horton, M. & Itscoitz, S.B., "The Importance of Reproducibility Testing of Computer Programs for Electrocardiographic Interpretation: Application to the

Automatic Vectorcardiographic Analysis Program (AVA 3.4)," <u>Computers and Biomedical Research</u>, 9, 1976, pp307-316. [20]

Willems, J. & Pardaens, J., "Reproducibility of Diagnostic Results by a Multivariate Computer ECG Analysis Program (AVA 3.5)," <u>European Jour. of Cardiology</u>, 6, 1977, pp229-243. [29]

BCDE

Bates, J. & Bessman, J., "Evaluation of BCDE, A Microcomputer Program to Analyze Automated Blood Counts and Differentials," <u>American Jour. of Clinical Pathology</u>, 88, 1987, pp314-23. [29]

CAMP

Lobach, D. & Hammond, W., "Development and Evaluation of a Computer-Assisted Management Protocol (CAMP): Improved Compliance with Care Guidelines for Diabetes Mellitus," <u>Proc. of the 18th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-94)</u>, Washington, DC, 1994, pp787-791. [29]

COMPASS

Prerau, D.S., Gunderson, A.S., Reinke, R.E. & Goyal, S.K., "The COMPASS Expert System: Verification, Technology Transfer and Expansion," <u>Proc. of the 2nd IEEE Conf. on Artificial Intelligence Applications (CAIA-85)</u>, Washington, DC, 1985, pp597-602. [5]

DIAMON

Schneider, J., Renner, R., Engelbrecht, R. & Piwernetz, K., "DIAMON: First Evaluation Results," <u>Proc. of the 5th World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-89)</u>, B. Barber, C. Dexian, Q. Dulie & G. Wagner, eds., Singapore, Elsevier North Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1989, np. [20]

DXplain

Barnett, G.O., Cimino, J.J., Hupp, J.A. & Hoffer, E.P., "DXplain: Experience with Knowledge Acquisition and Program Evaluation," <u>Proc. of the 11th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-87)</u>, Washington, DC, November 1987, pp150-154. [3, 20, 25]

Feldman, M. & Barnett, G., "An Approach to Evaluating the Accuracy of DXplain," <u>Computer Programs and Methods in Biomedicine</u>, 35, 1991, pp261-66. [29]

EMYCIN

van Melle, W., Shortliffe, E.H. & Buchanan, B.G. "EMYCIN: A Knowledge Engineer's Tool for Constructing Rule-Based Expert Systems," Rule-Based Expert Systems, B.G. Buchanan & E.H. Shortliffe, eds, Addison Wesley, Reading MA, 1985, pp302-313.

FOETOS

Alonso-Betanzos, A., Devoe, L., Castillo, R., Moret-Bonillo, V., Hernández-Sande, C. & Searle, N., "FOETOS in Clinical Practice: A Retrospective Analysis of its Performance," Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 1, 1989, pp93-99. [20]

HEPAR

Lucas, P.J.F., "Development and Validation of HEPAR, An Expert System for the Diagnosis of Disorders of the Liver and Biliary Tract," Medical Informatics, 16(3), 1991, pp259-270. [20]

ILIAD

Lau, L. & Warner, H., "Performance of a Diagnostic System (ILIAD) as a Tool for Quality Assurance," Computers and Biomedical Research, 25, 1992, pp314-23. [29]

INTERNIST

Middleton, B., Shwe, M. & Heckerman, D., "Probabilistic Diagnosis Using a Reformulation of the INTERNIST-1/QMR Knowledge Base. II: Evaluation of Diagnostic Performance," Methods of Information in Medicine, 30, 1991, pp256-267. [29]

JAUNDICE

Camma, C., Garofalo, G. & Almasio, P., "A Performance Evaluation of the Expert System 'JAUNDICE' in Comparison with That of Three Hepatologists," Jour. of Hepatology, 13, 1991, pp279-85. [29]

Molino, G., Molino, F., Furia, D. et al., "Computer Aided Diagnosis in JAUNDICE: Comparison of Knowledge Based and Probabilistic Approaches," Methods of Information in Medicine, 35(1), 1996, pp41-51. [29]

JHExpert

Hoelter, J., Velay, G. & Rittano, C., "Verification and Validation in JHExpert," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

KADS

Rouge, A., Lapicque, J.Y., Brossier, F. & Lozinguez, Y., "Validation and Verification of KADS Data and Domain Knowledge," Proc. of the 2nd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-93), J. Cardenosa & P. Meseguer, eds., Palma de Mallorca, Spain, March 1993, pp69-83. [4]

Loan Probe

Ribar, G., Arcoleo, F. & Hollo, D., "Loan Probe: Testing a BIG Expert System," AI Expert, 6(5), May 1991, pp43. [20]

MEDAS

Georgakis, D., Trace, D., Naeymi-Rad, F. et al., "A Statistical Evaluation of the Diagnostic Performance of MEDAS - The Medical Emergency Decision Assistance

System," <u>Proc. of the 14th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-90)</u>, Washington, DC, November 1990, pp815-19. [29]

NEUROLOGIST

Catanzarite, V., Greenburg, G. & Bremermann, H., "Computer Consultation in Neurology: Subjective and Objective Evaluations of "NEUROLOGIST" System," <u>Computer Programs in Biomedicine</u>, 12, 1982, pp343-55. [29]

PATHFINDER

Heckerman, D. & Nathwani, B., "An Evaluation of the Diagnostic Accuracy of PATHFINDER," <u>Computers and Biomedical Research</u>, 25, 1992, pp56-74. [29]

PNEUMON

Verdaguer, A., Patak, A., Sancho, J.J., Sierra, C. & Sanz, F., "Validation of the Medical Expert System PNEUMON-IA," <u>Computers and Biomedical Research</u>, 25(6), December 1992, pp511-526. [19, 20]

PROSPECTOR

Gaschnig, J., "Preliminary Performance Analysis of the PROSPECTOR Consultant System for Mineral Exploration," <u>Proc. of the 6th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence</u>, Morgan Kaufmann, San Mateo, CA, 1979, pp308-310. [19]

PROTIS

Soula, G., Thirion, X., Gullana, J.-M., Navez, J., Vialettes, B., San Marco, J.-L. & Ledoray, V., "Une Validation Multicentrique du Système Expert PROTIS," <u>Proc of the 7th Int. Conf. on Expert Systems and Their Applications</u>, Avignon, France, May 1987, np. [3, 20, 25]

Soula, G., Thirion, X., San Marco, J.L., Vialettes, B., Guliana, J., Navez, I., "A Multi-Centered Validation of the Fuzzy Expert System PROTIS," <u>Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-88)</u>, R. Hansen & B.G. Solheim, R.R. O'Moore & F. Roger, eds., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1988, pp647-651. [3, 20, 25]

R1

Bachant, J. & McDermott, J., "R1 Revisited: Four Years in the Trenches," <u>AI Magazine</u>, 5(3), Fall 1984, pp21-32. [6, 26, 29]

McDermott, J., "R1: The Formative Years," <u>AI Magazine</u>, 2(2), Summer 1981, pp21-29. [6, 29]

RECONSIDER

Nelson, S.J., Blois, M.S., Tuttle, M.S., Erlbaum, M., Harrison, P., Kim, H., Winkelman, B., Yamashita, D., "Evaluating RECONSIDER - A Computer Program for Diagnostic Prompting," <u>Jour. of Medical Systems</u>, 9(5/6), December 1985, pp379-388. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Yamashita, D.T., Erlbaum, M.S., Harrison, P.B. & Winkelman, B.R., "Preliminary Evaluations of RECONSIDER a Diagnostic Prompting Program," Proc. of the AAMSI Congress, D.A.B. Lindberg, E.E. VanBrunt & M.A. Jenkin, eds., 1983, pp92-96. [20]

SAPHIRE

Hersh, W., Hickam, D.H., Haynes, R.B. et al., "Evaluation of SAPHIRE: An Automated Approach to Indexing and Retrieving Medical Literature," Proc. of the 15th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-91), Washington, DC, November 1991, pp808-812. [29]

XCON-in-RIME

Barker, V. & O'Connor, D., "Expert Systems for Configuration at DIGITAL: XCON and Beyond," Communications of the ACM, 32(3), 1989, pp298-318. [20]

Soloway, E., Bachant, J. & Jensen, K., "Assessing the Maintainability of XCON-in-RIME: Coping with the Problem of a Very Large Rule Base," Proc. of the 6th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-87), 1987, pp824-829. [6, 29]

UNIS

Petrucci, K., Jacox, A., McCormick, K. et al., "Evaluating Appropriateness of a Nurse Expert System's Patient Assessment: Urological Nursing Information System (UNIS)," Computers in Nursing, 10(6), 1992, pp243-249. [29]

Petrucci, K., Petrucci, P., Canfield, K., et al., "Evaluation of UNIS: Urological Nursing Information System," Proc. of the 16th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-92), Washington, DC, November 1992, pp43-47. [20, 29]

VALAB

Valdiguie, P.M., Rogari, E., Corberand, J.X. et al., "The Performance of the Knowledge-Based System VALAB Revisited: An Evaluation after Five Years," European Jour. of Clinical Chemistry & Clinical Biochemistry, 34(4), 1996, pp371-376. [29]

Experience with Other KBSs

Atkinson, G., Hier, D. & McCormick, W., "Development, Refinement and Evaluation of a Knowledge-Base for Stroke Expert System," Proc. of the 9th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-85), Baltimore, MD, 1985, pp320-324. [29]

Beggs, S., Vallbona, C., Spencer, W.A., Jacobs, F.M. & Baker, R.L., "Evaluation of a System for On-Line Computer Scheduling of Patient Care Activities," Computers and Biomedical Research, 4, 1971, pp634-654. [20]

Boswell, R., Craw, S. & Rowe, R., "Knowledge Refinement for a Design System," Proc. of the European Knowledge Acquisition Workshop (EKAW-97), E. Plaza & R. Benjamins, eds., Sant Feliu de Guixols, Spain, 1997, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, pp49-64. [22]

Boswell, R., Craw, S. & Rowe, R., "Refinement of a Product Formulation Expert System," Proc of the ECAI-96 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Refinement of Knowledge-Based Systems, Budapest, Hungary, August 1996, pp74-79. [22]

Catrou, P., Crawford, B. & Beeler, M., "Clinical Evaluation of an Algorithm for Interpreting Biochemical Profiles Showing Hyperbilirubinemia," American Jour. of Clinical Pathology, 74, 1980, pp61-63. [29]

Collinson, P.O., Boran, G.R., Gray, T., Cock, C. & Harrison, L., "Design Validation and Evaluation of a Clinical Management and Information System for Fluid, Electrolyte and Nutritional Therapy Combining Conventional and Novel Techniques," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-90), 40, R. O'Moore, S. Bengttson, J. Bryant & J.S. Bryden, eds, Springer-Verlag, London, England, 1990, pp275-277. [20]

Collinson, P.O., Brooks, G. & Rahmahamadamy, E., "Development and Evaluation of an Automated System for Rapid Biochemical Diagnosis of Acute Myocardial Infarction," Decision Support for Patient Management: Measurement, Modelling and Control, British Medical Informatics Society, 1989, pp294-300. [20]

Collinson, P.O., Chelsom, J., Waite, K.E., Cramp, D.G. & Carson, E.R., "Development and Validation of a Decision Support System for the Interpretation of Laboratory Data: A Study in Two Domains," Proc. of the ACB, 1990, pp56. [20]

Cornelissen, F., Jonker, C. & Treur, J., "Compositional Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems: A Case Study in Diagnostic Reasoning," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

deKleer, J, "An Assumption-Based TMS," Artificial Intelligence, 28, 1986, pp127-162. [26]

Elleby, P., Fargher, H.E. & Addis, T.R., "Evaluating a Knowledge Based Scheduling Systems," Proc. of the Colloq. on the Computing and Control Division, Testing Expert Systems, December 1987, pp2/1-2/4. [20]

Heckerling, P., Elstein, A., Terzian, C. et al., "The Effect of Incomplete Knowledge on the Diagnosis of a Computer Consultant System," Medical Informatics, 16, 1991, pp363-370. [29]

Kahn, C.E., "Validation, Clinical Trial and Evaluation of a Radiology Expert," Methods of Information in Medicine, 30, 1991, pp268-74. [20, 29]

Kunz, J.C. & Husain, N., "Validating Knowledge Systems: A Scheduling Example," Proc. of the 1991 IEEE. Int. Conf. on Robotics and Automation, Sacramento, CA, April 1991, pp2780-2784. [20]

Lehmann, E.D., Deutsch, T., Roudsari, A.V., Carson, E.R. & Sonksen, P.H., "Validation of a Metabolic Prototype to Assist in the Treatment of Insulin-Dependent Diabetes Mellitus," Medical Informatics, 18(2), 1993, pp83-101. [19, 20]

Leitich, H., Adlassnig, K.P. & Kolarz, G., "Development and Evaluation of Fuzzy Criteria for the Diagnosis of Rheumatoid Arthritis," Methods of Information in Medicine, 35(4-5), 1996, pp334-342. [29]

Long, J.A. & Neale, I.M., "Validating and Testing in Knowledge-Based Systems - A Case Study," Proc. 2nd Int. Conf. on Industrial and Engineering Applications of Artificial Intelligence and Expert Systems (IEA/AIE-89), Tullahoma, TN, June 1989, pp875-880. [5]

McClymont, G.L. & Schwartz, F.W., "Embedded Knowledge in Software: 2. Demonstration and Preliminary Evaluation," Ground Water - Jour. of National Water Well, 29(6), 1991, p878. [29]

McCrea, J.D., McCredie, M.R., McSherry, D.M. & Brooks, P.M., "A Controlled Evaluation of Diagnostic Criteria in the Development of a Rheumatology Expert System," British Jour. of Rheumatology, 28, 1989, pp13-17. [20]

Nakache, J.P., Gueguen, A., Dougados, M. & Nguyen, M., "Evaluation and Validation of a Functional Index in Ankylosing Spondylitis," Proc. of the 5th World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-89), B. Barber, C. Dexian, Q. Dulie & G. Wagner, eds., Elsevier North Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1989, pp262-265. [20]

Nykänen, P. & Nuutila, P., "Validation and Evaluation of a System for Thyroid Disorders," Expert Systems with Applications, 3, 1991, np. [20]

Plugge, L.A., Verhey, F.R.J. & Jolles, J., "A Desktop Expert System for the Differential Diagnosis of Dementia: An Evaluation Study," Int. Jour. of Technology Assessment in Health Care, 6(1), 1990, pp147-156. [20, 29]

Poirier, T.I. & Guidici, R.A., "Drug Interaction Microcomputer Software Evaluation: The Medical Letter Drug Interactions Program," Hospital Pharmacy, 25(5), 1990, p458. [29]

Poirier, T.I. & Guidici, R.A., "Evaluation of Drug Interaction Microcomputer Software: Part 1-Hansten Drug Interaction Knowledge Base Program," Hospital Pharmacy, 23(12), 1988, p1062. [29]

Poirier, T.I., "Evaluation of Drug Interaction Microcomputer Software: Dambro's Drug Interactions," Hospital Pharmacy, 25(1), 1990, np. [29]

Pool, K. & Finitzo, T., "Evaluation of a Computer-Automated Program for Clinical Assessment of the Auditory Brain Stem Response," Ear and Hearing, 10, 1989, pp304-310. [29]

Reid, J. & Kenny, G., "Evaluation of Closed-Loop Control of Arterial Pressure after Cardiopulmonary Bypass," British Jour. of Anaesthesiology, 59, 1987, pp247-255. [29]

Rovani, C., Jeun, Maitre, X., Degoulet, P., Suaquet, D., Aime, F., Lavril, M., Devries, C., Chatellier, G., Plovin, P.F. & Corvol, P., "Worst Situation Evaluation of an Expert System in Hypertension Management," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-87), A. Serio, R. O'Moore, A. Tardini & F. Roger, eds., EDI Press, Rome, Italy, 1987, pp967-973. [20]

Schewe, S., Scherrmann, W. & Gierl, L., "Evaluation and Measurement of Benefit of an Expert System for Differential Diagnosis in Rheumatology," Expert Systems and Decision Support in Medicine, Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics, 36, O. Rienhoff, V. Piccolo & B. Schneider, Springer-Verlag, 1988, pp352-354. [20, 25]

Shahsavar, N., Ludwigs, U., Blomqvist, H. et al., "Evaluation of a Knowledge-Based Decision Support System for Ventilator Therapy Management," Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 7(1), 1995, pp37-52. [29]

Shamsolmaali, A., Collinson, P., Gray, T.G., Carson, E.R. & Cramp, D.G., "Implementation and Evaluation of a Knowledge Based System for the Interpretation of Laboratory Data," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (AIME-89), 38, J. Hunter, J. Cookson, & J. Wyatt, eds., 1989, pp167-176. [20]

Shaw, M. & Woodward, J., "Validation in a Knowledge Support System," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 29(3), 1988, pp329-350. [29]

Shwe, M.A., Tu, S.W. & Fagan, L.M., "Validating the Knowledge Base of a Therapy Planning System," Methods of Information in Medicine, 28(1), January 1989, pp36-50. [3, 6, 19, 20, 25, 29]

Skaug, K., "Practical Experience in Validation of an Existing Clinical Data Management System: A Case Study from Nycomed Imaging AS, Norway," Proc. of the Drug Information Association (DIA) Conf. on Computer Validation, London, England, January, 1996, np. [29]

Spiegelhalter, D., "Evaluation of Clinical Decision Aids with an Application to a System for Dyspepsia," Statistics in Medicine, 2, 1983, pp207-216. [20, 29]

Waxman, H. & Worley, W., "Computer-Assisted Adult Medical Diagnosis: Subject Review and Evaluation of a New Microcomputer-Based System," Medicine, 69, 1990, pp125-136. [29]

Weber, J., Bartels, P., Griswold, W. et al., "Colonic Lesion Expert System: Performance Evaluation," Analytical and Quantitative Cytology and Histology, 10, 1988, pp150-159. [29]

Weusten, M.C.M., "Validation: The Key Concept in Maintenance of Legal Knowledge-Based System," Proc. of the 4th Int. Conf. on Artificial Intelligence and Law (ICAIL-82), ACM Press, 1982, np. [29]

Wied, G., Bartels, P., Bibbo, M. et al., "Computer Recognition of Ectocervical Cells: Classification Accuracy and Spatial Resolution," Acta. Cytology, 21, 1977, pp753-764. [29]

Yokoi, M., Uozumi, Z., Okamoto, N. et al., "Clinical Evaluation on 5 Years' Experience of Automated Phonocardiographic Analysis," Japanese Heart Jour., 18, 1977, pp482-490. [29]

SPECIFIC TECHNIQUES

Logic

Abduction

Kinkielele, D. & Ayel, M., "Un Schema Abductif pour la Verification Dynamique des Bases de Connaissances Floues," <u>Actes du 2eme CARI-94</u>, Ouagadougou, Burkina-Faso, October 1994, np. [5, 17]

Kinkielele, D., "Abduction Floue et Verification Dynamique des Bases de Connaissances," <u>Actes des 2eme Rencontres Nationales des Jeunes Chercheurs en Intelligence Artificielle</u>, Marseille, France, September 1994, np. [5]

Formal Methods

Charles, E., & Dubois, O., "MELODIA: Logical Methods for Checking Knowledge-Bases," <u>Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, M. Ayel & J.-P. Laurant, eds, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1991, pp95-105. [4]

Doetsch, V., Grieser, G. & Lange, S., "Applying Formal Concepts to Learning Systems Validation." <u>Jour. of Experimental & Theoretical Artificial Intelligence</u>, 12(4), 2000, pp433-445. [30]

Gamble, R.F., Roman, G.-C. & Ball, W.E., "Formal Verification of Pure Production System Programs," <u>Proc. of the 9th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-91)</u>, Anaheim, CA, July 1991, pp329-334. [5, 20]

Gamble, R.F., Roman, G.-C. & Ball, W.E., <u>On Extending the Application of Formal Specification and Verification Methods to Rule-Based Programming</u>, Technical Report WUCS-91-1, Department of Computer Science, Washington University, St. Louis, MO, 1991. [5]

Gamble, R.F., Roman, G.-C., Ball, W.E. et al., "The Application of Formal Specification and Verification to Rule-Based Programs," <u>Int. Jour. of Expert Systems - Research and Applications</u>, 7(3), 1994, pp303-38. [29]

Hollnagel, E., "The Formalization of Knowledge-Based Systems Validation and Verification: Promises and Pitfalls," <u>IFIP Trans. A (Computer Science and Technology)</u>, A-14, 1992, pp220-230. [5]

Hutter, D., Langenstein, G., Rock, G., Siekmann, J., Stephan, W. & Vogt, R., "Formal Software Development in the Verification Support Environment (VSE)," <u>Jour. of Experimental & Theoretical Artificial Intelligence</u>, 12(4), 2000, pp383-406. [30]

Hutter, D., Langenstein, B., Sengler, C., Siekmann, J.H., Stephan, W. & Wolpers, A., "Verification Support Environment (VSE),", <u>High Integrity Systems</u>, 1(6), 1996, pp523-530. [30]

Hutter, D., Rock, G., Siekmann, J.H., Stephan, W. & Vogt, R., "Formal Software Development in the Verification Support Environment (VSE)," <u>Proc. of 13th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp.</u>, Orlando, FL, May 2000, pp367-376. [30]

Knauf, R., Philippow, I., Gonzalez, A.J., Jantke, K.P. & Salecker, D., "System Refinement in Practice – Using a Formal Method to Modify Real-Life Knowledge," Proc. of 15th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Pensacola Beach, FL, May 2002, pp216-220. [30]

Laita, L., Couto, J. & Ledesma, L. "A Formal Model for Knowledge-Based System Verification," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, np. [26, 29]

Laita, L., Couto, J., Ledesma, L., Fernandez, A., & the Grupo de Logica, "A Formal Model for Knowledge Based Systems Verification," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-91 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, Anaheim, CA, July 1991, np. [26, 28]

Ligeza, A., "Logical Analysis of Completeness of Rule-Based Systems with Dual Resolution," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Loiseau, S. & Rousset, M.-C., "Formal Verification of Knowledge Bases Focused on Consistency: Two Experiments Based on ATMS Techniques," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 6(3), 1993, np. [5]

Nonnengart, A., Rock, G. & Stephan, W., "Using Hybrid Automata to Express Realtime Properties in VSE-II," Proc. of the 14th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp, Key West, FL, May 2001, pp640-644. [30]

Ochsenschlaeger, P., Repp, J. & Rieke, R., "Verification of Cooperating Systems. An Approach Based on Formal Languages," Proc. of 13th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 2000, pp346-350. [30]

Ochsenschlaeger, P., Repp, J., Rieke, R. & Nitsche, U., "The SH-Verification tool - Abstraction-Based Verification of Co-operating Systems," Formal Aspects of Computing, 10, 1998, pp381-404. [30]

Preece, A., Grossner, C., Chander, P.G. & Radhakrishnan, T., "Structural Validation of Expert Systems: Experience Using a Formal Model," Proc. of the 2nd World Congress on Expert Systems (WCES-94), Lisbon, Portugal, January 1994, np. [9]

Preece, A.D., Grossner, C., Chander, P.G. & Radhakrishnan, T., "Structural Validation of Expert Systems: Experience Using a Formal Model," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-93 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Report WS-93-05, A.D. Preece, ed., Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp19-26. [4, 5]

Roman, G.-C., Gamble, R.F. & Ball, W.E., "Formal Derivation of Rule-Based Programs," IEEE Trans. on Software Engineering, 19(3), March 1993, pp277-296. [4]

Salah, A.I. & Ismail, M.A., "Object Oriented Knowledge Engineering: A Formal Approach for Verification," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Sinz, C., Kaiser, A. & Kuechlin, W., "Detection of Inconsistencies in Complex Product Configuration Data Using Extended Propositional SAT-Checking," <u>Proc. of the 14th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp.</u>, Key West, FL, May 2001, pp645-649. [30]

Treur, J. & Willems, M., "A Logical Foundation For Verification," <u>Proc. of the 11th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-94)</u>, A.G. Cohn, ed., Amsterdam, The Netherlands, August 1994, pp745-749. [5]

Treur, J. & Willems, M., "Formal Notions for Verification of Dynamics of Knowledge-Based Systems," <u>Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95)</u>, Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

Formal Specification

Baughman, D., Gamble, R. & Murphy, A., "Using Formal Specification to Design Verifiable Expert Systems from Specifications," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-94 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, R.T. Plant, ed., Seattle, WA, July/August 1994, np. [5]

Gamble, R.F., Roman, G.-C. & Ball, W.E., <u>On Extending the Application of Formal Specification and Verification Methods to Rule-Based Programming</u>, Technical Report WUCS-91-1, Department of Computer Science, Washington University, St. Louis, MO, 1991. [5]

Gamble, R.F., Roman, G.-C., Ball, W.E. et al., "The Application of Formal Specification and Verification to Rule-Based Programs," <u>Int. Jour. of Expert Systems - Research and Applications</u>, 7(3), 1994, pp303-38. [29]

Meseguer, P. & Preece, A., "Assessing the Role of Formal Specifications in Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," <u>Proc of the 3rd IFIP Int. Conf. on Achieving Quality in Software (AQuIS'96)</u>, Chapman and Hall, 1996, pp317-328. [9]

Meseguer, P. & Preece, A., "Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems with Formal Specifications," <u>Knowledge Engineering Review</u>, 10(4), 1995, pp331-343. [9]

Preece, A.D., "On the Role of Formal Specifications in Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," <u>Proc. of the Workshop on Modelling Languages for Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, January 1995, np. [5]

Rousset, M.-C., "Knowledge Formal Specifications for Formal Verification: A Proposal Based on the Integration Of Different Logical Formalisms," <u>Proc. of the 11th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-94)</u>, A.G. Cohn, ed., Amsterdam, The Netherlands, August 1994, pp739-743. [5]

Fuzzy Sets

O'Leary, D.E., "A Fuzzy-Set Approach for Analyzing the Validation of Expert Systems in a Multiple Agent Environment," <u>Expert Systems with Applications</u>, 7(2), 1994, pp169-174. [16, 23]

Idempotency

Todd, B.S., "Idempotency as a Correctness Property of Rule Bases," <u>Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95)</u>, Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

Induction

Talavera, L. & Cortes, U., "Inductive Hypothesis Validation and Bias Selection in Unsupervised Learning," <u>Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97)</u>, J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Mathematical Programming

O'Leary, D.E. & Schaffer, J., "The Use of Mathematical Programming to Verify Rule-based Knowledge," <u>Annals of Operations Research</u>, August 1996, pp181-193. [23]

Neural Networks

Wen, W. & Callahan, J., "Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems with ANN Components," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-96 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems and Subsystems</u>, Portland, ME, August 1996, np. [30]

Wen, W., Callahan, J. & Napolitano, M., "Develop Verifable Neuronal Network Controller," <u>Proc. of the Workshop on AI Applications to Aviation</u>, Toulouse, France, November 1996, np. [30]

Wen, W., Callahan, J. & Napolitano, M., "Verifying Stability of Dynamic Soft-Computing Systems," <u>Proc. of the IJCAI-97 Workshop on Validation, Verification & Refinement of AI Systems and Subsystems</u>, Nagoya, Japan, August 1997, pp11-18. [30]

Procedural Semantics

Evertsz, R., "The Automatic Analysis of Rule-Based System Based on Their Procedural Semantics," <u>Proc. of the 12th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-91)</u>, Sydney, Australia, August 1991, pp22-27. [6, 29]

Set Covering

Pazzani, M.J., "A Set Covering Approach to Testing Rule-Based Expert Systems," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-90 Workshop on Verification, Validation and Testing of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, Boston, MA, July 1990, np. [4]

Structure-Based Techniques

Gissi, P., "Logical Checks in a Rule Based Medical Decision Support System," <u>Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-87)</u>, A. Serio, R. O'Moore, A. Tardini & F. Roger, eds., EDI Press, Rome, Italy, 1987, pp981-985. [20]

Grossner, C., Preece, A., Chander, P.G., Radhakrishnan, T. & Suen, C.Y., "Exploring the Structure of Rule-Based Systems," <u>Proc. of the 11th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-93)</u>, Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp704-709. [6, 9, 29]

Herrmann, J., Jantke, K.P. & Knauf, R., "Using Structural Knowledge for System Validation," Proc. of the 10th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Daytona Beach, FL, May 1997, pp82-86. [30]

Herrmann, J., Jantke, K.P. & Knauf, R., "Towards Cost Driven System Validation," Proc. of 42nd Int. Ilmenau Scientific Colloq., Ilmenau, Germany, 1997, pp41-46. [30]

Herrmann, J., Jantke, K.P. & Knauf, R., "Variants of Validity and their Impact on the Overall Test Space," Proc. of 11th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Sanibel Island, FL, May 1998, pp472-477. [30]

Jantke, K.P. & Herrmann, J., "Lattices of Knowledge in Intelligent System Validation," Proc. of 12th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 1999, pp499-503. [30]

Kiper, J.D., "Structural Testing of Rule-Based Expert Systems," ACM Trans. on Software Engineering and Methodology, 1(2), 1992, pp168-187. [6, 29]

Preece, A., Grossner, C., Chander, P.G. & Radhakrishnan, T., "Structure-Based Validation of Rule-Based Systems," Data and Knowledge Engineering, 26, 1997, np. [9]

van Someren, M., "Structural and Formative Validation of Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, pp103-108. [5]

Unification
Polat, F. & Guvenir, H.A., "A Unification-Based Approach for Knowledge Base Verification," Expert Systems, 8(4), November 1991, pp251-259. [5]

Optimization/Refinement

Algebraic Refinement
Vermesan, A. & Meldhal, S., "An Algebraic Approach to Refinement of Knowledge-Based System Specification," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

Genetic Algorithms
Shultz, A.C., "Test and Evaluation by Genetic Algorithms," IEEE Expert, 8, 1993, pp9-14. [29]

Terano, T. & Kobayshi, K., "Changing the Traces: Refining a Rule-Base by Genetic Algorithms," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [4]

Knowledge Base Refinement
Antoniou, G & MacNish, C.K., "On the Refinement of Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases," Proc of the ECAI-96 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Refinement of Knowledge-Based Systems, Budapest, Hungary, August 1996, pp1-6. [21]

Atkinson, G., Hier, D. & McCormick, W., "Development, Refinement and Evaluation of a Knowledge-Base for Stroke Expert System," Proc. of the 9th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-85), Baltimore, MD, 1985, pp320-324. [29]

Boswell, R., Craw, S. & Rowe, R., "Knowledge Refinement for a Design System," Proc. of the European Knowledge Acquisition Workshop (EKAW-97), E. Plaza & R. Benjamins, eds., Sant Feliu de Guixols, Spain, 1997, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, pp49-64. [22]

Boswell, R., Craw, S. & Rowe, R., "Refinement of a Product Formulation Expert System," Proc of the ECAI-96 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Refinement of Knowledge-Based Systems, Budapest, Hungary, August 1996, pp74-79. [22]

Bouali, F., Loiseau, S. & Rousset, M.-C., "Revision of Rule Bases," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10, 24]

Craw, S. & Hutton, P., "Protein Folding: Symbolic Refinement Competes with Neural Networks," Proc. of the 12th Int. Conf. on Machine Learning, A. Prieditis & S. Russell, eds., Tahoe City, CA, Morgan Kaufmann, Los Altos, CA, 1995, pp133-141. [22]

Craw, S. & Sleeman, D., "Automating the Refinement of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 9th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-90), L.C. Aiello, ed., Stockholm, Sweden, August 1990, pp167-172. [6]

Craw, S. & Sleeman, D., "Refinement in Response to Validation," Expert Systems with Applications, 8(3), 1995, pp343-349. [22]

Craw, S. & Sleeman, D., "The Flexibility of Speculative Refinement," Proc. of the 8th Int. Workshop on Machine Learning, L. Birnbaum & G. Collins, eds., Evanston, IL, Morgan Kaufmann, Los Altos, CA, 1991, pp28-32. [22]

Craw, S. & Sleeman, D., Automating the Refinement of Knowledge-Based Systems, Technical Report AUCS/TR9002, University of Aberdeen, Aberdeen, Scotland, 1990. [22]

Craw, S. & Sleeman, D., Knowledge-Based Refinement of Knowledge Based Systems, Technical Report RGU-SCMS-95/2, The Robert Gordon University, Aberdeen, Scotland, 1996. [22]

Craw, S., "Refinement Assists Quality Assurance," Proc. of the IJCAI-93 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Expert Systems, Chambery, France, August/September 1993, pp5-15. [22]

Craw, S., "Refinement Complements Verification and Validation," Int. Jour. of Human-Computer Studies, 44(2), 1996, pp245-256. [22]

Craw, S., Automating the Refinement of Knowledge Based Systems, Ph.D. Thesis, University of Aberdeen, Aberdeen, Scotland, 1991. [4, 22]

Craw, S., Boswell, R. & Rowe, R., "Knowledge Refinement to Debug and Maintain a Tablet Formulation System," Proc. of the 9th IEEE Int. Conf. on Tools for Artificial Intelligence (TAI'97), Newport Beach, CA, 1997, pp446-453. [22]

Craw, S., Sleeman, D., Boswell, R. & Carbonara, L., "Is Knowledge Refinement Different from Theory Revision?" Proc. of the MLNet Familiarization Workshop on Theory Revision and Restructuring in Machine Learning (ECML-94), GMD Technical Report Number 842, S. Wrobel, ed., Catania, Sicily, Italy, April 1994, pp32-34. [22]

Ginsberg, A, "A Metalinguistic Approach to the Construction of Knowledge Base Refinement Systems," Proc. of the 5th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-86), 1986, pp436-441. [26, 29]

Ginsberg, A, "Automatic Refinement of Expert System Knowledge Bases," Pitman Research Notes in Artificial Intelligence, London, UK, 1988, np. [26, 29]

Ginsberg, A., Weiss, S. & Politakis, P., "SEEK2: A Generalized Approach to Automatic Knowledge Base Refinement," Proc. of the 9th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-85), Los Angeles, CA, August 1985, pp367-374. [20]

Hinkelman, K., Kuhn, O. & Wache, H., "Revising and Updating a Corporate Memory," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

Kelbassa, H-W., "Higher Order Refinement Heuristics for Rule Validation," Proc. of 15th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Pensacola Beach, FL, May 2002, pp211-215. [30]

Knauf, R., Philippow, I., Gonzalez, A.J., Jantke, K.P. & Salecker, D., "System Refinement in Practice – Using a Formal Method to Modify Real-Life Knowledge," Proc. of 15th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Pensacola Beach, FL, May 2002, pp216-220. [30]

Meseguer, P., "Expert System Validation through Knowledge Base Refinement," Proc. of the 13th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-93), R. Bajcsy, ed., Chambery, France, August/September 1993, pp477-482. [5, 6, 29]

Meseguer, P., "Incremental Verification of Rule-Based Expert Systems," Proc. of the 10th European Conf on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-92), B. Neumann, ed., Vienna, Austria, August 1992, pp840-844. [5, 6, 26, 29]

Ourston, D. & Mooney, R.J., "Changing the Rules: A Comprehensive Approach to Theory Refinement," Proc. of the 8th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-90), Stanford, CA, 1990, pp815-820. [29]

Palmer, G. & Craw, S., "The Role of Test Cases in Automated Knowledge Refinement," Proc. of the 12th Expert Systems Conf., Cambridge, England, SGES Publications, 1996, pp75-90. [22]

Palmer, G.H. & Craw, S., "Utilising Explanation to Assist the Refinement of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, pp201-211. [5, 22]

Palmer, G.J. & Craw, S., "The Selection of Training Cases for Automated Knowledge Refinement," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, pp205-215. [10, 22]

Sleeman, D., Craw, S., Ellery, I., Sharma, S. & Edwards, P., "Machine Learning, Knowledge-Base Refinement and Knowledge Acquisition: Systems Which Cope with Incomplete and Inconsistent Knowledge-Bases," Proc. of the 5th European Knowledge Acquisition Workshop (EKAW 91), M. Lister & B.R. Gaines, eds., GMD Studien Nr. 211, Crieff, Scotland, 1992, pp332-342. [22]

Terano, T. & Kobayshi, K., "Changing the Traces: Refining a Rule-Base by Genetic Algorithms," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [4]

Zlatareva, N., "VVR: A Uniform Framework for Expert System Knowledge Bases Verification, Validation and Refinement," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-91 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, Anaheim, CA, July 1991, np. [4]

Zlatareva, N.P., "A Framework for Knowledge-Based System Verification, Validation and Refinement: The VVR System," Proc. of the 5th Florida Artificial Intelligence Symp., Ft. Lauderdale, FL, April 1992, pp10-14. [7, 29]

Zlatareva, N.P., "Improving Knowledge-Based System Performance by Reordering Rule Sequences," Proc. of the 14th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Key West, FL, May 2001, pp655-659. [30]

Graph Theory

Directed Graphs

Nazareth, D.L. & Kennedy, M.H., "Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems Using Directed Graphs," Knowledge Acquisition, 3(3), 1991, pp339-360. [5, 11, 16]

Flow Graphs

Becker, L.A., Green, P.G. & Bhutinager, J., Evidence Flow Graphs for Verification and Validation of Expert Systems, NASA Contractor Report 181810, nd. [4]

Phelps, R. & Aerts, W., "Improving Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems through Naturally Comprehensible Flow Representations," Proc. of the 2nd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-93), J. Cardenosa & P. Meseguer, eds., Palma de Mallorca, Spain, March 1993, pp295-309. [4]

Graph Theoretics

Menzies, T. & Cohen, R.F., "A Graph Theoretic Optimisation of Temporal Abductive Validation," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Layered Support Graphs

Valiente, G.A., "Using Layered Support Graphs for Verifying External Adequacy in Rule-Based Expert Systems," SIGART Bulletin, 3(1), January 1992, pp20-24. [19]

Valiente, G.A. "Verification of Knowledge Base Redundancy and Subsumption Using Graph Transformation," International Journal of Expert Systems, 6(3), 1993, pp41-55.

Petri Nets

Agarwal, R. & Tanniru, M., "A Petri-Net Based Approach for Verifying the Integrity of Production Systems," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 36(3), 1992, pp447-468. [12, 16, 19]

Liu, N.K. & Dillon, T., "An Approach towards the Verification of Expert Systems Using Numerical Petri Nets," Int. Jour. of Intelligent Systems, 6(3), June 1991, pp255-276. [5, 19, 20]

Meseguer, P., "A New Method to Checking Rule Bases for Inconsistency: A Petri Net Approach," Proc. of the 9th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-90), L.C. Aiello, ed., Stockholm, Sweden, August 1990, pp437-442. [26, 28, 29]

Nazareth, D.L., "Investigating the Applicability of Petri Nets for Rule-Based System Verification," IEEE Trans. on Knowledge and Data Engineering, 5(3), June 1993, pp402-415. [12, 16]

Modeling & Simulation

Causal Modeling

Forsyth, G.F., Larkin, M.D. & Wallace, G.A., "Verification of Heuristic Diagnostic Knowledge by Comparison with a Causal/Qualitative Model," Proc. of the 3rd Int. Conf. on Industrial and Engineering Applications of Artificial Intelligence and Expert Systems (IEA/AIE-90), Charleston, SC, July 1990, pp751. [20]

Conceptual Models

Ayel, M., "A Conceptual Model for Consistency of Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the Conf. on Artificial Intelligence Methodology, Systems and Applications (AIMSA-88),T. O'Shea & V. Sgurev, eds., Varna, Italy, September 1988, pp75-82. [17]

Haouche, C.-S., "Using a Conceptual Model to Validate Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 2nd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-93), J. Cardenosa & P. Meseguer, eds., Palma de Mallorca, Spain, March 1993, np. [5]

Kinkielele, D., "Un Modele Conceptuel pour la Verification de la Coherence des Bases de Connaissances Floues," Actes des 1ier Journees Validation des Systemes a Base de Connaissances (JVAL-92), Dourdan, France, April 1992, np. [5]

Preece, A.D., "Verifying Expert Systems Using Conceptual Models," Proc. of the 5th Annual Knowledge-Based Software Assistant (KBSA) Conf., Rome Air Development Center, Griffiss AFB, NY, 1990, pp280-289. [5]

Richards, D. & Compton, P., "Finding Conceptual Models to Assist Validation," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp53-62. [8]

Vignollet, L. & Ayel, M., "A Conceptual Model for Building Sets of Test Samples for Knowledge Bases," <u>Proc. of the 9th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-90)</u>, L.C. Aiello, ed., Stockholm, Sweden, August 1990, pp667-675. [6, 17, 29]

<u>Modelling as Solving Tasks</u>

Boulitreau-Lefevre, P., "Modelling Validation Seen as a Set of Solving Tasks," <u>Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95)</u>, Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

<u>Simulation Techniques</u>

Hall, D.L. & Heinze, D.T., "The Use of Simulation Techniques for Expert System Test and Evaluation," <u>ISA Transactions</u>, 28(1), 1989, pp19-22. [16]

Schecke, T.H., Popp, H.J., Rau, G., Käsmacher, H. & Kalff, G., "Design of a Knowledge-Based Decision Support System for Anesthesia Using Simulators Supporting Knowledge Acquisition and Validation," <u>Proc. of the European Congress on Artificial Intelligence in Medicine</u>, J. Hunter, J. Cookson & J. Wyatt, eds., Springer-Verlag, London, England, 1989, pp108-112. [20]

<u>Symbolic Evaluation</u>

Clarke, L.A. & Richardson, D.J., <u>Symbolic Evaluation - An Aid to Testing and Verification</u>, Technical Report 83-41, University of Massachusetts, Amherst, MA, 1983. [5]

<u>Symbolic Execution</u>

Bendou, A. & Ayel, M., "A Symbolic Execution Based Approach for Inspecting Knowledge Bases," <u>Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97)</u>, J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10, 17]

Coward, P.D., "Symbolic Execution and Testing," <u>Information and Software Technology</u>, 33(1), 1991, pp53-64. [20]

Empirical Techniques

<u>Consensus Models</u>

O'Leary, D.E. & Pincus, K.V., "Models of Consensus for Validation of Expert Systems," <u>Int. Jour. of Expert Systems - Research and Applications</u>, 6(2), 1993, pp 99-111. [16, 20, 23]

Delphi Method

Kors, J.A., Sittig, A.C. & van Bemmel, J.H., "The Delphi Method to Validate Diagnostic Knowledge in Computerized ECG Interpretation," Methods of Information in Medicine, 29, 1990, pp44-50. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Empirical Analysis

Politakis, P. & Weiss, S.M., "Using Empirical Analysis to Refine Expert System Knowledge Bases," Artificial Intelligence, 22(1), January 1984, pp23-48. [20, 29]

Politakis, P., "Empirical Analysis for Expert Systems," Research Notes on Artificial Intelligence, Pitman, Boston, MA, 1985. [26]

Politakis, P., Empirical Analysis for Expert Systems, Pitman, Boston, MA, 1985. [29]

Empirical Methods

Adelman, L., "Experiments, Quasi-Experiments, and Case Studies: A Review of Empirical Methods for Evaluating Decision Support Systems," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man and Cybernetics, 21(2), March/April 1991, pp293-301. [6, 20, 29]

Landauer, C., "Empirical Methods in Expert System Validation," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-90 Workshop on Verification, Validation and Testing of Knowledge-Based Systems, Boston, MA, July 1990, np. [16]

Lehner, P.E., "Toward an Empirical Approach to Evaluating the Knowledge Base of an Expert System," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, 19(3), May/June 1989, pp658-662. [29]

O'Leary, D.E., "Verification of Uncertain Knowledge-Based Systems: An Empirical Verification Approach," Management Science, December 1996, pp1663-1675. [23]

Vinze, A., "Empirical Verification of Effectiveness for a Knowledge-Based System," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 37(3), 1992, pp309-34. [29]

Interactive Concept Learning

de Raedt, L. & Bruynooghe, M., "Using Interactive Concept-Learning for Knowledge-Base Validation, Verification and Testing," Proc. of the ECAI-90 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, M. Ayel & J.-P. Laurent, eds., Stockholm, Sweden, August 1990, np. [5]

de Raedt, L., Sablon, G. & Bruynooghe, M., "Using Interactive Concept Learning for Knowledge Base Validation and Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based-Systems," Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, M. Ayel & J.-P. Laurant, eds, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1991, pp177-190. [4]

Observer Agreement Measurement/User Feedback

Catanzarite, V., Greenburg, G. & Bremermann, H., "Computer Consultation in Neurology: Subjective and Objective Evaluations of "NEUROLOGIST" System," Computer Programs in Biomedicine, 12, 1982, pp343-55. [29]

Khan, M.C., Steib, S.A., Dunagan, W.C. et al., "Monitoring Expert System Performance Using Continuous User Feedback," JAMIA, 3(3), 1996, pp216-23. [29]

Rees, P.L., "User Evaluation of Expert Systems," Industrial Management and Data Systems, 92(6), 1992, pp17-23. [20, 29]

Sample Accrual Rate

Shapiro, A.R., "Estimation of Knowledge Base Coverage from the Sample Accrual Rate," Proc. of the World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-86), R. Salamon, B. Blum, M. Jorgensen, eds., North Holland Publishing Co., Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1986, pp71-75. [20]

Software Visualization

Domingue, J.B., "Software Visualization Based Knowledge-Based System Validation," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

Statistical Techniques

Georgakis, D., Trace, D., Naeymi-Rad, F. et al., "A Statistical Evaluation of the Diagnostic Performance of MEDAS - The Medical Emergency Decision Assistance System," Proc. of the 14th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-90), Washington, DC, November 1990, pp815-19. [29]

Kahn, M.G., Bailey, T.E., Steib, S.A. et al., "Statistical Process Control Methods for Expert System Performance Monitoring," JAMIA, 3(4), 1996, pp258-269. [29]

O'Leary, D.E. & Kandelin, N.A., "Validating the Weights in Rule-Based Expert Systems: A Statistical Approach," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 1(3), 1988, pp253-279. [5, 16, 20]

Titt, E., "Testing Algorithms and Programs of Multivariate Statistical Procedures - Necessary Assumption of Building Expert Systems," Int. Jour. of Pattern Recognition and Artificial Intelligence, 3(1), 1989, pp121-133. [29]

Turing Test

Agarwal, R., Kannan, R. & Tanniru, M., "Formal Validation of a Knowledge-Based System Using a Variation of the Turing Test," Expert Systems with Applications, 6, 1993, pp181-192. [19]

Colby, K., Hilf, F., Weber, S. et al., "Turing-Like Indistinguishability Tests for the Validation of Computer Simulation of Paranoid Processes," Artificial Intelligence, 3, 1972, pp199-221. [29]

Jantke, K.P., Abel, T & Knauf, R., Fundamentals of a Turing Test Approach to Validation, Intelligent Meme Report MEME-IMP-1/1997, Sapporo, Japan, Hokkaido University, Meme Media Laboratory, 1997. [30]

Jantke, K.P., Knauf, R. & Abel, T., A Turing Test Scenario to Estimate an AI System's Validity, Technical Report DOI-TR-133, Dept. of Informatics, Kyushu University 33, Fukuoka, Japan, March 1997. [30]

Jantke, K.P., Knauf, R. & Abel, T., "The Turing Test Approach to Validation," Proc. of the IJCAI-97 Workshop on Validation, Verification & Refinement of AI Systems and Subsystems, Nagoya, Japan, August 1997, pp35-45. [30]

Knauf, R. & Gonzalez, A.J., "Estimating an AI System's Validity by a Turing Test," P Proc. of 42nd Int. Ilmenau Scientific Colloq., Ilmenau, Germany, 1997, pp65-70. [30]

Knauf, R., Gonzalez, A.J. & Philippow, I., "Towards an Assessment of an AI System's Validity by a Turing Test," Proc. of the 10th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Daytona Beach, FL, May 1997, pp397-401. [30]

Knauf, R., Jantke, K.P., Abel, T. & Philippow, I., "Fundamentals of a Turing Test Approach to Validation of AI Systems," Proc. of 42nd Int. Ilmenau Scientific Colloq., Ilmenau, Germany, 1997, pp59-64. [30]

Knauf, R., Phillipow, I. & Gonzalez, A.J., "Toward an Assessment of an AI System's Validity by a Turing Test," Proc. of the 10th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Daytona Beach, FL, May 1997, pp397-401. [7]

Salecker, D. & Knauf, R., "Validation Manager: A Tool for AI Systems' Evaluation by a Turing Test - Like Methodology," Proc. of 12th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 1999, pp531-535. [30]

Classification

Anomaly Detection

Preece, A.D. & Shinghal, R., "Verifying Knowledge Bases by Anomaly Detection: An Experience Report," Proc. of the 10th European Conf on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-92), B. Neumann, ed., Vienna, Austria, August 1992, pp835-839. [5, 6, 9, 29]

Preece, A.D., Bell, R.D. & Suen, C.Y., "Verifying Knowledge Bases by Anomaly Detection: An Experience Report," Proc. of the ECAI-92 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, Vienna, Austria, August 1992, np. [5]

van Harmelen, F., "Applying Rule-Based Anomalies to KADS Inference Structures," Decision Support Systems, 21(4), 1998, pp271-280. [30]

van Harmelen, F. & Aben, M., "Applying Rule-Base Anomalies to KADS Inference Structures," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [5]

Kondo, H. & Kurihara, M., "Design and Heuristics for BDD-Based Automated Termination Verification System for Rule-Based Programs," Proc. of the 1999 IEEE Int. Conf. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, Tokyo, Japan, October 1999, ppV738-V743. [30]

Constraint Analysis

Bendou, A., "CT-DATAGEN: A Constraint-Based Test Data Generator," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, pp19-29. [5]

Containment Checking

Levy, A. & Rousset, M.-C., "Verification of Knowledge Bases Based on Containment Checking," Artificial Intelligence Jour., 101(1-2), May 1998, np. [24]

Levy, A. & Rousset, M.-C., "Verification of Knowledge Bases Based on Containment Checking," Proc. of 13th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-96), Portland, ME, August 1996, np. [24]

Correlation Measures

Butler, K.A., "Application of Correlation Measures for Validating Structured Selectors," Proc. of 3rd Conf. on Artificial Intelligence Applications, Washington, DC, 1987, pp327-330. [20]

Clustering Analysis

Mehrotra, M. & Wild, C., "Multi-Viewpoint Clustering Analysis," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-93 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Report WS-93-05, A.D. Preece, ed., Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp 52-63. [4]

Mehrotra, M. & Wild, C., "Analyzing Knowledge-Based Systems with Multiviewpoint Clustering Analysis," Jour. of Systems and Software, 29(3), June 1995, pp235-249. [29]

Incidence Matrix

Coenen, F. & Dunne, P., "Verification and Validation of Rulebases Using a Binary Encoded Incidence Matrix Technique," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Coenen, F., Bench-Capon, T. & Kent, A., "A Binary Encoded Incidence Matrix Representation to Support Knowledge-Based System Verification," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-94 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, R.T. Plant, ed., Seattle, WA, July/August 1994, pp84-93. [4, 19]

Local Partition Verification

Ramaswamy, M. & Sarkar, S., "Global Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems via Local Verification of Partitions," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Vanthienen, J., Mues, C., Aerts, A. & Wets, G., "A Modularization Approach to the Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, pp96-102. [18]

Transformations

Algebraic Transformations

Valiente, G.A., <u>Knowledge Base Verification Using Algebraic Transformations</u>, Ph.D. Dissertation, Informatics, Universitat de Les Illes Balears, France, July 1994. [11, 14]

Knowledge Base Reduction

Ginsberg, A., "Knowledge-Base Reduction: A New Approach to Checking Knowledge Bases for Inconsistency and Redundancy," <u>Proc. of the 7th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-88)</u>, August 1988, pp585-589. [5, 6, 19, 20, 26, 29]

Williamson, K. & Dahl, M., "Knowledge-Based Reduction for Verifying Rule Bases Containing Equations," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-93 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, AAAI Report WS-93-05, A.D. Preece, ed., Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp66-71. [4]

ROC Analysis

Adlassnig, K.-P. & Scheithauer, W., "Performance Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems Using ROC Curves," <u>Computers and Biomedical Research</u>, 22, 1989, pp297-313. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Adlassnig, K.P., "The Application of ROC Curves to the Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems," <u>Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-87)</u>, A. Serio, R. O'Moore, A. Tardini & F. Roger, eds., EDI Press, Rome, Italy, 1987, pp951-957. [20]

de Dombal, F.T. & Horrocks, J.C., "Use of Receiver Operating Characteristics (ROC) Curves to Evaluate Computer Confidence Threshold and Clinical Performance in the Diagnosis of Appendicitis," <u>Methods of Information in Medicine</u>, 17, 1978, pp157-161. [20, 29]

Hanley, J. & McNeil, B., "The Meaning and Use of the Area under a Receiver Operating Characteristic (ROC) Curve," <u>Radiology</u>, 143, 1982, pp29-36. [29]

Klessens, P., Binkhuysen, F., Ottes, F. et al., "Diagnostic Evaluation of a PACS Subsystem Using Mammographs: An ROC Analysis," <u>Medical Informatics</u>, 13, 1988, pp323-326. [29]

Somoza, E., Soutullo-Esperon, L. & Mossman, D., "Evaluation and Optimization of Diagnostic Tests Using Receiver Operating Characteristic Analysis and Information Theory," <u>Int. Jour. of Biomedical Computing</u>, 24, 1989, pp153-189. [20]

Heuristics

Decision Tables

Chen, G., Vanthienen, J. & Wets, G., "Using Fuzzy Decision Tables to Build Valid Intelligent Systems," <u>Proc. of the 6th Int. Fuzzy Systems Association World Congress (IFSA-95)</u>, Sao Paulo, Brazil, July 1995, np. [18]

Cragun, B.J. & Steudel, H.J., "A Decision Table Based Processor for Checking Completeness and Consistency," Int. Jour. of Man Machine Studies, 26(5), May 1987, pp633-648. [4, 13, 16, 19, 20, 29]

Puuronen, S., "A Tabular Rule-Checking Method," Proc of the 7th Int. Conf. on Expert Systems and Their Applications, Avignon, France, May 1987, pp257-266. [3, 20, 25]

Vanthienen, J. & Dries, E., "Illustration of a Decision Table Tool for Specifying and Implementing Knowledge-Based Systems," Int. Jour. on Artificial Intelligence Tools, 3(2), 1994, pp267-288. [18]

Vanthienen, J. & Dries, E., "Illustration of a Decision Table Tool for Specifying and Implementing Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc of the 5th Int. Conf. on Tools for Artificial Intelligence (TAI-93), Boston, MA, November 1993, pp198-205. [19]

Vanthienen, J. & Wets, G., "Fuzzy Decision Tables: Modeling and V&V Issues," Proc. of the ECAI-94 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, August 1994, pp36-40. [18]

Vanthienen, J., "Knowledge Acquisition and Validation Using a Decision Table Engineering Workbench," Proc. of the 1st World Congress on Expert Systems (WCES-91), Orlando, FL, December 1991, pp1861-1868. [4, 18]

Dynamic Testing

Miller, L.A., "Dynamic Testing of Knowledge Bases Using the Heuristic Testing Approach," Expert Systems with Applications, 1(3), 1990, pp249-269. [6, 29]

Meta-Knowledge Use

Brender, J., McNair, P., Raun, H., Nolan, J., & Vingtoft, S., "Meta Knowledge as a Means for Quality Management in Knowledge Based Systems," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-90), 40, R. O'Moore, S. Bengttson, J. Bryant & J.S. Bryden, eds, Springer-Verlag, London, England, 1990, np. [20]

Morell, L.L., "Use of Metaknowledge in the Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 1ST Int. Conf. on Industrial and Engineering Applications of Artificial Intelligence and Expert Systems (IEA/AIE-87), June 1987, pp847-857. [5]

Ripple Down Rules

Kang, B.H., Gambetta, W. & Compton, P., "Verification and Validation with Ripple Down Rules," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-94 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, R.T. Plant, ed., Seattle, WA, July/August 1994, np. [19]

Z Specifications

Amla, N. & Ammann, P., "Using Z Specifications in Category Partition Testing," Proc. of the 7th Annual IEEE Conf. on Computer Assurance, Systems Integrity, Software Safety, Process Security (COMPASS-92), June 1992, Gaithersburg, MD, np. [19]

SPECIFIC TOOLS

AbsPS

Evertsz, R., "The Automatic Analysis of Rule-Based System Based on Their Procedural Semantics," Proc. of the 12th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-91), Sydney, Australia, August 1991, pp22-27. [6, 29]

ARC

Nguyen, T.A., "Verifying Consistency of Production Systems," Proc. of the 3rd IEEE Conf. on Artificial Intelligence Applications (CAIA-87), Kissimmee, FL, February 1987, pp4-8. [2, 11, 16, 29]

BVAL

Santos Jr., E., Gleason, H.T. & Banks, S.B., "BVAL: Probabilistic Knowledge-Base Validation," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp13-22. [8]

CHECK

Nguyen, T.A., Perkins, W.A., Laffey, T.J. & Pecora, D., "Checking an Expert System Knowledge Base for Consistency and Completeness," Proc. of the 9th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-85), Los Angeles, CA, August 1985, pp375-378. [2, 5, 16, 20, 26, 29]

Nguyen, T.A., Perkins, W.A., Laffey, T.J. & Pecora, D., "Knowledge Base Verification," AI Magazine, 8(2), Summer 1987, pp69-75. [5, 6, 16, 19, 20, 26, 29]

Perkins, W.A., Laffey, T.J., Pecora, D. & Nguyen, T.A., "Knowledge Base Verification," Topics in Expert System Design, G. Guida & C. Tasso, eds., Elsevier North-Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1989, pp353-376. [5, 20]

CHECKER

Yu, X. & Biswas, "CHECKER: An Efficient Algorithm for Knowledge-Based System Verification," Proc. of the 3rd Int. Conf. on Industrial and Engineering Applications of Artificial Intelligence and Expert Systems (IEA/AIE-90), Charleston, SC, July 1990, np. [4]

CLINT

de Raedt, L. & Bruynooghe, M., "Using Interactive Concept-Learning for Knowledge-Base Validation, Verification and Testing," Proc. of the ECAI-90 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, M. Ayel & J.-P. Laurent, eds., Stockholm, Sweden, August 1990, np. [5]

de Raedt, L., Sablon, G. & Bruynooghe, M., "Using Interactive Concept Learning for Knowledge Base Validation and Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based-Systems,"

Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, M. Ayel & J.-P. Laurant, eds, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1991, pp177-190. [4]

COCO-X

Loiseau, S., Validation, Acquisition et Mise au Point Interactive des Bases de Connaissances: Le Systeme COCO-X Fonde sur la Coherence, These de Doctorat, Universite d'Orsay, Orsay, France, 1990. [5]

Loiseau, S., "A Method for Checking and Restoring the Consistency of Rule Bases," Int. Jour. of Human-Computer Studies, 40(3), 1994, pp425-442. [4, 29]

COMMET

Canamero, D. & Geldof, S., "Modelisation et Validation dans COMMET: une Integration des Deux Approches," Actes des 4^{cs} Journees Acquisition des Connaissances, Saint Raphael, France, 1993, np. [5]

Canamero, D., Geldof, S. & McIntyre, A., "Coupling, Modeling and Validation in COMMET," Proc. of the 2nd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-93), J. Cardenosa & P. Meseguer, eds., Palma de Mallorca, Spain, March 1993, np. [5, 29]

Jonckers, V., Geldof, S. & Devroede, K., "The COMMET Methodology and Workbench in Practice," Proc. of the 5th Int. Symp. on Artificial Intelligence, Cancun, Mexico, 1992, pp341-348. [29]

McIntyre, A., COMMET Workbench Reference Manual, Vrije Universiteit Brussel, VUB AI Lab, Brussels, Belgium, 1992. [29]

CONCHE

D. Sleeman, D., Messick, S., Gray, N.A.B. & Ross, S., "An Aide for Checking the Consistency of a Theory: CONCHE," Machine and Human Learning, Y. Kodratoff & A. Hutchinson, eds., Kogan Page, London, England, 1989, pp51-52. [22]

CONKRET

Lopez, B., "CONKRET: A Tool for Refining Control Knowledge," Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, M. Ayel & J.-P. Laurant, eds, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1991, pp 191-206. [4, 26, 28, 29]

CONSDED

Barachini, F. & Adlassnig, K.P., "CONSDED: Medical Knowledge Base Consistency Checking," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-87), A. Serio, R. O'Moore, A. Tardini & F. Roger, eds., EDI Press, Rome, Italy, 1987, pp974-980. [20]

COVADIS

Rousset, M.-C., "On the Consistency of Knowledge Bases: The COVADIS System," Proc. of the 8th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-88), Munich, Germany, August 1988, pp79-84. [4, 6, 26]

Rousset, M.C., "On the Consistency of Knowledge Bases: The COVADIS System," Computational Intelligence, 4(2), 1988, pp166-170. [29]

Rousset, M.-C., "Sur la Validité des Bases de Connaissances: Le Système COVADIS," Proc of the 7th Int. Conf. on Expert Systems and Their Applications, Avignon, France, May 1987, np. [3, 20, 25]

Rousset, M.-C., Sur la Coherence et la Validation des Bases de Connaissances: Le Systeme COVADIS, These d'Etat, Universite d'Orsay, Orsay, France, September 1988. [5]

COVER

Preece, A.D., "Towards a Methodology for Evaluating Expert Systems," Expert Systems, 7(4), November 1990, pp215-223. [2, 5, 16, 20, 29]

Preece, A.D., Bell, R.D. & Suen, C.Y., "Verifying Knowledge-Based Systems Using the COVER Tool," Proc. of the 12th IFIP World Computer Congress (IFIP-92), Vol. A, Madrid, Spain, September 1992, pp231-237. [5, 9]

Preece, A.D., Bell, R.D. & Suen, C.Y., "Experiences in Using an Expert System Verification Tool," Proc. of 1991 Bell Canada Quality Engineering Workshop, Ottawa, Canada, 1991. [5]

Preece, A.D., Shinghal, R. & Batarekh, A., "Verifying Expert Systems: A Logical Framework and a Practical Tool," Expert Systems with Applications, 5(2/3), 1992, pp421-436. [5, 6, 9, 29]

COVERAGE

Preece, A. & Lamb, N., "Verifying Multi-Agent Knowledge-Based Systems Using COVERAGE," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp1-7. [8]

CSRV-CLIPS

Culbert, C. & Savely, R., "Expert System Verification and Validation," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-88 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Testing, Palo Alto, CA, August 1988, np. [4]

CT-DATAGEN

Bendou, A., "CT-DATAGEN: A Constraint-Based Test Data Generator," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, pp19-29. [5]

DERIVATION

Gamble, R.F., Roman, G.-C. & Ball, W.E., "Formal Verification of Pure Production System Programs," Proc. of the 9th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-91), Anaheim, CA, July 1991, pp329-334. [5, 20]

Gamble, R.F., Roman, G.-C. & Ball, W.E., On Extending the Application of Formal Specification and Verification Methods to Rule-Based Programming, Technical Report WUCS-91-1, Department of Computer Science, Washington University, St. Louis, MO, 1991. [5]

EFG TRANSLATOR

Becker, L.A., Green, P.G. & Bhutinager, J., Evidence Flow Graphs for Verification and Validation of Expert Systems, NASA Contractor Report 181810, nd. [4]

ESC

Cragun, B.J. & Steudel, H.J., "A Decision Table Based Processor for Checking Completeness and Consistency," Int. Jour. of Man Machine Studies, 26(5), May 1987, pp633-648. [4, 13, 16, 19, 20, 29]

EVA

Stachowitz, R.A., Chang, C.L., Stock, T.S. & Combs, J.B., "Building Validation Tools for Knowledge-Based System," Proc. of the 1st Annual Workshop on Space Operations Automation and Robotics (SOAR 87), Houston, TX, August, 1987, pp209-216. [2, 4, 5, 16]

Chang, C.L., Combs, J.B. & Stachowitz, R.A., "A Report on the Expert Systems Validation Associate (EVA)," Expert Systems with Applications, 1(3), 1990, pp217-230. [5, 6, 26, 29]

Chang, C.L., Stachowitz, R.A. & Combs, J.B., "Validation of Nonmonotonic Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 2nd IEEE Int. Conf. on Tools for Artificial Intelligence (TAI-90), A. Dollas, W.T. Tsai, & N.G. Bourbakis, eds., Washington, DC, 1990, pp776-782. [5]

Stachowitz, R.A., Combs, J.B. & Chang, C.L., "Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems: EVA," Machine Intelligence and Autonomy for Aerospace Systems, Vol. II, American Institute of Aeronautics and Astronomics, 1988, np. [5]

Stachowitz, R.A. & Combs, J.B., "Validation of Expert Systems," Proc. of the 20th Annual Hawaii Int. Conf. on System Sciences, Honolulu, HI, 1987, pp686-695. [5, 20, 29]

Stachowitz, R.A., Combs, J.B. & Chang, C.L., "Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 2nd AIAA/NASA/USAF Symp. on Automation, Robotics and Advanced Computing for the National Space Program, Report No. AIAA-87-1685, 1987, pp1-10. [5]

FEAT

French, S.W., Culbert, C. & Hamilton, D., "Experiences in Improving the State of Practice in Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-93 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, AAAI Report WS-93-05, A.D. Preece, ed., Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp78-86. [4, 29]

FFAAK

Cuda, T.V. & Dolan, C.P., "Tool Aided Non Formal Knowledge Verification," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-91 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, Anaheim, CA, July 1991, np. [4]

FIESTA

Miskell, S.G., Happell, N. & Carlisle, C., "Operational Evaluation of an Expert System: The FIESTA Approach," <u>Heuristics</u>, 2(2), Winter 1989, np. [19]

FLOCON

Kinkielele, D., <u>Sur la Verification de la Coherence des Bases de Connaissances Floues: Le Systeme FLOCON</u>, These de Doctorat, Universite de Savoie, Chambery, France, 1994. [5]

Kinkielele, D. & Ayel, M., "On Discovering Potential Inconsistencies in Validating Fuzzy Knowledge Bases," <u>Actes Congres 5e IPMU</u>, Paris, France, July 1994, pp533-539. [5, 17]

Kinkielele, D. & Ayel, M., "Un Schema Abductif pour la Verification Dynamique des Bases de Connaissances Floues," <u>Actes du 2eme CARI-94</u>, Ouagadougou, Burkina-Faso, October 1994, np. [5, 17]

Kinkielele, D. & Ayel, M.C., "Methodes de Verification des Bases de Connaissances Floues," <u>Actes du 4es Congres sur les Applications des Ensembles Flous</u>, Lille, France, December 1994, np. [5, 17]

Kinkielele, D., "Abduction Floue et Verification Dynamique des Bases de Connaissances," <u>Actes des 2eme Rencontres Nationales des Jeunes Chercheurs en Intelligence Artificielle</u>, Marseille, France, September 1994, np. [5]

Kinkielele, D., "On the Consistency of Fuzzy Knowledge Bases," <u>Proc. of the 2nd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-93)</u>, J. Cardenosa & P. Meseguer, eds., Palma de Mallorca, Spain, March 1993, pp547-561. [5]

IMVER

Coenen, F. & Dunne, P., "Verification and Validation of Rulebases Using a Binary Encoded Incidence Matrix Technique," <u>Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97)</u>, J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Coenen, F., Bench-Capon, T. & Kent, A., "A Binary Encoded Incidence Matrix Representation to Support Knowledge-Based System Verification," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-94 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, R.T. Plant, ed., Seattle, WA, July/August 1994, pp84-93. [4, 19]

IN-DEPTH II

Meseguer, P., "Expert System Validation through Knowledge Base Refinement," <u>Proc. of the 13th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-93)</u>, R. Bajcsy, ed., Chambery, France, August/September 1993, pp477-482. [5, 6, 29]

Meseguer, P., "Incremental Verification of Rule-Based Expert Systems," <u>Proc. of the 10th European Conf on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-92)</u>, B. Neumann, ed., Vienna, Austria, August 1992, pp840-844. [5, 6, 26, 29]

Meseguer, P. & Verdaguer, A., "Verification of Multi-Level Rule-Based Expert Systems: Theory and Practice," <u>Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications</u>, 6(2), 1993, pp163-192. [2, 16, 20, 26, 29]

Meseguer, P., "Verification of Multi-Level Rule-Based Expert Systems," <u>Proc. of the 9th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-91)</u>, Anaheim, CA, July 1991, pp323-328. [6, 5, 20, 26, 28, 29]

Meseguer, P., <u>Verification of Multi-Level Rule-Based Expert Systems</u>, Ph.D. Dissertation, Universitat Politecnica de Catalunya, Spain, April 1992. [14]

IRS-CBR

Terano, T. & Kobayshi, K., "Changing the Traces: Refining a Rule-Base by Genetic Algorithms," <u>Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [4]

KADS

Haouche, C.-S. & Charlet, J., "Using a KADS Inference Structure to Test a Knowledge-Based System Behaviour," <u>Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95)</u>, Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

van Harmelen, F., "Applying Rule-Based Anomalies to KADS Inference Structures," <u>Decision Support Systems</u>, 21(4), 1998, pp271-280. [30]

van Harmelen, F. & Aben, M., "Applying Rule-Base Anomalies to KADS Inference Structures," <u>Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [5]

KB-DIAGO2

Bouali, F. & Loiseau, S., "Rule Base Diagnosis for Debugging: The KB-DIAGO2 System," <u>Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95)</u>, Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

Bouali, F., Loiseau, S. & Rousset, M.-C., "Revision of Rule Bases," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10, 24]

KB-Reducer

Ginsberg, A. & Rose, L., KB-Reducer: A System that Checks for Inconsistency and Redundancy in Knowledge-Bases, Technical Report, AT&T Labs, 1987. [4]

Ginsberg, A., "A New Approach to Checking Knowledge Bases for Inconsistency and Redundancy," Proc. of the 3rd Annual Expert Systems in Government Conf., Washington, DC, 1987, pp102-111. [16, 20]

Ginsberg, A., "Knowledge-Base Reduction: A New Approach to Checking Knowledge Bases for Inconsistency and Redundancy," Proc. of the 7th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-88), August 1988, pp585-589. [5, 6, 19, 20, 26, 29]

KIV

Fensel, D. & Schönegge, A., "Specifying and Verifying Knowledge-Based Systems with KIV," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

KRAFT

Gray, P., Preece, A., Fiddian, A., Gray, W.A., Bench-Capon, T., Shave, M., Azarmi, N., Wiegand, M., et al., "KRAFT: Knowledge Fusion from Distributed Databases and Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the 8th Int. Workshop on Database and Expert System Applications (DEXA-97), Toulouse, France, September 1997, pp682-691. [9]

KRFOCL

Pazzani, M.J., "A Set Covering Approach to Testing Rule-Based Expert Systems," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-90 Workshop on Verification, Validation and Testing of Knowledge-Based Systems, Boston, MA, July 1990, np. [4]

KRUST

Craw, S. & Sleeman, D., "Automating the Refinement of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 9th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-90), L.C. Aiello, ed., Stockholm, Sweden, August 1990, pp167-172. [6]

Craw, S., Automating the Refinement of Knowledge Based Systems, Ph.D. Thesis, University of Aberdeen, Aberdeen, Scotland, 1991. [4, 22]

KVAT

Mengshoel, O.J., "KVAT: A Tool For Incremental Knowledge Validation in a Knowledge Engineering Workbench," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the

66

Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, pp133-146. [4, 5, 29]

Mengshoel, O.J. & Delab, S., "Knowledge Validation: Principles and Practice," IEEE Expert, 8(3), June 1993, pp62-68. [5, 19, 20, 29]

LBS

Stockwell, D.R.B., "Generic Predictive Systems: An Empirical Evaluation Using the Learning Base System (LBS)," Expert Systems with Applications, 12(3), 1997, pp301-310. [29]

MACK

Santos Jr., E., Banks, D.O. & Banks, S.B., "MACK: A Tool for Acquiring Consistent Knowledge Under Uncertainty," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp23-32. [8]

MELODIA

Charles, E., & Dubois, O., "MELODIA: Logical Methods for Checking Knowledge-Bases," Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, M. Ayel & J.-P. Laurant, eds, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1991, pp95-105. [4]

MILORD

Sierra, C., Agustí-Cullell, J. & Plaza, E., "Verification by Construction in MILORD," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, pp211-26. [29]

MIRLITHO

Ganascia, G., MIRLITHO: Validation Des Resultats Et Detection Des Contradictions Dans Les Systemes De Diagnostic, These de 3eme Cycle, Université de Paris-Sud, Paris, France, 1983. [5]

MVP-CA

Mehrotra, M. & Wild, C., "Multi-Viewpoint Clustering Analysis," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-93 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Report WS-93-05, A.D. Preece, ed., Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp 52-63. [4]

Mehrotra, M. & Wild, C., "Analyzing Knowledge-Based Systems with Multiviewpoint Clustering Analysis," Jour. of Systems and Software, 29(3), June 1995, pp235-249. [29]

ONCOCIN RULE CHECKER

Suwa, W., Scott, A.C. & Shortliffe, E.H., "An Approach to Verifying Completeness and Consistency in a Rule-Based Expert System," AI Magazine, 3(4), Winter 1982, pp16-21. [3, 5, 6, 16, 19, 20, 25, 26, 29]

PATH-HUNTER/PATH-TRACER

Preece, A., Grossner, C., Chander, P.G. & Radhakrishnan, T., "Structure-Based Validation of Rule-Based Systems," Data and Knowledge Engineering, 26, 1997, np. [9]

Grossner, C., Preece, A., Chander, P.G., Radhakrishnan, T. & Suen, C.Y., "Exploring the Structure of Rule-Based Systems," Proc. of the 11th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-93), Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp704-709. [6, 9, 29]

Preece, A.D., Grossner, C., Chander, P.G. & Radhakrishnan, T., "Structural Validation of Expert Systems: Experience Using a Formal Model," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-93 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Report WS-93-05, A.D. Preece, ed., Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp19-26. [4, 5]

PREPARE

Zhang, D. & Nguyen, D., "A Technique for Knowledge Base Verification," Proc. of the 1989 IEEE Int. Workshop on Tools for Artificial Intelligence, Fairfax, VA, October 1989, pp399-406.

Zhang, D. & Nguyen, D., "PREPARE: A Tool for Knowledge-Base Verification," IEEE Trans. on Knowledge and Data Engineering, 6(6), December 1994, pp983-989. [4, 29]

PROLOGA

Vanthienen, J., "Knowledge Acquisition and Validation Using a Decision Table Engineering Workbench," Proc. of the 1st World Congress on Expert Systems (WCES-91), Orlando, FL, December 1991, pp1861-1868. [4, 18]

RITCaG

Gupta, U.C. & Biegel, J., "RITCaG: A Rule-Based Intelligent Test Case Generator," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-90 Workshop on Verification, Validation and Testing of Knowledge-Based Systems, Boston, MA, July 1990, np. [4, 16, 19]

SACCO-SYCOJET

Ayel, M. & Vignollet, L., "SYCOJET: A Tool for Building Automatically Sets of Test of Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the 8th SPIE/IEEE Conf. on the Applications of Artificial Intelligence, Orlando, FL, April 1990, np. [17]

Ayel, M.C. & Laurent, J.-P., "SACCO-SYCOJET: Two Different Ways of Verifying Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the ECAI-90 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, M. Ayel & J.-P. Laurent, eds., Stockholm, Sweden, August 1990, pp62-76. [4, 5, 17]

Ayel, M.C. & Vignollet, L., "SYCOJET and SACCO: Two Tools for Verifying Expert Systems," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 6(3), 1993, pp357-382. [5, 17]

Ayel, M.C. & Vignollet, L., "A Common Approach for Verifying and Testing Knowledge-Based Systems," Artificial Intelligence and Software Engineering, J.J.P. Tsai, T. Weigert, & H.-C. Jang, eds., World Scientific Publishing Co., 1993, np. [5, 17]

SACKOOL

Talbot, S. & Ayel, M., "SACKOOL: Un Systeme de Detection des Incoherences pour une Validation des Bases de Connaissances," Actes du 4eme Congres RFIA, Paris, France, November/December 1989, pp1633-1646. [5]

Talbot, S., Verification de la Coherence dans les Systemes a Base de Conaissance avec Gestion des Exceptions, These de Doctorat, Université de Savoie, Chambéry, France, March 1991. [5]

SAVES

Smith, S. & Kandel, A., Verification and Validation of Rule-Based Expert Systems, CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL, 1993. [4, 15]

SEEK

Ginsberg, A., Weiss, S. & Politakis, P., "SEEK2: A Generalized Approach to Automatic Knowledge Base Refinement," Proc. of the 9th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-85), Los Angeles, CA, August 1985, pp367-374. [20]

ScriptGen

Shwe, M.A., Tu, S.W. & Fagan, L.M., "Validating the Knowledge Base of a Therapy Planning System," Methods of Information in Medicine, 28(1), January 1989, pp36-50. [3, 6, 19, 20, 25, 29]

SOCRATES

Traylor, B., Schwuttke, U. & Quan, A., "A Tool for Automatic Verification of Real-Time Expert Systems," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-94 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, R.T. Plant, ed., Seattle, WA, July/August 1994, pp79-83. [4, 19]

SPT

Phelps, R. & Aerts, W., "Improving Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems through Naturally Comprehensible Flow Representations," Proc. of the 2nd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-93), J. Cardenosa & P. Meseguer, eds., Palma de Mallorca, Spain, March 1993, pp295-309. [4]

SVEPOA

Prakash, G.R. & Mahabala, H.N., "SVEPOA: A Tool to Aid Verification and Validation of OPS5-Based AI Applications," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 6(2), 1993, pp193-236. [2, 16, 29]

Prakash, G.R., Subramanian, E. & Mahabala, H.N., "A Methodology for Systematic Verification of OPS5-Based AI Applications," Proc. of the 12th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-91), Sydney, Australia, August 1991, pp3-8. [5, 6]

SYSIFE

Mazas, P., "Designing Knowledge Validation through Experimentation: The SYSIFE System," Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, M. Ayel & J.-P. Laurant, eds, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1991, pp 119-145. [4]

TIMER

Pringle, M., Robins, S. & Brown, G., "TIMER: A New Objective Measure of Consultation Content and its Application to Computer Assisted Consultations," British Medical Jour, Clinical Research Edition, 293, 1986, pp20-22. [29]

TRUBAC

Barr, V., "Rule-Based Coverage Measures Applied to Testing Rule-Bases with Uncertainty," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [4]

Barr, V., "TRUBAC: A Tool for Testing Expert Systems with Rule-Base Coverage Measures," Proc, 13th Annual Pacific Northwest Software Quality Conference, Portland, OR, 1995, np.

UVT

Polat, F. & Guvenir, H.A., "UVT: A Unification-Based Tool for Knowledge Based Verification," IEEE Expert, 8(3), June 1993, pp69-75. [20]

VALENS

Spreeuwenberg, S. & Gerrits, R., "A Knowledge Based Tool to Validate and Verify an Aion Knowledge base." In Validation and Verification of Knowledge Based Systems: Theory, Tools and Practice, A. Vermesan & F. Coenen, eds., Kluwer Academic Publishers, Boston, MA, September 1999, pp67-78. [30]

Spreeuwenberg, S. & Gerrits, R., "Requirements for Successful Verification in Practice," Proc. of 15th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Pensacola Beach, FL, May 2002, pp221-225. [30]

VALID

Cardevosa, J. & Juisto, N., "General Overview of the VALID Project," Proc. of the 2nd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems

(EUROVAV-93), J. Cardenosa & P. Meseguer, eds., Palma de Mallorca, Spain, March 1993, pp53-67. [4]

ESPRIT II, Final Report: Knowledge-Based System Validation, Deliverable D12, COG/D/4.2, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, Cognitech, 1991. [26, 29]

ESPRIT II, General Formal Model, Deliverable D2, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, 1989. [28]

ESPRIT II, Knowledge-Based System Interfacing, Deliverable D7, CRI/D/3.1, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, February 1990. [28]

ESPRIT II, Quality Manual, Deliverable D8, COG/D/5.1, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, Cognitech, December 1991. [26]

ESPRIT II, The VALID Environment, Deliverable D10, CRI/D/4.3, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, 1991. [26]

ESPRIT II, Tools Identification Report, Deliverable D3, COG/D/3.2, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, December 1989. [28]

ESPRIT II, VALID: VETA Definition, Report Deliverable D4, CEAB/D/1.1, ESPRIT II Project 2148, 1990. [5, 26]

ESPRIT II, Validation Methods and Tools for Knowledge-Based Systems, Deliverable D5, CEAB/D/3.1, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, 1990. [5, 26]

ESPRIT II, Validation Methods and Tools for Knowledge-Based Systems: State of the Art, Deliverable D1, CEAB/D/1.1, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, 1989. [26, 28]

ESPRIT II, Validation Methods and Tools for Knowledge-Based Systems: Tools Description Report, Deliverable D5, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, July 1990. [28]

ESPRIT II, VETA Definition, Deliverable D4, CEAB/D/1.1, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, 1990. [28]

ESPRIT II, VETA Implementation, Deliverable D6, CEAB/D/4, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, February 1991. [26, 28]

Lopez De Mantaras, R., Kerdiles, P. & Larsen, H., "Validation Methods and Tools for Knowledge-Based Systems: The VALID Project," Proc. of the 3rd Int. GI-Kongress, Springer-Verlag, 1989, np. [5]

Meseguer, P. & Plaza, E., "Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems: The VALID Project," Enhancing the Knowledge Engineering Process, L. Steels & B. LePape, eds., North-Holland Elsevier, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1992, np. [29]

Meseguer, P. & Plaza, E., "The VALID Project: Goals, Development, and Results," Int. Jour. of Intelligent Systems, 9(9), 1994, pp867-892. [30]

UPM VALID Team, Comparative Analysis of the VALID-KEE Environment, UPM/W/7/TK2/1, VALID Project Library. April, 1991. [26]

UPM VALID Team, Integration of Any Knowledge-Based System Shell with VETA (Methodology Task), UPM/WP/TASK9/TM/1, VALID Project Library. August, 1991. [28]

VALIDATOR

Kang, Y. & Bahill, T., "A Tool for Detecting Expert System Errors," AI Expert, 5(2), February 1990, pp42-51. [4, 16, 19, 29]

VASTT

Steib, M., Small, R. & Castells-Schofield, C., "Tailoring VASTT for Expert System Verification, Validation and Testing," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-91 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, Anaheim, CA, July 1991, np. [4]

VERITAS

Santos, J., Faria, L., Ramos, C. & Vale, Z.A., "VERITAS - A Verification Tool for Real-Time Applications in Power System Control Centers," Proc. of 12th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 1999, pp511-513. [30]

VITAL

Rouge, A., Lapicque, J.Y., Brossier, F. & Lozinguez, Y., "Validation and Verification of KADS Data and Domain Knowledge," Proc. of the 2nd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-93), J. Cardenosa & P. Meseguer, eds., Palma de Mallorca, Spain, March 1993, pp69-83. [4]

ViVa

Hollnagel, E., "ViVa: A Systematic Approach to Verification, Improvement and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," Future Generation Computer Systems, 9(4), 1993, pp371-378. [5, 20]

VORTEX

Cross, S. & Grisoni, M., "VORTEX: A Methodology for Producing Validated Real-Time Expert Systems," Proc. of the NATO Conf. on Knowledge-Based Systems, Applications for Guidance and Control, N. 474. NATO Advisory Group for Aerospace Research and Development, The Hague, Belgium, 1990, np. [5]

Grisoni, M. & Bentley, P., "VORTEX - Tools and Techniques for Knowledge Base Validation," Logica, 1992, np. [5]

VSE

Hutter, D., Langenstein, G., Rock, G., Siekmann, J., Stephan, W. & Vogt, R., "Formal Software Development in the Verification Support Environment (VSE)," Jour. of Experimental & Theoretical Artificial Intelligence, 12(4), 2000, pp383-406. [30]

Hutter, D., Langenstein, B., Sengler, C., Siekmann, J.H., Stephan, W. & Wolpers, A., "Verification Support Environment (VSE),", High Integrity Systems, 1(6), 1996, pp523-530. [30]

Hutter, D., Rock, G., Siekmann, J.H., Stephan, W. & Vogt, R., "Formal Software Development in the Verification Support Environment (VSE)," Proc. of 13th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 2000, pp367-376. [30]

Nonnengart, A., Rock, G. & Stephan, W., "Using Hybrid Automata to Express Realtime Properties in VSE-II," Proc. of the 14th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Key West, FL, May 2001, pp640-644. [30]

VVR

Zlatareva, N., "VVR: A Uniform Framework for Expert System Knowledge Bases Verification, Validation and Refinement," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-91 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, Anaheim, CA, July 1991, np. [4]

Zlatareva, N.P., "A Framework for Knowledge-Based System Verification, Validation and Refinement: The VVR System," Proc. of the 5th Florida Artificial Intelligence Symp., Ft. Lauderdale, FL, April 1992, pp10-14. [7, 29]

WRAPPINGS

Bellman, K.L. & Landauer, C., "The Modelling Issues Inherent in Testing and Evaluating Knowledge-Based Systems," Expert Systems with Applications, 1(3), 1990, pp199-216. [4, 6, 29]

OTHER TOOLS

Ayel, M. & Talbot, S., "Un Système de Détection des Incohèrences pour la Validatiuon des Bases de Connaissances," Actes du 4[cmc] Congres RFIA, Paris, France, November/December 1989, pp415-430. [17]

Bahill, A.T., Jafar, M. & Moller, R.F., "Tools for Extracting Knowledge and Validating Expert Systems," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, 18(2), 1986, pp857-862. [16, 19, 20]

Barbaliscia, F., Masullo, P.G. & Fornari, M., "Software Package for the Performance Evaluation of Satellite Communications Systems with Adaptive Allocation of On-Board Common Source," IEEE Trans. on Communications, 40(6), 1992, p1003. [29]

Clyman, J.I. & Miller, P.L., "An Environment for Building and Testing Advice-Giving Systems in Medicine," Proc. of the 14th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-90), Washington, DC, November 1990, pp584-588. [20]

Conrath, D.W. & Sharma, R.S., "Toward a Diagnostic Instrument for Assessing the Quality of Expert Systems," Data Base, Winter 1992, pp37-43. [20]

Mars, N.J.I. & Miller, P.L., "Knowledge Acquisition and Verification Tools for Medical Expert Systems," Medical Decision Making, 7(1), 1987, pp6-11. [3, 20, 25]

Petitjean, S., Brunessaux, L. & Vaudet, J.-P., "Three Pragmatic Tools for the Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification

and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, pp111-123. [5, 26, 29]

Preece, A., "Specifications and Tools for Building Reliable Expert Systems," Int. Jour. of Software Engineering and Knowledge Engineering, 3(1), 1993, pp17-52. [9]

Preece, A., Talbot, A. & Vignollet, L., "Evaluation of Verification Tools for Knowledge-Based Systems," Int. Jour. of Human-Computer Studies, 47, 1997, np. [9]

Salecker, D., "Validation Manager - An Assistant for a Test Case Based Evaluation of AI Systems," Proc. of the Int. Workshop on Aspects of Intelligent Systems Validation, Ilmenau, Germany, January 1998, pp71-77. [30]

Salecker, D. & Knauf, R., "Validation Manager: A Tool for AI Systems' Evaluation by a Turing Test - Like Methodology," Proc. of 12th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 1999, pp531-535. [30]

Snyder, W. & Schmolze, J.G., "A Tool for Testing Confluence of Production Rules," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [29]

Vanthienen, J. & Dries, E., "Illustration of a Decision Table Tool for Specifying and Implementing Knowledge-Based Systems," Int. Jour. on Artificial Intelligence Tools, 3(2), 1994, pp267-288. [18]

Vanthienen, J. & Dries, E., "Illustration of a Decision Table Tool for Specifying and Implementing Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc of the 5th Int. Conf. on Tools for Artificial Intelligence (TAI-93), Boston, MA, November 1993, pp198-205. [19]

Vanthienen, J., "Knowledge Acquisition and Validation Using a Decision Table Engineering Workbench," Proc. of the 1st World Congress on Expert Systems (WCES-91), Orlando, FL, December 1991, pp1861-1868. [4, 18]

Vanthienen, J., Mues, C., Wets, G. & Delaere, K., "A Tool-Supported Approach to Inter-Tabular Verification," Proc. of the 4th World Congress on Expert Systems (WCES-98), Mexico City, Mexico, 1998, pp347-354. [18]

Vanthienen, J., Mues, C., Wets, G. & Delaere, K., A Tool-Supported Approach to Inter-Tabular Verification, Research Report 9739, K.U.Leuven, T.E.W., 1997. [18]

SPECIFIC V&V PROBLEMS

Knowledge Integration Problems

Completeness/Coverage

Antoniou, G. & Langetepe, E., "Soundness and Completeness of a Logic Programming Approach to Default Logic," Proc. of the 12th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-94), MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 1994, pp934-939. [21]

Barr, V., "Rule-Based Coverage Measures Applied to Testing Rule-Bases with Uncertainty," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [4]

Barr, V., Applications of Rule-Base Coverage Measures to Expert System Evaluation, Rutgers University Technical Report DCS-TR-340, 1996.

Barr, V., "Applications of Rule-Base Coverage Measures to Expert System Evaluation, Knowledge Based Systems, 12, 1999, pp27-35.

Cornelissen, F., Jonker, C. & Treur, J., "Compositional Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems: A Case Study in Diagnostic Reasoning," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Cragun, B.J. & Steudel, H.J., "A Decision Table Based Processor for Checking Completeness and Consistency," Int. Jour. of Man Machine Studies, 26(5), May 1987, pp633-648. [4, 13, 16, 19, 20, 29]

Gamble, R.F., "Achieving Comprehensiveness in Verifying Hybrid Systems," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp63-65. [8]

Ligeza, A., "Logical Analysis of Completeness of Rule-Based Systems with Dual Resolution," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Lounis, R. & Ayel, M., "Completeness of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, pp31-46. [5, 17]

Marek, W., "Completeness and Consistency in Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 1st Int. Conf. on Expert Database Systems, Charleston, SC, 1986, pp119-126. [16]

Nguyen, T.A., Perkins, W.A., Laffey, T.J. & Pecora, D., "Checking an Expert System Knowledge Base for Consistency and Completeness," Proc. of the 9th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-85), Los Angeles, CA, August 1985, pp375-378. [2, 5, 16, 20, 26, 29]

Preece, A., "A New Approach to Detecting Missing Knowledge in Expert System Rule Bases," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 38, 1993, pp161-181. [9]

Shapiro, A.R., "Estimation of Knowledge Base Coverage from the Sample Accrual Rate," Proc. of the World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-86), R. Salamon, B. Blum, M. Jorgensen, eds., North Holland Publishing Co., Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1986, pp71-75. [20]

Suwa, W., Scott, A.C. & Shortliffe, E.H., "An Approach to Verifying Completeness and Consistency in a Rule-Based Expert System," AI Magazine, 3(4), Winter 1982, pp16-21. [3, 5, 6, 16, 19, 20, 25, 26, 29]

Suwa, W., Scott, A.C. & Shortliffe, E.H., "Completeness and Consistency in a Rule Based System," Rule-Based Expert Systems, B.G. Buchanan, ed., Addison-Wesley, Reading, MA, 1985, np. [20]

Valiente, G.A., "Using Layered Support Graphs for Verifying External Adequacy in Rule-Based Expert Systems," SIGART Bulletin, 3(1), January 1992, pp20-24. [19]

Consistency/Coherence

Assemat, C. & Bonnet, A., "Conceptualisation, Coherence et Validation d'une Base de Connaissances," Proc. of the 6th Int. Conf. on Expert Systems and Their Applications, Avignon, France, April 1986, pp299-320. [5]

Ayel, M. & Laurent, J.-P., "Coherence Checking for Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 8th Int. Congress of Cybernetics and Systems, New York, NY, June 1990, pp11-15. [17]

Ayel, M. & Laurent, J.-P., "Coherence Testing of Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the 7th SPIE/IEEE Conf. on the Applications of Artificial Intelligence, Orlando, FL, March 1989, pp994-1007. [17]

Ayel, M. & Laurent, J.-P., "Off-Line Coherence Checking for Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the IJCAI-89 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, Detroit, MI, August 1989, np. [17]

Ayel, M. & Rousset, M.C., "La Cohèrence dans les Bases de Connaissances," Cepadues Editions, September 1990. [17]

Ayel, M. & Talbot, S., "Un Système de Dètection des Incohèrences pour la Validatiuon des Bases de Connaissances," Actes du 4^{cme} Congres RFIA, Paris, France, November/December 1989, pp415-430. [17]

Ayel, M., "A Conceptual Model for Consistency of Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the Conf. on Artificial Intelligence Methodology, Systems and Applications (AIMSA-88),T. O'Shea & V. Sgurev, eds., Varna, Italy, September 1988, pp75-82. [17]

Ayel, M., "L'Incohérence dans les Bases de Connaissances," Proc. of the Colloque International d'Intelligence Artificielle, Marseille, France, December 1986, pp293-312. [17]

Ayel, M., Talbot, S. & Laurent, J.-P., "Acquisition, Consistency and Exceptions," Proc. of the IJCAI-91 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, August 1991, np. [17]

Ayel, M.C., "Protocols for Consistency Checking in Expert System Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the 8th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-88), Munich, Germany, August 1988, pp220-225. [6, 17, 20, 29]

Barachini, F. & Adlassnig, K.P., "CONSDED: Medical Knowledge Base Consistency Checking," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-87), A. Serio, R. O'Moore, A. Tardini & F. Roger, eds., EDI Press, Rome, Italy, 1987, pp974-980. [20]

Bezem, M., Consistency of Rule-Based Expert Systems, Report CS-R8736, Centre for Mathematics and Computer Science, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, nd. [20]

Cragun, B.J. & Steudel, H.J., "A Decision Table Based Processor for Checking Completeness and Consistency," Int. Jour. of Man Machine Studies, 26(5), May 1987, pp633-648. [4, 13, 16, 19, 20, 29]

D. Sleeman, D., Messick, S., Gray, N.A.B. & Ross, S., "An Aide for Checking the Consistency of a Theory: CONCHE," Machine and Human Learning, Y. Kodratoff & A. Hutchinson, eds., Kogan Page, London, England, 1989, pp51-52. [22]

Fontaine, D., Le Beux, P., Strauss, A. & Morizet, P., "An Approach for Maintaining the Coherence in a Medical Knowledge Base," Proc. of the 5th World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-89), B. Barber, C. Dexian, Q. Dulie & G. Wagner, eds., Singapore, Elsevier North Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1989, pp44-48. [20]

Ganascia, G., MIRLITHO: Validation Des Resultats Et Detection Des Contradictions Dans Les Systemes De Diagnostic, These de 3eme Cycle, Universite de Paris-Sud, Paris, France, 1983. [5]

Ginsberg, A. & Rose, L., KB-Reducer: A System that Checks for Inconsistency and Redundancy in Knowledge-Bases, Technical Report, AT&T Labs, 1987. [4]

Ginsberg, A., "A New Approach to Checking Knowledge Bases for Inconsistency and Redundancy," Proc. of the 3rd Annual Expert Systems in Government Conf., Washington, DC, 1987, pp102-111. [16, 20]

Ginsberg, A., "Knowledge-Base Reduction: A New Approach to Checking Knowledge Bases for Inconsistency and Redundancy," Proc. of the 7th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-88), August 1988, pp585-589. [5, 6, 19, 20, 26, 29]

Giuse, D., Giuse, N. & Miller, R., "Consistency Enforcement in Medical Knowledge Base Construction," Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 5, 1993, pp245-252. [29]

Kinkielele, D. & Ayel, M., "On Discovering Potential Inconsistencies in Validating Fuzzy Knowledge Bases," Actes Congres 5e IPMU, Paris, France, July 1994, pp533-539. [5, 17]

Kinkielele, D., "On the Consistency of Fuzzy Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the 2nd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-93), J. Cardenosa & P. Meseguer, eds., Palma de Mallorca, Spain, March 1993, pp547-561. [5]

Kinkielele, D., "Un Modele Conceptuel pour la Verification de la Coherence des Bases de Connaissances Floues," Actes des 1^{ier} Journees Validation des Systemes a Base de Connaissances (JVAL-92), Dourdan, France, April 1992, np. [5]

Kinkielele, D., "Validation des Bases de Connaissances Floues: Detection des Inconsistances Potentielles," Actes du 9eme Congres RFIA, Paris, France, January 1994, pp1681-1687. [5]

Kinkielele, D., Sur la Verification de la Coherence des Bases de Connaissances Floues: Le Systeme FLOCON, These de Doctorat, Universite de Savoie, Chambéry, France, 1994. [5]

Kleine-Büning, H., Löwen, U. & Schmitgen, S., "Inconsistency of Production Systems," Data and Knowledge Engineering, 3, 1988/89, pp245-260. [20]

Lee, S. & O'Keefe, R., "Subsumption Anomalies in Hybrid Knowledge Bases," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 6(3), 1993, pp299-320. [29]

Loiseau, S. & Rousset, M.-C., "Formal Verification of Knowledge Bases Focused on Consistency: Two Experiments Based on ATMS Techniques," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 6(3), 1993, np. [5]

Loiseau, S., "A Method for Checking and Restoring the Consistency of Rule Bases," Int. Jour. of Human-Computer Studies, 40(3), 1994, pp425-442. [4, 29]

Loiseau, S., Validation, Acquisition et Mise au Point Interactive des Bases de Connaissances: Le Systeme COCO-X Fonde sur la Coherence, These de Doctorat, Université d'Orsay, Orsay, France, 1990. [5]

Marek, W., "Completeness and Consistency in Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 1st Int. Conf. on Expert Database Systems, Charleston, SC, 1986, pp119-126. [16]

Meseguer, P., "A New Method to Checking Rule Bases for Inconsistency: A Petri Net Approach," Proc. of the 9th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-90), L.C. Aiello, ed., Stockholm, Sweden, August 1990, pp437-442. [26, 28, 29]

Meseguer, P., "Inconsistency Checking in Rule-Based Expert Systems with Uncertainty and Control Features," Proc. of the 5th Int. Symp. on Methodologies for Intelligent Systems, M.L. Emrich, M.S. Phifer, B. Huber, M. Zemankova & Z.W. Ras, eds., Knoxville, TN, ICAIT, 1990, pp83-92. [28]

Nguyen, T.A., "Verifying Consistency of Production Systems," Proc. of the 3rd IEEE Conf. on Artificial Intelligence Applications (CAIA-87), Kissimmee, FL, February 1987, pp4-8. [2, 11, 16, 29]

Nguyen, T.A., Perkins, W.A., Laffey, T.J. & Pecora, D., "Checking an Expert System Knowledge Base for Consistency and Completeness," Proc. of the 9th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-85), Los Angeles, CA, August 1985, pp375-378. [2, 5, 16, 20, 26, 29]

Nonfjall, H. & Larsen, H.L., "Detection of Potential Inconsistencies in Knowledge Bases," Int. Jour. of Intelligent Systems, 6, 1991, np. [26, 28, 29]

Ramaswamy, M. & Sarkar, S., "Global Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems via Local Verification of Partitions," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Rousset, M.-C., "On the Consistency of Knowledge Bases: The COVADIS System," Proc. of the 8th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-88), Munich, Germany, August 1988, pp79-84. [4, 6, 26]

Rousset, M.C., "On the Consistency of Knowledge Bases: The COVADIS System," Computational Intelligence, 4(2), 1988, pp166-170. [29]

Rousset, M.-C., Sur la Coherence et la Validation des Bases de Connaissances: Le Systeme COVADIS, These d'Etat, Université d'Orsay, Orsay, France, September 1988. [5]

Santos J., E., Banks, D.O. & Banks, S.B., "MACK: A Tool for Acquiring Consistent Knowledge Under Uncertainty," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp23-32. [8]

Santos, J., E., Banks, S.B., Brown, S.M. & Bawcom, D.J., "Identify and Handling Structural Incompleteness for Validation of Probalistic Knowledge-Bases," Proc. of 12th

Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 1999, pp506-510. [30]

Sinz, C., Kaiser, A. & Kuechlin, W., "Detection of Inconsistencies in Complex Product Configuration Data Using Extended Propositional SAT-Checking," Proc. of the 14th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Key West, FL, May 2001, pp645-649. [30]

Snyder, W. & Schmolze, J.G., "A Tool for Testing Confluence of Production Rules," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [29]

Snyder, W. & Schmolze, J.G., "A Tool for Testing Confluence of Production Rules," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [29]

Suwa, W., Scott, A.C. & Shortliffe, E.H., "An Approach to Verifying Completeness and Consistency in a Rule-Based Expert System," AI Magazine, 3(4), Winter 1982, pp16-21. [3, 5, 6, 16, 19, 20, 25, 26, 29]

Suwa, W., Scott, A.C. & Shortliffe, E.H., "Completeness and Consistency in a Rule Based System," Rule-Based Expert Systems, B.G. Buchanan, ed., Addison-Wesley, Reading, MA, 1985, np. [20]

Talbot, S. & Ayel, M., "Consistency and Rules Subject to Exceptions," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, pp69-75. [17]

Talbot, S. & Ayel, M., "SACKOOL: Un Systeme de Detection des Incoherences pour une Validation des Bases de Connaissances," Actes du 4eme Congres RFIA, Paris, France, November/December 1989, pp1633-1646. [5]

Talbot, S., Verification de la Coherence dans les Systemes a Base de Conaissance avec Gestion des Exceptions, These de Doctorat, Université de Savoie, Chambéry, France, March 1991. [5]

Yager, R.R. & Larsen, H.L., "On Discovering Potential Inconsistencies in Validating Knowledge Bases by Reflecting on the Input," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, 21, 1991, np. [5]

Yager, R.R. & Larsen, H.L., "On Discovering Potential Inconsistencies in Validating Uncertain Knowledge Bases by Reflecting on the Input," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-91 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, Anaheim, CA, July 1991, np. [26, 28, 29]

Wendler, B. & Ayel, M.C., "Verifying Coherence in Modular Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, pp173-187. [5, 17]

Correctness/Accuracy/Soundness

Antoniou, G. & Langetepe, E., "Soundness and Completeness of a Logic Programming Approach to Default Logic," Proc. of the 12th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-94), MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 1994, pp934-939. [21]

Antoniou, G., "Modularity and Correctness for Logic Programs and Knowledge Bases," Int. Jour. of Software Engineering and Knowledge Engineering, 4(2), 1994, pp257-275. [21]

Antoniou, G., "Verification and Correctness Issues for Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, pp141-154. [5, 21]

Antoniou, G., "Verification and Correctness Issues for Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases," Int. Jour. of Intelligent Systems, 12(10), 1997, pp725-738. [21]

Feldman, M. & Barnett, G., "An Approach to Evaluating the Accuracy of DXplain," Computer Programs and Methods in Biomedicine, 35, 1991, pp261-66. [29]

Fox, J., "On the Soundness and Safety of Expert Systems," Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 5, 1993, pp159-79. [29]

Heckerman, D. & Nathwani, B., "An Evaluation of the Diagnostic Accuracy of PATHFINDER," Computers and Biomedical Research, 25, 1992, pp56-74. [29]

Landauer, C., "Correctness Principles for Rule-Based Expert Systems," Expert Systems with Applications, 1(3), 1990, pp291-316. [29]

Levi, K., "Expert Systems Should Be More Accurate than Human Experts: Evaluation Procedures from Human Judgement and Decision Making," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, 19(3), May/June 1989, pp647-657. [20, 29]

Nazareth, D.L., An Analysis of Techniques for Verification of Logical Correctness in Rule Based Systems, Ph.D. Dissertation, Department of Managerial Studies, Case Western Reserve University, January 1988. [12, 14]

O'Leary, D.E., "The Relationship between Errors and Size and between Different Types of Errors in Expert Systems," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, February 1996, pp171-185. [23]

Phelps, C. & Hutson, A., "Estimating Diagnostic Test Accuracy Using a 'Fuzzy Gold Standard'," Medical Decision Making, 15, 1995, pp44-57. [29]

Sutton, G., "How Accurate Is Computer-Aided Diagnosis?" Lancet, 334(2), 1989, pp905-908. [29]

Swets, J., "Measuring the Accuracy of Diagnostic Systems," Science, 240, 1988, pp1285-1293. [29]

Todd, B.S., "Idempotency as a Correctness Property of Rule Bases," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

Wied, G., Bartels, P., Bibbo, M. et al., "Computer Recognition of Ectocervical Cells: Classification Accuracy and Spatial Resolution," Acta. Cytology, 21, 1977, pp753-764. [29]

Heterogeneous/Competing Knowledge

O'Leary, D.E. & Brown, C., "Validating Heterogeneous and Competing Knowledge Bases Using a Blackbox Approach," Expert Systems with Applications, 9(4), 1995, pp591-598. [16, 23]

O'Leary, D.E., "Validation of Computational Models Based on Multiple Heterogeneous Knowledge Sources," Computational and Mathematical Organization Theory, 3(2), Summer 1997, pp75-90. [23]

Integrity

Agarwal, R. & Tanniru, M., "A Petri-Net Based Approach for Verifying the Integrity of Production Systems," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 36(3), 1992, pp447-468. [12, 16, 19]

Antoniou, G., "Integrity and Rule Checking in Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, pp22-28. [21]

Antoniou, G., "Integrity and Rule Checking in Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases," Knowledge-Based Systems, 9, 1996, pp301-306. [21]

van Someren, M., "Structural and Formative Validation of Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, pp103-108. [5]

Redundancy

Ginsberg, A. & Rose, L., KB-Reducer: A System that Checks for Inconsistency and Redundancy in Knowledge-Bases, Technical Report, AT&T Labs, 1987. [4]

Ginsberg, A., "A New Approach to Checking Knowledge Bases for Inconsistency and Redundancy," Proc. of the 3rd Annual Expert Systems in Government Conf., Washington, DC, 1987, pp102-111. [16, 20]

Ginsberg, A., "Knowledge-Base Reduction: A New Approach to Checking Knowledge Bases for Inconsistency and Redundancy," Proc. of the 7th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-88), August 1988, pp585-589. [5, 6, 19, 20, 26, 29]

Schmolze, J.G. & Snyder, W., "Detecting Redundant Production Rules," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, np. [8]

Knowledge Type Problems

Fuzzy Knowledge

Chen, G., Vanthienen, J. & Wets, G., "Using Fuzzy Decision Tables to Build Valid Intelligent Systems," Proc. of the 6th Int. Fuzzy Systems Association World Congress (IFSA-95), Sao Paulo, Brazil, July 1995, np. [18]

Dubois, D. & Prade, H., "On the Validation of Fuzzy Knowledge Bases," Fuzzy Reasoning in Information, Decision and Control Systems, S. Tzafestas, ed., Kluwer Academic Publishers, 1993, np. [5]

Kinkielele, D. & Ayel, M., "On Discovering Potential Inconsistencies in Validating Fuzzy Knowledge Bases," Actes Congres 5e IPMU, Paris, France, July 1994, pp533-539. [5, 17]

Kinkielele, D. & Ayel, M., "Un Schema Abductif pour la Verification Dynamique des Bases de Connaissances Floues," Actes du 2ᶜᵐᵉ CARI-94, Ouagadougou, Burkina-Faso, October 1994, np. [5, 17]

Kinkielele, D. & Ayel, M.C., "Methodes de Verification des Bases de Connaissances Floues," Actes du 4ᶜˢ Congres sur les Applications des Ensembles Flous, Lille, France, December 1994, np. [5, 17]

Kinkielele, D., "Abduction Floue et Verification Dynamique des Bases de Connaissances," Actes des 2ᶜᵐᵉ Rencontres Nationales des Jeunes Chercheurs en Intelligence Artificielle, Marseille, France, September 1994, np. [5]

Kinkielele, D., "On the Consistency of Fuzzy Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the 2nd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-93), J. Cardenosa & P. Meseguer, eds., Palma de Mallorca, Spain, March 1993, pp547-561. [5]

Kinkielele, D., "Un Modele Conceptuel pour la Verification de la Coherence des Bases de Connaissances Floues," Actes des 1ⁱᶜʳ Journees Validation des Systemes a Base de Connaissances (JVAL-92), Dourdan, France, April 1992, np. [5]

Kinkielele, D., "Validation des Bases de Connaissances Floues: Detection des Inconsistances Potentielles," Actes du 9ᶜᵐᶜ Congres RFIA, Paris, France, January 1994, pp1681-1687. [5]

Kinkielele, D., Sur la Verification de la Coherence des Bases de Connaissances Floues: Le Systeme FLOCON, These de Doctorat, Universite de Savoie, Chambéry, France, 1994. [5]

Leitich, H., Adlassnig, K.P. & Kolarz, G., "Development and Evaluation of Fuzzy Criteria for the Diagnosis of Rheumatoid Arthritis," Methods of Information in Medicine, 35(4-5), 1996, pp334-342. [29]

Soula, G., Thirion, X., Gullana, J.-M., Navez, J., Vialettes, B., San Marco, J.-L. & Ledoray, V., "Une Validation Multicentrique du Système Expert PROTIS," Proc of the 7th Int. Conf. on Expert Systems and Their Applications, Avignon, France, May 1987, np. [3, 20, 25]

Soula, G., Thirion, X., San Marco, J.L., Vialettes, B., Guliana, J., Navez, I., "A Multi-Centered Validation of the Fuzzy Expert System PROTIS," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-88), R. Hansen & B.G. Solheim, R.R. O'Moore & F. Roger, eds., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1988, pp647-651. [3, 20, 25]

Vanthienen, J. & Wets, G., "Fuzzy Decision Tables: Modeling and V&V Issues," Proc. of the ECAI-94 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, August 1994, pp36-40. [18]

Viaene, S. & Wets, G., "A Synthesis of Fuzzy Rule-Based System Verification," Proc. of the 7th IEEE Int. Conf. on Fuzzy Systems (FUZZ-IEEE-98), Anchorage, AK, May 1998, pp985-990. [18]

Viaene, S., Wets, G. & Vanthienen, J., A Synthesis of Fuzzy Rule-Based System Verification, Research Report 9738, K.U.Leuven, T.E.W., 1997. [18]

Incomplete Knowledge

Heckerling, P., Elstein, A., Terzian, C. et al., "The Effect of Incomplete Knowledge on the Diagnosis of a Computer Consultant System," Medical Informatics, 16, 1991, pp363-370. [29]

Preece, A.D., Grossner, C. & Radhakrishnan, T., "Validating Rule-Based Systems that Operate with Incomplete Data," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5, 9]

Sleeman, D., Craw, S., Ellery, I., Sharma, S. & Edwards, P., "Machine Learning, Knowledge-Base Refinement and Knowledge Acquisition: Systems Which Cope with Incomplete and Inconsistent Knowledge-Bases," Proc. of the 5th European Knowledge Acquisition Workshop (EKAW 91), M. Lister & B.R. Gaines, eds., GMD Studien Nr. 211, Crieff, Scotland, 1992, pp332-342. [22]

Inconsistent Knowledge

Ayel, M., Talbot, S. & Laurent, J.-P., "Acquisition, Consistency and Exceptions," Proc. of the IJCAI-91 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, August 1991, np. [17]

Kleine-Büning, H., Löwen, U. & Schmitgen, S., "Inconsistency of Production Systems," Data and Knowledge Engineering, 3, 1988/89, pp245-260. [20]

Rousset, M.C., "On the Consistency of Knowledge Bases: The COVADIS System," Computational Intelligence, 4(2), 1988, pp166-170. [29]

Sleeman, D., Craw, S., Ellery, I., Sharma, S. & Edwards, P., "Machine Learning, Knowledge-Base Refinement and Knowledge Acquisition: Systems Which Cope with Incomplete and Inconsistent Knowledge-Bases," Proc. of the 5th European Knowledge Acquisition Workshop (EKAW 91), M. Lister & B.R. Gaines, eds., GMD Studien Nr. 211, Crieff, Scotland, 1992, pp332-342. [22]

Talbot, S. & Ayel, M., "Consistency and Rules Subject to Exceptions," <u>Proc. of the 1st</u> <u>European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems</u> <u>(EUROVAV-91)</u>, M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, pp69-75. [17]

Talbot, S. & Ayel, M., "Programmation par Objets: Construction Itèrative des Taxinomies en Gèrant Explicitement les Exceptions," <u>Le Gènie Logiciel et Ses</u> <u>Applications</u>, Dècember 1991, np. [17]

Talbot, S., <u>Verification de la Coherence dans les Systemes a Base de Conaissance avec</u> <u>Gestion des Exceptions</u>, These de Doctorat, Université de Savoie, Chambéry, France, March 1991. [5]

Large Knowledge Bases

Enand, R., Kahn, G.S. & Mills, R.A., "A Methodology for Validating Large Knowledge Bases," <u>Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies</u>, 33, 1990, pp361-371. [5, 20]

Giuse, D.A., Giuse, N.B. & Miller, R.A., "Evaluation of Long-Term Maintenance of a Large Medical Knowledge Base," <u>JAMIA</u>, 2, 1995, pp297-306. [29]

Gonzalez, A.J., Gupta, U. & Chianese, R.B., "Performance Evaluation of a Large Diagnostic Expert System Using a Heuristic Test Case Generator," <u>Engineering</u> <u>Applications of Artificial Intelligence</u>, 9(3), 1996, pp275-284. [7]

O'Neil, M. & Glowinski, A., "Evaluating and Validating Very Large Knowledge-Based Systems," <u>Medical Informatics</u>, 15(3), July-September 1990, pp237-252. [7, 20, 29]

Ribar, G., Arcoleo, F. & Hollo, D., "Loan Probe: Testing a BIG Expert System," <u>AI</u> <u>Expert</u>, 6(5), May 1991, pp43. [20]

Soloway, E., Bachant, J. & Jensen, K., "Assessing the Maintainability of XCON-in-RIME: Coping with the Problem of a Very Large Rule Base," <u>Proc. of the 6th National</u> <u>Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-87)</u>, 1987, pp824-829. [6, 29]

Modular Knowledge

Amla, N. & Ammann, P., "Using Z Specifications in Category Partition Testing," <u>Proc.</u> <u>of the 7th Annual IEEE Conf. on Computer Assurance, Systems Integrity, Software</u> <u>Safety, Process Security (COMPASS-92)</u>, June 1992, Gaithersburg, MD, np. [19]

Antoniou, G. & Sperschneider, V., "On the Verification of Modular Logical Knowledge Bases," <u>Expert Systems with Applications</u>, 8(3), 1995, pp351-357. [21]

Antoniou, G. & Sperschneider, V., "On the Verification of Modules," <u>Proc. of the 1989</u> <u>Conf. on Computer Science Logic</u>, LNCS 440, Springer-Verlag, 1989, pp16-35. [21]

Antoniou, G., "Modularity and Correctness for Logic Programs and Knowledge Bases," <u>Int. Jour. of Software Engineering and Knowledge Engineering</u>, 4(2), 1994, pp257-275. [21]

Antoniou, G., "Module Concepts for Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases," <u>Workshop</u> <u>Notes of the AAAI-96 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based</u> <u>Systems and Subsystems</u>, Portland, ME, August 1996, pp101-108. [21]

Antoniou, G., "Modules and Verification," The Computation Laboratory, C. Rattray & R.G. Clark, eds., Oxford University Press, Oxford, UK, 1992, pp353-366. [21]

Antoniou, G., "The Verification of Modules," Formal Aspects of Computing, 6, 1994, pp223-244. [21]

Botton, N., Kusiak, A. & Raz, T., "Knowledge Bases: Integration, Verification, and Partitioning," European Jour. of Operational Research, 42, 1989, pp111-128. [19]

Leemans, P., On the Verification of Knowledge in Expert System Modules, Master's Thesis, Department of Mathematics & Computer Science, Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1993. [5]

Leemans, P., Treur, J. & Willems, M., On the Verification of Knowledge-Based Reasoning Modules, Technical Report IR-346, Department of Mathematics & Computer Science, AI Group, Vrije Universiteit, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1993. [5]

Ramaswamy, M. & Sarkar, S., "Global Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems via Local Verification of Partitions," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Vanthienen, J., Mues, C., Aerts, A. & Wets, G., "A Modularization Approach to the Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, pp96-102. [18]

Wendler, B. & Ayel, M.C., "Verifying Coherence in Modular Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, pp173-187. [5, 17]

Wendler, B. & Vignollet, L., "Verification of Modular Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the ECAI-94 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, August 1994, np. [5]

Wendler, B., "Calcul de Labels pour des Bases de Connaissances Modulaires," 2es Rencontres Nationales des Jeunes Chercheurs en IA, Marseille, France, September 1994, p308. [5]

Wendler, B., Vignollet, L.& Talbot, S., "Computing Partial Labels in Knowledge-Based System Validation Tools," Proc. of the 2nd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-93), J. Cardenosa & P. Meseguer, eds., Palma de Mallorca, Spain, March 1993, pp129-141. [5]

Multi-Level Knowledge

Ligeza, A., "Logical Analysis of Completeness of Rule-Based Systems with Dual Resolution," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Meseguer, P. & Verdaguer, A., "Verification of Multi-Level Rule-Based Expert Systems: Theory and Practice," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 6(2), 1993, pp163-192. [2, 16, 20, 26, 29]

Meseguer, P., "Verification of Multi-Level Rule-Based Expert Systems," Proc. of the 9th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-91), Anaheim, CA, July 1991, pp323-328. [6, 5, 20, 26, 28, 29]

Meseguer, P., Verification of Multi-Level Rule-Based Expert Systems, Ph.D. Dissertation, Universitat Politecnica de Catalunya, Spain, April 1992. [14]

Probabilistic Knowledge

Habbema, J., Hilden, J. & Bjerregaard, B., "The Measurement of Performance in Probablilistic Diagnosis," Methods of Information in Medicine, 20(2), 1981, pp97-100. [29]

Middleton, B., Shwe, M. & Heckerman, D., "Probabilistic Diagnosis Using a Reformulation of the INTERNIST-1/QMR Knowledge Base. II: Evaluation of Diagnostic Performance," Methods of Information in Medicine, 30, 1991, pp256-267. [29]

Molino, G., Molino, F., Furia, D. et al., "Computer Aided Diagnosis in JAUNDICE: Comparison of Knowledge Based and Probabilistic Approaches," Methods of Information in Medicine, 35(1), 1996, pp41-51. [29]

O'Leary, D.E., "Soliciting Weights or Probabilities from Experts for Rule Based Expert Systems," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 30, 1990, pp293-301. [16]

Santos J., E., Gleason, H.T. & Banks, S.B., "BVAL: Probabilistic Knowledge-Base Validation," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp13-22. [8]

Suermondt, H. & Cooper, G., "An Evaluation of Explanations of Probabilistic Inference," Computers and Biomedical Research, 26, 1993, pp242-54. [29]

Subjective Knowledge

Arditi, D. & Ferreira, E., "Acquisition, Representation and Validation of Knowledge of Subjective Nature in Expert System Development," Microcomputers in Civil Engineering, 1996, np. [29]

Uncertain Knowledge

Andert, E.P., "Integrated Knowledge-Based System Design and Validation for Solving Problems in Uncertain Environments," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 36(2), 1992, pp357-373. [7, 16, 27]

Barr, V., "Rule-Based Coverage Measures Applied to Testing Rule-Bases with Uncertainty," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [4]

Meseguer, P., "Inconsistency Checking in Rule-Based Expert Systems with Uncertainty and Control Features," Proc. of the 5th Int. Symp. on Methodologies for Intelligent

Systems, M.L. Emrich, M.S. Phifer, B. Huber, M. Zemankova & Z.W. Ras, eds., Knoxville, TN, ICAIT, 1990, pp83-92. [28]

O'Leary, D.E., "Verification of Uncertain Knowledge-Based Systems: An Empirical Verification Approach," Management Science, December 1996, pp1663-1675. [23]

Santos J., E., Banks, D.O. & Banks, S.B., "MACK: A Tool for Acquiring Consistent Knowledge Under Uncertainty," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp23-32. [8]

Yager, R.R. & Larsen, H.L., "On Discovering Potential Inconsistencies in Validating Uncertain Knowledge Bases by Reflecting on the Input," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-91 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, Anaheim, CA, July 1991, np. [26, 28, 29]

Wide Domains

Preece, A.D., "Verification of Rule-Based Expert Systems in Wide Domains," Proc. of the 6th Conf. on Research and Development in Expert Systems, N. Shadbolt, ed., London, England, Cambridge University Press, September 1989, pp66-77. [5, 20]

Knowledge Representation Problems

Case-Based Knowledge

Cohen, P.R., "Evaluation and Case-Based Reasoning," Proc. of the Case-Based Reasoning Workshop, Chantilly, France, 1989, pp168-172. [7]

Gonzales, A.J., Xu, L. & Gupta, U.M., "Validation Techniques for Case-Based Reasoning Systems," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, 28(4), July 1998, pp465-477. [7]

O'Leary, D.E., "Verification and Validation of Case-Based Reasoning Systems," Expert Systems with Applications, 6(1), 1993, pp57-66. [7, 16, 23]

Simoudis, E. & Miller, J., "Validated Retrieval in Case-Based Reasoning," Proc. of the 8th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-90), Stanford, CA, 1990, pp310-317. [7]

Xu, L., Validation Techniques for Case-Based Reasoning Systems, M.S. Thesis, Dept. of Electrical and Computer Engineering, Univ. of Central Florida, Orlando, FL, 1995. [7]

Control Knowledge

Lopez, B., "CONKRET: A Tool for Refining Control Knowledge," Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, M. Ayel & J.-P. Laurant, eds, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1991, pp 191-206. [4, 26, 28, 29]

Meseguer, P., "Inconsistency Checking in Rule-Based Expert Systems with Uncertainty and Control Features," Proc. of the 5th Int. Symp. on Methodologies for Intelligent Systems, M.L. Emrich, M.S. Phifer, B. Huber, M. Zemankova & Z.W. Ras, eds., Knoxville, TN, ICAIT, 1990, pp83-92. [28]

Frame Representations

Cheng, A.M., <u>Expert System Validation as It Applies to Expert Systems Utilizing a Frame-Based Knowledge Representation</u>, Master's Thesis, Department of Computer Science and Engineering, University of South Florida, Florida, 1989. [29]

Knowledge Containing Equations

Williamson, K. & Dahl, M., "Knowledge-Based Reduction for Verifying Rule Bases Containing Equations," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-93 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, AAAI Report WS-93-05, A.D. Preece, ed., Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp66-71. [4]

Knowledge Dynamics

Preece, A.D., Grossner, C. & Radhakrishnan, T., "Validating Dynamic Properties of Rule-Based Systems," <u>Int. Jour. of Human-Computer Studies</u>, 44, 1996, pp145-169. [9]

Treur, J. & Willems, M., "Formal Notions for Verification of Dynamics of Knowledge-Based Systems," <u>Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95)</u>, Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

Logic

Antoniou, G. & Langetepe, E., "Soundness and Completeness of a Logic Programming Approach to Default Logic," <u>Proc. of the 12th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-94)</u>, MIT Press, Cambridge, MA, 1994, pp934-939. [21]

Antoniou, G. & Sperschneider, V., "On the Verification of Modular Logical Knowledge Bases," <u>Expert Systems with Applications</u>, 8(3), 1995, pp351-357. [21]

Antoniou, G. & Sperschneider, V., "On the Verification of Modules," <u>Proc. of the 1989 Conf. on Computer Science Logic</u>, LNCS 440, Springer-Verlag, 1989, pp16-35. [21]

Antoniou, G., "Modularity and Correctness for Logic Programs and Knowledge Bases," <u>Int. Jour. of Software Engineering and Knowledge Engineering</u>, 4(2), 1994, pp257-275. [21]

Non-Monotonic Knowledge

Antoniou, G & MacNish, C.K., "On the Refinement of Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases," <u>Proc of the ECAI-96 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Refinement of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, Budapest, Hungary, August 1996, pp1-6. [21]

Antoniou, G. & MacNish, C.K., "Some Specification Techniques for Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases - Preliminary Report," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-96 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems and Subsystems</u>, Portland, ME, August 1996, pp116-121. [21]

Antoniou, G. & MacNish, C.K., "Specification Morphisms for Nonmonotonic Knowledge Systems," <u>Proc. of the 10th Australian Joint Conference on Artificial Intelligence</u>, LNAI 1342, Springer-Verlag, 1997, pp246-254. [21]

Antoniou, G., "Integrity and Rule Checking in Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, pp22-28. [21]

Antoniou, G., "Integrity and Rule Checking in Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases," Knowledge-Based Systems, 9, 1996, pp301-306. [21]

Antoniou, G., "Module Concepts for Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-96 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems and Subsystems, Portland, ME, August 1996, pp101-108. [21]

Antoniou, G., "On the Verification of Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases: The Use of Classical Methods," Proc of the 3rd World Congress on Expert Systems (WCES-96), Seoul, South Korea, February 1996, pp1255-1262. [21]

Antoniou, G., "Verification and Correctness Issues for Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, pp141-154. [5, 21]

Antoniou, G., "Verification and Correctness Issues for Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases," Int. Jour. of Intelligent Systems, 12(10), 1997, pp725-738. [21]

Chang, C.L., Stachowitz, R.A. & Combs, J.B., "Validation of Nonmonotonic Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 2nd IEEE Int. Conf. on Tools for Artificial Intelligence (TAI-90), A. Dollas, W.T. Tsai, & N.G. Bourbakis, eds., Washington, DC, 1990, pp776-782. [5]

Rule Weightings

O'Leary, D.E. & Kandelin, N.A., "Validating the Weights in Rule-Based Expert Systems: A Statistical Approach," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 1(3), 1988, pp253-279. [5, 16, 20]

O'Leary, D.E., "Soliciting Weights or Probabilities from Experts for Rule Based Expert Systems," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 30, 1990, pp293-301. [16]

Tabular Data

Piramuthu, S., "Feature Construction for Verification and Validation of Tabular Knowledge-Base Systems," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Vanthienen, J., Mues, C. & Wets, G., "Inter-Tabular Verification in an Interactive Environment," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, pp155-165. [10, 18]

Vanthienen, J., Mues, C., Wets, G. & Delaere, K., "A Tool-Supported Approach to Inter-Tabular Verification," Proc. of the 4th World Congress on Expert Systems (WCES-98), Mexico City, Mexico, 1998, pp347-354. [18]

Vanthienen, J., Mues, C., Wets, G. & Delaere, K., A Tool-Supported Approach to Inter-Tabular Verification, Research Report 9739, K.U.Leuven, T.E.W., 1997. [18]

Problems with Specific Architectures

Blackboard Systems

O'Leary, D., "Validation of Blackboard Systems: On the Order of Knowledge Sources," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp47-52. [8]

O'Leary, D.E., "Validation of Blackboard Systems: On the Order of Knowledge Sources," Proc. of the IJCAI-97 Workshop on Validation, Verification & Refinement of AI Systems and Subsystems, Nagoya, Japan, August 1997, pp25-34. [30]

Expert System Shells

Polat, F. & Guvenir, H.A., "Knowledge Base Verification in an Expert System Shell," Proc. of the 4th Int. Symp. on Computer and Information Sciences II, Izmir, Turkey, 1988, pp889-898. [5]

UPM VALID Team, Integration of Any Knowledge-Based System Shell with VETA (Methodology Task), UPM/WP/TASK9/TM/1, VALID Project Library. August, 1991. [28]

Interactive KBSs

Lancaster, F.W., Ulvila, J.W., Humphrey, S.M. et al., "Evaluation of Interactive Knowledge-Based Systems: Overview and Design for Empirical Testing," Jour. of the American Society for Information Science, 47(1), 1996, pp57-69. [29]

Multi-Agent Systems

Lamb, N. & Preece, A., "Verification of Multi-Agent Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc of the ECAI-96 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Refinement of Knowledge-Based Systems, Budapest, Hungary, August 1996, np. [9]

O'Leary, D.E., "A Fuzzy-Set Approach for Analyzing the Validation of Expert Systems in a Multiple Agent Environment," Expert Systems with Applications, 7(2), 1994, pp169-174. [16, 23]

O'Leary, D.E., "Verification of Multiple Agent Knowledge-Based Systems," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp8-12. [8]

O'Leary, D.E., "Verification of Multiple Agent Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the IJCAI-97 Workshop on Validation, Verification & Refinement of AI Systems and Subsystems, Nagoya, Japan, August 1997, pp1-10. [30]

Preece, A. & Lamb, N., "Verifying Multi-Agent Knowledge-Based Systems Using COVERAGE," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp1-7. [8]

V&V Process Problems

Automated Refinement & Learning

Boswell, R., Craw, S. & Rowe, R., "Knowledge Refinement for a Design System," Proc. of the European Knowledge Acquisition Workshop (EKAW-97), E. Plaza & R. Benjamins, eds., Sant Feliu de Guixols, Spain, 1997, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, pp49-64. [22]

Boswell, R., Craw, S. & Rowe, R., "Refinement of a Product Formulation Expert System," Proc of the ECAI-96 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Refinement of Knowledge-Based Systems, Budapest, Hungary, August 1996, pp74-79. [22]

Craw, S. & Hutton, P., "Protein Folding: Symbolic Refinement Competes with Neural Networks," Proc. of the 12th Int. Conf. on Machine Learning, A. Prieditis & S. Russell, eds., Tahoe City, CA, Morgan Kaufmann, Los Altos, CA, 1995, pp133-141. [22]

Craw, S. & Sleeman, D., "Automating the Refinement of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 9th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-90), L.C. Aiello, ed., Stockholm, Sweden, August 1990, pp167-172. [6]

Craw, S. & Sleeman, D., "Refinement in Response to Validation," Expert Systems with Applications, 8(3), 1995, pp343-349. [22]

Craw, S. & Sleeman, D., "The Flexibility of Speculative Refinement," Proc. of the 8th Int. Workshop on Machine Learning, L. Birnbaum & G. Collins, eds., Evanston, IL, Morgan Kaufmann, Los Altos, CA, 1991, pp28-32. [22]

Craw, S. & Sleeman, D., Automating the Refinement of Knowledge-Based Systems, Technical Report AUCS/TR9002, University of Aberdeen, Aberdeen, Scotland, 1990. [22]

Craw, S. & Sleeman, D., Knowledge-Based Refinement of Knowledge Based Systems, Technical Report RGU-SCMS-95/2, The Robert Gordon University, Aberdeen, Scotland, 1996. [22]

Craw, S., "Refinement Assists Quality Assurance," Proc. of the IJCAI-93 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Expert Systems, Chambery, France, August/September 1993, pp5-15. [22]

Craw, S., "Refinement Complements Verification and Validation," Int. Jour. of Human-Computer Studies, 44(2), 1996, pp245-256. [22]

Craw, S., Automating the Refinement of Knowledge Based Systems, Ph.D. Thesis, University of Aberdeen, Aberdeen, Scotland, 1991. [4, 22]

Craw, S., Boswell, R. & Rowe, R., "Knowledge Refinement to Debug and Maintain a Tablet Formulation System," Proc. of the 9th IEEE Int. Conf. on Tools for Artificial Intelligence (TAI'97), Newport Beach, CA, 1997, pp446-453. [22]

Craw, S., Sleeman, D., Boswell, R. & Carbonara, L., "Is Knowledge Refinement Different from Theory Revision?" Proc. of the MLNet Familiarization Workshop on Theory Revision and Restructuring in Machine Learning (ECML-94), GMD Technical Report Number 842, S. Wrobel, ed., Catania, Sicily, Italy, April 1994, pp32-34. [22]

Ginsberg, A, "A Metalinguistic Approach to the Construction of Knowledge Base Refinement Systems," Proc. of the 5th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-86), 1986, pp436-441. [26, 29]

Ginsberg, A, "Automatic Refinement of Expert System Knowledge Bases," Pitman Research Notes in Artificial Intelligence, London, UK, 1988, np. [26, 29]

Ginsberg, A., Weiss, S. & Politakis, P., "SEEK2: A Generalized Approach to Automatic Knowledge Base Refinement," Proc. of the 9th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-85), Los Angeles, CA, August 1985, pp367-374. [20]

Palmer, G. & Craw, S., "The Role of Test Cases in Automated Knowledge Refinement," Proc. of the 12th Expert Systems Conf., Cambridge, England, SGES Publications, 1996, pp75-90. [22]

Palmer, G.H. & Craw, S., "Utilising Explanation to Assist the Refinement of Knowledge-Based Systems," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, pp201-211. [5, 22]

Palmer, G.J. & Craw, S., "The Selection of Training Cases for Automated Knowledge Refinement," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, pp205-215. [10, 22]

Perez, R.A., Hall, L.O., Romaniuk, S. & Lilkendey, J.T., "Evaluation of Machine Learning Tools Using Real Manufacturing Data," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 5(4), 1992, pp299-317. [20]

Sleeman, D., Craw, S., Ellery, I., Sharma, S. & Edwards, P., "Machine Learning, Knowledge-Base Refinement and Knowledge Acquisition: Systems Which Cope with Incomplete and Inconsistent Knowledge-Bases," Proc. of the 5th European Knowledge Acquisition Workshop (EKAW 91), M. Lister & B.R. Gaines, eds., GMD Studien Nr. 211, Crieff, Scotland, 1992, pp332-342. [22]

Talavera, L. & Cortes, U., "Inductive Hypothesis Validation and Bias Selection in Unsupervised Learning," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Terano, T. & Ishikawa, T., "Refining a Knowledge Base from Examples Using Analogical Reasoning," Proc. of the IJCAI-97 Workshop on Validation, Verification & Refinement of AI Systems and Subsystems, Nagoya, Japan, August 1997, pp19-24. [30]

Terano, T. & Kobayshi, K., "Changing the Traces: Refining a Rule-Base by Genetic Algorithms," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [4]

Evaluation Criteria/Quality

Abel, T. & Gonzalez, A.J., "Utilizing Criteria to Reduce a Set of Test Cases for Expert System Validation," Proc. of the 10th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Daytona Beach, FL, May 1997, pp402-406. [7]

Bell, M.Z., "Why Expert Systems Fail," Jour. of the Operational Research Society, 36(7), 1985, pp613-19. [29]

Boehm, B. & Bose, P., "Some Critical Success Factors in Knowledge-Based Software Engineering Applications," Proc. of the IEEE Int. Workshop on Software Engineering Education, IEEE Computer Society Press, Los Alamitos, CA, 1994, pp89-95. [29]

Born, G., "Applying Quality Assurance to Expert Systems," Proc. of the 5th Int. Expert Systems Conf., Paris, France, August 1989, np. [20]

Catanzarite, V., Greenburg, G. & Bremermann, H., "Computer Consultation in Neurology: Subjective and Objective Evaluations of "NEUROLOGIST" System," Computer Programs in Biomedicine, 12, 1982, pp343-55. [29]

Cehn, Z. & Suen, C.Y., "Application of Metric Measures: From Conventional Software to Expert Systems," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-93 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Report WS-93-05, A.D. Preece, ed., Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp37-44. [29]

Cognitech, KBS Quality Manual, Draft, VALID Project Library, 1989. [28]

Conrath, D.W. & Sharma, R.S., "Toward a Diagnostic Instrument for Assessing the Quality of Expert Systems," Data Base, Winter 1992, pp37-43. [20]

Conrath, D.W. & Sharma, R.S., "Toward a Diagnostic Instrument for Assessing the Quality of Expert Systems," Data Base, Winter 1992, pp37-43. [20]

Craw, S. "Judging Knowledge Base Quality," Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, M. Ayel & J.-P. Laurant, eds, John Wiley & Sons, New York, NY, 1991, pp207-219. [22]

Eliot, L.B., "If It Works, Is It Good?" AI Expert, 7(6), June 1992, pp9-11. [20]

ESPRIT II, Quality Manual, Deliverable D8, COG/D/5.1, ESPRIT II VALID Project 2148, Cognitech, December 1991. [26]

Guida, G. & Mauri, G., "Evaluating Performance and Quality of Knowledge-Based Systems: Foundations and Methodology," IEEE Trans. on Knowledge and Data Engineering, 5(2), April 1993, pp204-224. [20, 29]

Habbema, J., Hilden, J. & Bjerregaard, B., "The Measurement of Performance in Probabilistic Diagnosis," Methods of Information in Medicine, 20(2), 1981, pp97-100. [29]

Hammersley, J.R. & Cooney, K., "Evaluating the Utility of Available Differential Diagnosis Systems," Proc. of the 12th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-88), Washington, DC, 1988, pp220-224. [3, 25, 29]

Knight, K., "What Makes a Compelling Empirical Evaluation," IEEE Expert, 11(5), 1996, pp10-14. [29]

McCrea, J.D., McCredie, M.R., McSherry, D.M. & Brooks, P.M., "A Controlled Evaluation of Diagnostic Criteria in the Development of a Rheumatology Expert System," British Jour. of Rheumatology, 28, 1989, pp13-17. [20]

Meseguer, P., "Structural and Performance Metrics for Rule-Based Expert Systems," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, np. [5]

Nohr, C., "The Evaluation of Expert Diagnostic Systems - How to Assess Outcomes and Quality Parameters?" Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 6 1994, pp123-135. [29]

Plant, R.T., "Factors in Software Quality for Knowledge-Based Systems," Information and Software Technology, 33, September 1991, pp527-536. [1]

Plant, R.T., "Factors in Software Quality for Knowledge-Based Systems," Information and Software Technology, 33, September 1991, pp527-536. [1]

Preece, A.D., "Towards a Quality Assessment Framework for Knowledge-Based Systems," Jour. of Systems and Software, 29(3), June 1995, pp219-234. [9]

Pringle, M., Robins, S. & Brown, G., "TIMER: A New Objective Measure of Consultation Content and its Application to Computer Assisted Consultations," British Medical Jour, Clinical Research Edition, 293, 1986, pp20-22. [29]

Rossi-Mori, A. & Ricci, F.L., "Comprehensive Criteria for Evaluation and Design of Knowledge Based Systems in Medicine," System Engineering in Medicine, J. Talmon & J. Fox, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1990, np. [20]

Rothschild, M.A., Miller, P.L., Fisher, P.R., Weltin, G.G. & Swett, H.A., "Confronting Subjective Criteria in the Evaluation of Computer-Based Critiquing Advice," Proc. of the 12th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-88), Washington, DC, 1988, pp220-224. [3, 20, 25]

Rothschild, M.A., Swett, H.A., Fisher, P.R., Weltin, G.G. & Miller, P.L., "Exploring Subjective vs. Objective Issues in the Validation of Computer-Based Critiquing Advice," Computer Programs and Methods in Biomedicine, 31, 1990, pp11-18. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Rushby, J., Quality Measures and Assurance for AI Software, Technical Report SRI-CSL-88-7R, NASA Contractor Report CR-4187, SRI Project 4616, SRI International, Menlo Park CA, October 1988. [6, 20, 29]

Schewe, S., Scherrmann, W. & Gierl, L., "Evaluation and Measurement of Benefit of an Expert System for Differential Diagnosis in Rheumatology," Expert Systems and Decision Support in Medicine, Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics, 36, O. Rienhoff, V. Piccolo & B. Schneider, Springer-Verlag, 1988, pp352-354. [20, 25]

Sharma, R. & Conrath, D., "Evaluating Expert Systems: The Socio-Technical Dimension of Quality," Expert Systems, 9(3), August 1992, pp125-137. [29]

Sharma, R.S. & Conrath, D.W., "Soft Measures for Performance Analysis: The Core Dimensions of Expert System Quality," Microelectronics and Reliability, 36(6), 1996, pp775-796. [29]

Veit, C.T. & Callero, M., Criteria for Validating Human Judgments and Developing Behavioral Representation Models, The Rand Corporation, Santa Monica, CA, 1993.

Whitebeck, C. & Brooks, R., "Criteria for Evaluating a Computer Aid to Clinical Reasoning," Jour. of Medicine and Philosophy, 8, 1983, pp51-65. [20, 29]

Wied, G., Bartels, P., Bibbo, M. et al., "Computer Recognition of Ectocervical Cells: Classification Accuracy and Spatial Resolution," Acta. Cytology, 21, 1977, pp753-764. [29]

Knowledge Acquisition

Arditi, D. & Ferreira, E., "Acquisition, Representation and Validation of Knowledge of Subjective Nature in Expert System Development," Microcomputers in Civil Engineering, 1996, np. [29]

Ayel, M., Talbot, S. & Laurent, J.-P., "Acquisition, Consistency and Exceptions," Proc. of the IJCAI-91 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Test of Knowledge-Based Systems, August 1991, np. [17]

Bahill, A.T., Jafar, M. & Moller, R.F., "Tools for Extracting Knowledge and Validating Expert Systems," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, 18(2), 1986, pp857-862. [16, 19, 20]

Barnett, G.O., Cimino, J.J., Hupp, J.A. & Hoffer, E.P., "DXplain: Experience with Knowledge Acquisition and Program Evaluation," Proc. of the 11th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-87), Washington, DC, November 1987, pp150-154. [3, 20, 25]

Benbasat, I. & Dhaliwal, J. S., "A Framework for the Validation of Knowledge Acquisition," Knowledge Acquisition, 1(2), 1989, pp215-233. [5, 29]

Blanning, R.W., "Knowledge Acquisition and System Validation in Expert Systems for Management," Human System Management, 4(4), 1984, pp280-285. [5]

Greenwood, S. & Nealon, J.L., "A Comparative Evaluation of Knowledge Elicitation Techniques for Expert Systems," Moving Towards Expert Systems Globally in the 21st Century, J. Liebowitz, ed., Cognizant Communications Corp., Elmsford, NY, 1994 , pp60-65. [29]

Haouche, C.-S., Utilisation des Concepts de l'Acquisition des Connaissances pour Valider un Systemes a Base de Conaissance, These de Doctorat, Universite de Paris-Dauphine, Paris, France, 1995. [5]

Hoffman, R.R., Shadbolt, N.R., Burton, A.M. et al., "Eliciting Knowledge from Experts: A Methodological Analysis," Organizational Behavior & Human Decision Processes, 62(2), 1995, pp129-158. [29]

Loiseau, S., Validation, Acquisition et Mise au Point Interactive des Bases de Connaissances: Le Systeme COCO-X Fonde sur la Coherence, These de Doctorat, Universite d'Orsay, Orsay, France, 1990. [5]

Mars, N.J.I. & Miller, P.L., "Knowledge Acquisition and Verification Tools for Medical Expert Systems," Medical Decision Making, 7(1), 1987, pp6-11. [3, 20, 25]

O'Leary, D.E., "Determining Differences in Expert Judgment: Implications for Knowledge Acquisition and Validation," Decision Sciences, 24(2), March/April 1993, pp395-407. [16, 23]

O'Leary, D.E., "Soliciting Weights or Probabilities from Experts for Rule Based Expert Systems," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 30, 1990, pp293-301. [16]

Parsaye, K., "Acquiring and Verifying Knowledge Automatically," AI Expert, 3(5), May 1988, pp48-63. [19]

Santos J., E., Banks, D.O. & Banks, S.B., "MACK: A Tool for Acquiring Consistent Knowledge Under Uncertainty," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp23-32. [8]

Schecke, T.H., Popp, H.J., Rau, G., Käsmacher, H. & Kalff, G., "Design of a Knowledge-Based Decision Support System for Anesthesia Using Simulators Supporting Knowledge Acquisition and Validation," Proc. of the European Congress on Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, J. Hunter, J. Cookson & J. Wyatt, eds., Springer-Verlag, London, England, 1989, pp108-112. [20]

Sleeman, D., Craw, S., Ellery, I., Sharma, S. & Edwards, P., "Machine Learning, Knowledge-Base Refinement and Knowledge Acquisition: Systems Which Cope with Incomplete and Inconsistent Knowledge-Bases," Proc. of the 5th European Knowledge Acquisition Workshop (EKAW 91), M. Lister & B.R. Gaines, eds., GMD Studien Nr. 211, Crieff, Scotland, 1992, pp332-342. [22]

Vanthienen, J., "Knowledge Acquisition and Validation Using a Decision Table Engineering Workbench," Proc. of the 1st World Congress on Expert Systems (WCES-91), Orlando, FL, December 1991, pp1861-1868. [4, 18]

Real Time Performance

Cross, S. & Grisoni, M., "VORTEX: A Methodology for Producing Validated Real-Time Expert Systems," Proc. of the NATO Conf. on Knowledge-Based Systems, Applications for Guidance and Control, N. 474. NATO Advisory Group for Aerospace Research and Development, The Hague, Belgium, 1990, np. [5]

Traylor, B., Schwuttke, U. & Quan, A., "A Tool for Automatic Verification of Real-Time Expert Systems," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-94 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, R.T. Plant, ed., Seattle, WA, July/August 1994, pp79-83. [4, 19]

SYSTEM TYPES

Authentic Reasoning Systems

Webster, L., "The Development and Validation of an Exercise Countermeasure Protocol Management Expert System Based on Authentic Methods of Reasoning," Doctoral Dissertation, Dept. of Industrial Engineering, University of Houston, Houston, TX, May 1993. [30]

Webster II, L., Chen, J-G., Tan, S.S., Watson, C. & de Korvin, A., "Validation of Authentic Reasoning Expert Systems," Int. Jour. of Information Sciences, 117(1-2), July 1999, pp19-46. [30]

Case-Based Reasoning Systems

Althoff, K-D., "Evaluating Case-Based Reasoning Systems," Proc. Workshop on Case-Based Reasoning: A New Force in Advanced Systems Development, A. Aamodt, K-D. Althoff, R. Magaldi & R. Milne, eds., Unicom Seminars & AI Intelligence Ltd., Uxbridge, England, April 1995, pp48-61. [30]

Althoff, K-D., Evaluating Case-Based Reasoning Systems, Lecture Notes of Computer Science (LNCS), Springer Verlag, Heidelberg, Germany, 1999.

Beick, H-R. & Jantke, K.P., "Validation of CBL (Case Based Learning) Principles," Proc. of 12th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 1999, pp.526-530. [30]

Knauf, R. & Gonzalez, A.J., "Validation of Rule-Based and Case-Based Systems: What's Common and What Should Be Different," Proc. of the Int. Workshop on Future Trends in Intelligent System Validation, Sapporo, Japan, September 1998, pp25-40. [30]

Knauf, R., Gonzalez, A.J. & Jantke, K.P., "Towards Validation of Case-Based Systems," Proc. of 12th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 1999, pp516-520. [30]

Control Systems

Andert, E.P. & Frasher, C. "A Verifiable, Autonomous Satellite Control System," Proc. of the 1989 IEEE Aerospace Applications Conf., IEEE 89TH0233-7, Colorado, 1989, np. [27]

Harwood, K., "Defining Human-Centered System Issues for Verifying and Validating Air Traffic Control Systems," Verification and Validation of Complex Systems: Human Factors Issues, NATO ASI Series F: Computer and System Sciences, Vol. 110, Springer-Verlag, Heidelberg, Germany, 1993, pp115-129. [30]

Santos, J., Faria, L., Ramos, C. & Vale, Z.A., "VERITAS - A Verification Tool for Real-Time Applications in Power System Control Centers," Proc. of 12th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 1999, pp511-513. [30]

Cooperating Systems

Ochsenschlaeger, P., Repp, J. & Rieke, R., "Verification of Cooperating Systems, An Approach Based on Formal Languages," Proc. of 13th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 2000, pp346-350. [30]

Ochsenschlaeger, P., Repp, J. & Rieke, R., "Abstraction and Composition: A Verification Method for Co-operating Systems," Jour. of Experimental & Theoretical Artificial Intelligence, 12(4), 2000, pp447-459. [30]

Ochsenschlaeger, P., Repp, J., Rieke, R. & Nitsche, U., "The SH-Verification Tool - Abstraction-Based Verification of Co-operating Systems," <u>Formal Aspects of Computing</u>, 10, 1998, pp381-404. [30]

Embedded Systems

Schtaklef, R.G., "Embedded Expert Systems - Approaches for Evaluation and Development," <u>Proc of the 6th Int. Expert Systems Conf.</u>, London, England, September 1990, pp26-44. [20]

Petermann, U., "Towards Dependable Development Tools for Emedded Systems: A Case Study in Software Verification," <u>Jour. of Experimental & Theoretical Artificial Intelligence</u>, 12(4), 2000, pp489-498. [30]

Fault Tolerant Systems

Gaertner, F.C., "A Survey of Transformational Approaches to the Specification and Verification of Fault-Tolerant Systems." Technical Report TUD-BS-1999-04, Darmstadt University of Technology, April 1999. [30]

Mantel, H. & Gaertner, F.C., "A Case Study in the Mechanical Verification of Fault Tolerance.", <u>Proc. of 13th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp.</u>, Orlando, FL,, May 2000, pp341-345. [30]

Mantel, H. & Gaertner, F.C., "A Case Study in the Mechanical Verification of Fault Tolerance," <u>Jour. of Experimental & Theoretical Artificial Intelligence</u>, 12(4), 2000, pp473-487. [30]

Hybrid Systems

Gamble, R.F., "Achieving Comprehensiveness in Verifying Hybrid Systems," <u>Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp63-65. [8]

Lee, S. & O'Keefe, R., "Subsumption Anomalies in Hybrid Knowledge Bases," <u>Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications</u>, 6(3), 1993, pp299-320. [29]

Renard, F.X., Sterling, L. & Brosilow, C., "Knowledge Verification in Expert Systems Combining Declarative and Procedural Representations," <u>Computers and Chemical Engineering</u>, 17(11), 1993, pp1067-1090. [19, 29]

Learning Systems

Doetsch, V., Grieser, G., Jantke, K.P. & Lange, S., "Formal Concepts of Learning Systems Validation in Use," <u>Proc. of 13th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp.</u>, Orlando, FL, May 2000, pp319-324 [30]

Doetsch, V., Grieser, G. & Lange, S., "Applying Formal Concepts to Learning Systems Validation," <u>Jour. of Experimental & Theoretical Artificial Intelligence</u>, 12(4), 2000, pp433-445. [30]

Doetsch, V. & Jantke, K.P., "TIC - A Toolkit for Validation in Formal Language Learning," Proc. of 13th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 2000, pp325-330. [30]

Grieser, G., Jantke, K.P. & Lange, S., "Characterizing Sufficient Expertise for Learning System Validation," Proc. of 11th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Sanibel Island, FL, May 1998, pp452-456. [30]

Grieser, G., Jantke, K.P. & Lange, S., "Towards the Validation of Inductive Learning Systems," Proc. of the Int. Workshop on Algorithmic Learning Theory, Lecture Notes in Artificial Intelligence, Vol. 1501, Springer-Verlag, Heidelberg, Germany, 1998, pp409-423. [30]

Neural Networks

Asada, N., Doi, K. & MacMahon, H., "Potential Usefulness of an Artificial Neural Network for Differential Diagnosis of Interstitial Lung Diseases: Pilot Study," Radiology, 177, 1990, pp857-860. [29]

Gindi, G., Darken, C., O'Brien, K. et al., "Neural Network and Conventional Classifiers for Fluorescence-Guided Laser Angioplasty," IEEE Trans. on Biomedical Engineering, 38, 1991, pp246-252. [29]

Hart, A. & Wyatt, J., "Evaluating Black-Boxes as Medical Decision Aids: Issues Arising from a Study of Neural Networks," Medical Informatics, 15(3), July-September 1990, pp229-236. [20, 29]

Production Systems

Agarwal, R. & Tanniru, M., "A Petri-Net Based Approach for Verifying the Integrity of Production Systems," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 36(3), 1992, pp447-468. [12, 16, 19]

Antoniou, G. & Jack, O., "Testing Production System Programs," Proc. of the 9th IEEE Int. Symp. on Software Reliability Engineering, IEEE Press, 1998, np. [21]

Antoniou, G. & Jack, O., "Testing Production System Programs," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, np. [21]

Antoniou, G., "Integrity and Rule Checking in Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, pp22-28. [21]

Antoniou, G., "Integrity and Rule Checking in Nonmonotonic Knowledge Bases," Knowledge-Based Systems, 9, 1996, pp301-306. [21]

Barr, V., "Rule-Based Coverage Measures Applied to Testing Rule-Bases with Uncertainty," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [4]

Bezem, M., Consistency of Rule-Based Expert Systems, Report CS-R8736, Centre for Mathematics and Computer Science, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, nd. [20]

Bouali, F. & Loiseau, S., "Rule Base Diagnosis for Debugging: The KB-DIAGO2 System," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

Bouali, F., Loiseau, S. & Rousset, M.-C., "Revision of Rule Bases," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10, 24]

Buchanan, B.G. & Shortliffe, E.H., "The Problem of Evaluation," Rule-Based Expert Systems, B.G. Buchanan & E.H. Shortliffe, eds., Addison Wesley, Reading, MA, 1984, pp571-588. [16]

Chander, P.G., Shinghal, R. & Radhakrishnan, T., "Performance Assessment and Incremental Evaluation of Rule-Based Systems," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, pp40-46. [8]

Coenen, F. & Dunne, P., "Verification and Validation of Rulebases Using a Binary Encoded Incidence Matrix Technique," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Coenen, F., Bench-Capon, T. & Kent, A., "A Binary Encoded Incidence Matrix Representation to Support Knowledge-Based System Verification," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-94 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, R.T. Plant, ed., Seattle, WA, July/August 1994, pp84-93. [4, 19]

Evertsz, R., "The Automatic Analysis of Rule-Based System Based on Their Procedural Semantics," Proc. of the 12th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (IJCAI-91), Sydney, Australia, August 1991, pp22-27. [6, 29]

Gamble, R.F., Roman, G.-C. & Ball, W.E., "Formal Verification of Pure Production System Programs," Proc. of the 9th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-91), Anaheim, CA, July 1991, pp329-334. [5, 20]

Gamble, R.F., Roman, G.-C. & Ball, W.E., On Extending the Application of Formal Specification and Verification Methods to Rule-Based Programming, Technical Report WUCS-91-1, Department of Computer Science, Washington University, St. Louis, MO, 1991. [5]

Gamble, R.F., Roman, G.-C., Ball, W.E. et al., "The Application of Formal Specification and Verification to Rule-Based Programs," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems - Research and Applications, 7(3), 1994, pp303-38. [29]

Gissi, P., "Logical Checks in a Rule Based Medical Decision Support System," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-87), A. Serio, R. O'Moore, A. Tardini & F. Roger, eds., EDI Press, Rome, Italy, 1987, pp981-985. [20]

Grossner, C., Preece, A., Chander, P.G., Radhakrishnan, T. & Suen, C.Y., "Exploring the Structure of Rule-Based Systems," Proc. of the 11th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-93), Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp704-709. [6, 9, 29]

Johnson, R., Joly, G. & King, P., "Validation and Verification in Expert System Rule Sets," Proc. of the Colloq. on the Computing and Control Division, Testing Expert Systems, December 1987, pp. 3/1-3/3. [20]

Kiper, J.D., "Structural Testing of Rule-Based Expert Systems," ACM Trans. on Software Engineering and Methodology, 1(2), 1992, pp168-187. [6, 29]

Kleine-Büning, H., Löwen, U. & Schmitgen, S., "Inconsistency of Production Systems," Data and Knowledge Engineering, 3, 1988/89, pp245-260. [20]

Knauf, R., Validating Rule-Based Systems, A Complete Methodology, Shaker Verlag, Aachen, Germany, 2000. [30]

Knauf, R., Gonzalez, A.J. & Abel, T., "A Framework for Validation of Rule Based Systems," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, 32(3), June 2002, pp281-295. [30]

Knauf, R., Philippow, I., Gonzalez, A.J. & Jantke, K.P., "Towards Validation of Rule-Based Systems – The Loop is Closed," Proc. of 13th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL,, May 2000, pp331-335. [30]

Knauf, R., Philippow, I. & Gonzalez, A.J., "Towards Validation and Refinement of Rule-Based Systems," Jour. of Experimental & Theoretical Artificial Intelligence, 12(4), 2000, pp421-431. [30]

Landauer, C., "Correctness Principles for Rule-Based Expert Systems," Expert Systems with Applications, 1(3), 1990, pp291-316. [29]

Ligeza, A., "Logical Analysis of Completeness of Rule-Based Systems with Dual Resolution," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Loiseau, S., "A Method for Checking and Restoring the Consistency of Rule Bases," Int. Jour. of Human-Computer Studies, 40(3), 1994, pp425-442. [4, 29]

Meseguer, P. & Verdaguer, A., "Verification of Multi-Level Rule-Based Expert Systems: Theory and Practice," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 6(2), 1993, pp163-192. [2, 16, 20, 26, 29]

Meseguer, P., "A New Method to Checking Rule Bases for Inconsistency: A Petri Net Approach," Proc. of the 9th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-90), L.C. Aiello, ed., Stockholm, Sweden, August 1990, pp437-442. [26, 28, 29]

Meseguer, P., "Inconsistency Checking in Rule-Based Expert Systems with Uncertainty and Control Features," Proc. of the 5th Int. Symp. on Methodologies for Intelligent Systems, M.L. Emrich, M.S. Phifer, B. Huber, M. Zemankova & Z.W. Ras, eds., Knoxville, TN, ICAIT, 1990, pp83-92. [28]

Meseguer, P., "Incremental Verification of Rule-Based Expert Systems," Proc. of the 10th European Conf on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI-92), B. Neumann, ed., Vienna, Austria, August 1992, pp840-844. [5, 6, 26, 29]

Meseguer, P., "Structural and Performance Metrics for Rule-Based Expert Systems," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, np. [5]

Meseguer, P., "Verification of Multi-Level Rule-Based Expert Systems," Proc. of the 9th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-91), Anaheim, CA, July 1991, pp323-328. [6, 5, 20, 26, 28, 29]

Meseguer, P., Verification of Multi-Level Rule-Based Expert Systems, Ph.D. Dissertation, Universitat Politecnica de Catalunya, Spain, April 1992. [14]

Nazareth, D.L., "Investigating the Applicability of Petri Nets for Rule-Based System Verification," IEEE Trans. on Knowledge and Data Engineering, 5(3), June 1993, pp402-415. [12, 16]

Nazareth, D.L., "Issues in the Verification of Knowledge in Rule-Based Systems," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 30(3), 1989, pp255-271. [5, 16, 19, 29]

Nazareth, D.L., An Analysis of Techniques for Verification of Logical Correctness in Rule Based Systems, Ph.D. Dissertation, Department of Managerial Studies, Case Western Reserve University, January 1988. [12, 14]

Nguyen, T.A., "Verifying Consistency of Production Systems," Proc. of the 3rd IEEE Conf. on Artificial Intelligence Applications (CAIA-87), Kissimmee, FL, February 1987, pp4-8. [2, 11, 16, 29]

O'Leary, D.E. & Kandelin, N.A., "Validating the Weights in Rule-Based Expert Systems: A Statistical Approach," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 1(3), 1988, pp253-279. [5, 16, 20]

O'Leary, D.E. & Schaffer, J., "The Use of Mathematical Programming to Verify Rule-based Knowledge," Annals of Operations Research, August 1996, pp181-193. [23]

O'Leary, D.E., "Soliciting Weights or Probabilities from Experts for Rule Based Expert Systems," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 30, 1990, pp293-301. [16]

Pazzani, M.J., "A Set Covering Approach to Testing Rule-Based Expert Systems," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-90 Workshop on Verification, Validation and Testing of Knowledge-Based Systems, Boston, MA, July 1990, np. [4]

Preece, A., "A New Approach to Detecting Missing Knowledge in Expert System Rule Bases," Int. Jour. of Man-Machine Studies, 38, 1993, pp161-181. [9]

Preece, A., Grossner, C., Chander, P.G. & Radhakrishnan, T., "Structure-Based Validation of Rule-Based Systems," Data and Knowledge Engineering, 26, 1997, np. [9]

Preece, A., Shinghal, R. & Batarekh, A., "Principles and Practice in Verifying Rule-Based Systems," Knowledge Engineering Review, 7(2), June 1992, pp115-141. [4, 5, 9]

Preece, A.D., "Verification of Rule-Based Expert Systems in Wide Domains," Proc. of the 6th Conf. on Research and Development in Expert Systems, N. Shadbolt, ed., London, England, Cambridge University Press, September 1989, pp66-77. [5, 20]

Preece, A.D., Grossner, C. & Radhakrishnan, T., "Validating Dynamic Properties of Rule-Based Systems," Int. Jour. of Human-Computer Studies, 44, 1996, pp145-169. [9]

Preece, A.D., Grossner, C. & Radhakrishnan, T., "Validating Rule-Based Systems that Operate with Incomplete Data," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5, 9]

Puuronen, S., "A Tabular Rule-Checking Method," Proc of the 7th Int. Conf. on Expert Systems and Their Applications, Avignon, France, May 1987, pp257-266. [3, 20, 25]

Roman, G.-C., Gamble, R.F. & Ball, W.E., "Formal Derivation of Rule-Based Programs," IEEE Trans. on Software Engineering, 19(3), March 1993, pp277-296. [4]

Schmolze, J.G. & Snyder, W., "Detecting Redundant Production Rules," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Technical Report WS-97-01, Providence, RI, July 1997, np. [8]

Smith, S. & Kandel, A., Verification and Validation of Rule-Based Expert Systems, CRC Press, Boca Raton, FL, 1993. [4, 15]

Snyder, W. & Schmolze, J.G., "A Tool for Testing Confluence of Production Rule Systems," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

Snyder, W. & Schmolze, J.G., "A Tool for Testing Confluence of Production Rules," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [29]

Soloway, E., Bachant, J. & Jensen, K., "Assessing the Maintainability of XCON-in-RIME: Coping with the Problem of a Very Large Rule Base," Proc. of the 6th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-87), 1987, pp824-829. [6, 29]

Suwa, W., Scott, A.C. & Shortliffe, E.H., "An Approach to Verifying Completeness and Consistency in a Rule-Based Expert System," AI Magazine, 3(4), Winter 1982, pp16-21. [3, 5, 6, 16, 19, 20, 25, 26, 29]

Suwa, W., Scott, A.C. & Shortliffe, E.H., "Completeness and Consistency in a Rule Based System," Rule-Based Expert Systems, B.G. Buchanan, ed., Addison-Wesley, Reading, MA, 1985, np. [20]

Talbot, S. & Ayel, M., "Consistency and Rules Subject to Exceptions," Proc. of the 1st European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-91), M. Grisoni, ed., Cambridge, England, July 1991, pp69-75. [17]

Terano, T. & Kobayshi, K., "Changing the Traces: Refining a Rule-Base by Genetic Algorithms," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [4]

Todd, B.S., "Idempotency as a Correctness Property of Rule Bases," Proc. of the 3rd European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, np. [5]

Valiente, G.A., "Using Layered Support Graphs for Verifying External Adequacy in Rule-Based Expert Systems," SIGART Bulletin, 3(1), January 1992, pp20-24. [19]

van Harmelen, F., "Applying Rule-Based Anomalies to KADS Inference Structures," Decision Support Systems, 21(4), 1998, pp271-280. [30]

van Harmelen, F. & Aben, M., "Applying Rule-Base Anomalies to KADS Inference Structures," Proc. of the IJCAI-95 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, R. Gamble, ed., Montreal, Canada, August 1995, np. [5]

Viaene, S. & Wets, G., "A Synthesis of Fuzzy Rule-Based System Verification," Proc. of the 7th IEEE Int. Conf. on Fuzzy Systems (FUZZ-IEEE-98), Anchorage, AK, May 1998, pp985-990. [18]

Viaene, S., Wets, G. & Vanthienen, J., A Synthesis of Fuzzy Rule-Based System Verification, Research Report 9738, K.U.Leuven, T.E.W., 1997. [18]

Williamson, K. & Dahl, M., "Knowledge-Based Reduction for Verifying Rule Bases Containing Equations," Workshop Notes of the AAAI-93 Workshop on Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, AAAI Report WS-93-05, A.D. Preece, ed., Washington, DC, July/August 1993, pp66-71. [4]

Wood, W. & Frankowski, N., "Verification of Rule-Based Expert Systems," Expert Systems with Applications, 1(3), 1990, pp317-322. [29]

SPECIFIC APPLICATIONS

Analytical Chemistry

Wehrens, R., Buydens, L. & Kateman, G., "Performance Validation and Optimization of Expert Systems in Analytical Chemistry," Proc. of the 11th Int. Conf. on Expert Systems and Their Applications, Avignon, France, May 1991, pp279. [20]

Emergency Handling Systems

Stephan, W., Rock, G. & Brodski, M., "Modelling, Specification and Verification of an Emergency Closing System," Proc. of 13th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 2000, pp356-360. [30]

Financial Applications

Jantke, K.P. & Keller, O., "Secure Systems Development – The Evolving Integration of Validation and Verification." Proc. of the 14th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Key West, FL, May 2001, pp630-634. [30]

O'Leary, D.E., "Validation of Expert Systems with Applications to Auditing and Accounting Expert Systems," Decision Sciences, 18(3), May/June 1987, pp468-486. [7, 16]

Ribar, G., Arcoleo, F. & Hollo, D., "Loan Probe: Testing a BIG Expert System," AI Expert, 6(5), May 1991, pp43. [20]

Guergens, S., Lopez, J. & Peralta, R., "Efficient Detection of Failure Modes in Electronic Commerce Protocols," Proc. of 10th Int. Workshop on Database and Expert Systems Applications (DEXA-99), Florence, Italy, August-September 1999, pp850-857. [30]

Computer System Configuration

Bachant, J. & McDermott, J., "R1 Revisited: Four Years in the Trenches," AI Magazine, 5(3), Fall 1984, pp21-32. [6, 26, 29]

Barker, V. & O'Connor, D., "Expert Systems for Configuration at DIGITAL: XCON and Beyond," Communications of the ACM, 32(3), 1989, pp298-318. [20]

McDermott, J., "R1: The Formative Years," AI Magazine, 2(2), Summer 1981, pp21-29. [6, 29]

Sinz, C., Kaiser, A. & Kuechlin, W., "Detection of Inconsistencies in Complex Product Configuration Data Using Extended Propositional SAT-Checking," Proc. of the 14th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Key West, FL, May 2001, pp645-649. [30]

Human Behavior Representations

Avraamides, M. & Ritter, F., "Using Multidisciplinary Expert Evaluations to Test and Improve Cognitive Model Interfaces," Paper # 02-CGF-002, Proc. 11th Conf. on Computer Generated Forces & Behavior Representation, Orlando, FL, 7-9 May 2002, np.

Courtemanche, A.J. & Gugel, S.A., "Automated Testing for CGF Systems," Paper # 10th-CGF-021, Proc. 10th Conf. on Computer Generated Forces & Behavior Representation, Norfolk, VA, 15-17 May 2001, np.

Gonzalez, A.J., "Validation of Human Behavioral Models," Proc. of the Int. Workshop on Future Trends in Intelligent System Validation, Sapporo, Japan, September 1998, pp77-85 [30]

Gonzalez, A.J., "Validation of Human Behavioral Models," Proc. of 12th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 1999, pp489-493. [30]

Harmon, S.Y., "Validation of Human Behavior Representations," Paper # 99S-SIW-048, Proc. Spring 1999 Simulation Interoperability Workshop, Orlando, FL, 14-19 March 1999, np.

Harmon, S.Y., "A Taxonomy of Human Behavior Representation Requirements," Paper # 11TH-CGF-024, Proc. of the 11th Computer Generated Forces and Behavior Representation Conf., Orlando, FL, May 2002, np.

Harmon, S.Y. & Youngblood, S.M., "Fidelity and Human Behavior Representations," Paper # 01S-SIW-113, Proc. of the Spring 2001 Simulation Interoperability Workshop, March 2001, Orlando, FL, np.

Harmon, S.Y., Hoffman, C.W.D., Gonzalez, A.J., Knauf, R. & Barr, V., "Validation of Human Behavior Representations," Proc. of the 2002 SCS Foundations of Validation and Verification Workshop, Laurel, MD, October 2002, np.

Knauf, R., Philippow, I., Gonzalez, A.J. & Jantke, K.P., "The Character of Human Behavior Representation and its Impact on the Validation Issue," <u>Proc. of the 14th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp.</u>, Key West, FL, May 2001, pp635-639. [30]

Law, D.R., "Characterizing Fairness of SAF Interoperations," Paper # 8th-CGF-074, <u>Proc. of the 8th Conf. on Computer Generated Forces & Behavior Representation</u>, Orlando, FL, 11-13 May 1999, np.

Miller, J., "Domain-Expert and End-User Participation in the Design and Testing of Synthetic Teammates," Paper # 02-CGF-110, <u>Proc. of the 11th Conf. on Computer Generated Forces & Behavior Representation</u>, Orlando, FL, 7-9 May 2002, np.

Oakes, M. & Kitchen, M., "Computer Generated Force (CGF) Interaction Validation and Assessment," Paper # 02-CGF-027, <u>Proc. of the 11th Conf. on Computer Generated Forces & Behavior Representation</u>, Orlando, FL, 7-9 May 2002, np.

Rigg, G., Morley, R. & Hepplewhite, R., "Themis: The Objective Assessment of CGF Performance," Paper # 9th-CGF-020, <u>Proc. of the 9th Conf. on Computer Generated Forces & Behavior Representation</u>, Orlando, FL, 16-18 May 2000, np.

Ritter, F., Avraamides, M. & Councill, I., "Validating Changes to a Cognitive Architecture to More Accurately Model the Effects of Two Example Behavior Moderators," Paper # 02-CGF-100, <u>Proc. of the 11th Conf. on Computer Generated Forces & Behavior Representation</u>, Orlando, FL, 7-9 May 2002, np.

Schaad, G.L., "Psychological Aspects of Human Factor Testing and Evaluation of Military Human-Machine Systems," <u>Verification and Validation of Complex Systems: Human Factors Issues</u>, NATO ASI Series F: Computer and System Sciences, Vol. 110, Springer-Verlag, Heidelberg, Germany, 1993, pp453-455. [30]

Stager, P., "Validation in Complex Systems: Behavioral Issues, "<u>Verification and Validation of Complex Systems: Human Factors Issues</u>, NATO ASI Series F: Computer and System Sciences, Vol. 110, Springer-Verlag, Heidelberg, Germany, 1993, pp99-114. [30]

Tenney, Y.J. & Spector, S.L., "Comparisons of HBR Models with Human-in-the-Loop Performance in a Simplified Air Traffic Control Simulation with and without HLA Protocols: Task Simulation, Human Data and Results," Paper # 10th-CGF-074, <u>Proc. of the 10th Conf. on Computer Generated Forces & Behavior Representation</u>, Norfolk, VA, 15-17 May 2001, np.

Veit, C.T. & Callero, M., <u>Criteria for Validating Human Judgments and Developing Behavioral Representation Models</u>, The Rand Corporation, Santa Monica, CA, 1993.

Wallace, S. & Laird, J., "Toward Automatic Agent Validation," Paper # 02-CGF-053, <u>Proc. of the 11th Conf. on Computer Generated Forces & Behavior Representation</u>, Orlando, FL, 7-9 May 2002, np.

Laboratory Data Analysis

Collinson, P.O., Chelsom, J., Waite, K.E., Cramp, D.G. & Carson, E.R., "Development and Validation of a Decision Support System for the Interpretation of Laboratory Data: A Study in Two Domains," Proc. of the ACB, 1990, pp56. [20]

Shamsolmaali, A., Collinson, P., Gray, T.G., Carson, E.R. & Cramp, D.G., "Implementation and Evaluation of a Knowledge Based System for the Interpretation of Laboratory Data," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (AIME-89), 38, J. Hunter, J. Cookson, & J. Wyatt, eds., 1989, pp167-176. [20]

Legal Applications

Spreeuwenberg, S., van Engers, T. & Gerrits, R., "The Role of Verification of Legal Knowledge in Improving the Quality of Legal Decision-Making," Proc. of the 14th Annual Int. Conf. on Legal Knowledge and Information Systems (JURIX 2001), Verheij, B., Lodder, A.R., Loui, R.P., & Muntjewerff, A., eds., IOS Press, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, December 2001, np. [30]

Weusten, M.C.M., "Validation: The Key Concept in Maintenance of Legal Knowledge-Based System," Proc. of the 4th Int. Conf. on Artificial Intelligence and Law (ICAIL-82), ACM Press, 1982, np. [29]

Management Applications

Blanning, R.W., "Knowledge Acquisition and System Validation in Expert Systems for Management," Human System Management, 4(4), 1984, pp280-285. [5]

Marcos, M., Moisan, S. & Pobil, A.P., "A Model-Based Approach to the Verification of Program Supervision Systems," Proc. of the 4th European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-97), J. Vanthienen & F. van Harmelen, eds., Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, np. [10]

Manufacturing

Perez, R.A., Hall, L.O., Romaniuk, S. & Lilkendey, J.T., "Evaluation of Machine Learning Tools Using Real Manufacturing Data," Int. Jour. of Expert Systems – Research and Applications, 5(4), 1992, pp299-317. [20]

Medical Applications

Adlassnig, K.-P. & Scheithauer, W., "Performance Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems Using ROC Curves," Computers and Biomedical Research, 22, 1989, pp297-313. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Adlassnig, K.P., "The Application of ROC Curves to the Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-87), A. Serio, R. O'Moore, A. Tardini & F. Roger, eds., EDI Press, Rome, Italy, 1987, pp951-957. [20]

Alonso-Betanzos, A., Devoe, L., Castillo, R., Moret-Bonillo, V., Hernández-Sande, C. & Searle, N., "FOETOS in Clinical Practice: A Retrospective Analysis of its Performance," Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 1, 1989, pp93-99. [20]

Anderson, J.G., Aydin, C.E. & Jay, S.J., eds., Evaluating Health Care Information Systems: Approaches and Applications, Sage Publications, Thousand Oaks, CA, 1994. [29]

Asada, N., Doi, K. & MacMahon, H., "Potential Usefulness of an Artificial Neural Network for Differential Diagnosis of Interstitial Lung Diseases: Pilot Study," Radiology, 177, 1990, pp857-860. [29]

Atkinson, G., Hier, D. & McCormick, W., "Development, Refinement and Evaluation of a Knowledge-Base for Stroke Expert System," Proc. of the 9th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-85), Baltimore, MD, 1985, pp320-324. [29]

Atsumi, K., "Health and Hospital Information Systems Should Be Evaluated: How to, for What, and by Whom," Proc. of the World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-83), J. van Bemmel, M.J. Ball & O. Wigertz, eds., North Holland Publishing Co., Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1983, pp50-53. [3, 25]

Auramo, Y. & Juhola, M., "Comparison of Inference Results of Two Otoneurological Expert Systems," Int. Jour. of Biomedical Computing, 39(3), 1995, pp327-335. [29]

Bailey, J.J., Horton, M. & Itscoitz, S.B., "The Importance of Reproducibility Testing of Computer Programs for Electrocardiographic Interpretation: Application to the Automatic Vectorcardiographic Analysis Program (AVA 3.4)," Computers and Biomedical Research, 9, 1976, pp307-316. [20]

Bailey, J.J., Itscoitz, S.B., Hirschfeld, J.W., Grauer, L.E. & Horton, M.R., "A Method for Evaluating Computer Programs for Electrocardiographic Interpretation. I. Application to the Experimental IBM Program of 1971," Circulation, 50, July 1974, np. [20]

Bankowitz, R., McNeil, M., Challinor, S. et al., "A Computer-Assisted Medical Diagnostic Consultation Service: Implementation and Prospective Evaluation of a Prototype," Annals of Internal Medicine, 110, 1989, pp824-32. [29]

Barachini, F. & Adlassnig, K.P., "CONSDED: Medical Knowledge Base Consistency Checking," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-87), A. Serio, R. O'Moore, A. Tardini & F. Roger, eds., EDI Press, Rome, Italy, 1987, pp974-980. [20]

Barnett, G.O., Cimino, J.J., Hupp, J.A. & Hoffer, E.P., "DXplain: Experience with Knowledge Acquisition and Program Evaluation," Proc. of the 11th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-87), Washington, DC, November 1987, pp150-154. [3, 20, 25]

Bates, J. & Bessman, J., "Evaluation of BCDE, A Microcomputer Program to Analyze Automated Blood Counts and Differentials," American Jour. of Clinical Pathology, 88, 1987, pp314-23. [29]

Beggs, S., Vallbona, C., Spencer, W.A., Jacobs, F.M. & Baker, R.L., "Evaluation of a System for On-Line Computer Scheduling of Patient Care Activities," Computers and Biomedical Research, 4, 1971, pp634-654. [20]

Bernelot-Moens, H.J. & Kingsland, L.C., "Evaluation and Further Development of AI/RHEUM with Data from 1570 Consecutive Patients of a Dutch Rheumatological

Outpatient Clinic," Proc. of the 8th National Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (AAAI-90), Stanford, CA, 1990, pp141-144. [20]

Bernelot-Moens, H.J. & van der Korst, J., "Comparison of Rheumatological Diagnoses by a Bayesian Program and by Physicians," Methods of Information in Medicine, 30, 1991, pp187-93. [29]

Bernelot-Moens, H.J., "Validation of the AI/RHEUM Knowledge Base with Data from Consecutive Rheumatological Outpatients," Methods of Information in Medicine, 31(3), 1992, pp175-181. [20, 29]

Berner, E., Brooks, C., Miller, R. et al., "Evaluation Issues in the Development of Expert Systems in Medicine," Eval. Health Prof., 12, 1989, pp270-281. [29]

Berner, E., Webster, G., Shugerman, A. et al., "Performance of Four Computer-Based Diagnostic Systems," New England Jour. of Medicine, 330(25), 1994, pp1792-1796. [29]

Brender, J. & McNair, P., "Watch the System: An Opinion on User Validation of Computer Based Decision Support Systems in Clinical Medicine," Proc. of the 5th World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-89), B. Barber, C. Dexian, Q. Dulie & G. Wagner, eds., Elsevier North Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1989, pp275-279. [20]

Camma, C., Garofalo, G. & Almasio, P., "A Performance Evaluation of the Expert System 'JAUNDICE' in Comparison with That of Three Hepatologists," Jour. of Hepatology, 13, 1991, pp279-85. [29]

Catanzarite, V., Greenburg, G. & Bremermann, H., "Computer Consultation in Neurology: Subjective and Objective Evaluations of "NEUROLOGIST" System," Computer Programs in Biomedicine, 12, 1982, pp343-55. [29]

Catrou, P., Crawford, B. & Beeler, M., "Clinical Evaluation of an Algorithm for Interpreting Biochemical Profiles Showing Hyperbilirubinemia," American Jour. of Clinical Pathology, 74, 1980, pp61-63. [29]

Chandrasekaran, B., "On Evaluating AI Systems for Medical Diagnosis," AI Magazine, 4(2), Summer 1983, pp34-38. [16, 19, 20, 29]

Chiarelli, F., Tumini, S., Morgese, G. et al., "Controlled Study in Diabetic Children Comparing Insulin-Dosage Adjustment by Manual and Computer Algorithms," Diabetes Care, 13, 1990, pp1080-84. [29]

Clarke, K., O'Moore, R., Smeets, R. et al., "A Methodology for Evaluation of Knowledge-Based Systems in Medicine," Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 6, 1994, pp107-21. [29]

Clyman, J.I. & Miller, P.L., "An Environment for Building and Testing Advice-Giving Systems in Medicine," Proc. of the 14th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-90), Washington, DC, November 1990, pp584-588. [20]

Coe, P., Norton, E., Oparil, S. et al., "Treatment of Hypertension by Computer and Physician: A Prospective Controlled Study," Jour. of Chronic Disease, 30, 1977, pp81-92. [29]

Colby, K., Hilf, F., Weber, S. et al., "Turing-Like Indistinguishability Tests for the Validation of Computer Simulation of Paranoid Processes," Artificial Intelligence, 3, 1972, pp199-221. [29]

Collinson, P.O., Boran, G.R., Gray, T., Cock, C. & Harrison, L., "Design Validation and Evaluation of a Clinical Management and Information System for Fluid, Electrolyte and Nutritional Therapy Combining Conventional and Novel Techniques," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-90), 40, R. O'Moore, S. Bengttson, J. Bryant & J.S. Bryden, eds, Springer-Verlag, London, England, 1990, pp275-277. [20]

Collinson, P.O., Brooks, G. & Rahmahamadamy, E., "Development and Evaluation of an Automated System for Rapid Biochemical Diagnosis of Acute Myocardial Infarction," Decision Support for Patient Management: Measurement, Modelling and Control, British Medical Informatics Society, 1989, pp294-300. [20]

Cuddigan, J.E., Norris, J., Ryan, S.A. & Evans, S., "Validating the Knowledge in a Computer-Based Consultant For Nursing Care," Proc. of the 11th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-87), Washington, DC, November 1987, pp74-78. [5, 20]

de Dombal, F., Leaper, D., Horrocks, J. et al., "Human and Computer-Aided Diagnosis of Lower Gastro-Intestinal Disorders in 468 Patients," British Jour. of Surgery, 60, 1973, p915. [29]

de Dombal, F., Leaper, D., Horrocks, J. et al., "Human and Computer-Aided Diagnosis of Abdominal Pain: Further Report with Emphasis on Performance of Clinicians," British Medical Jour., 1, 1974, pp376-80. [29]

de Dombal, F.T. & Horrocks, J.C., "Use of Receiver Operating Characteristics (ROC) Curves to Evaluate Computer Confidence Threshold and Clinical Performance in the Diagnosis of Appendicitis," Methods of Information in Medicine, 17, 1978, pp157-161. [20, 29]

Elstein, A. et al., "Comparison of Physicians' Decisions Regarding Estrogen Replacement Therapy for Menopausal Women and Decisions Derived from a Decision Analytic Model," American Jour. of Medicine, 80, 1986, pp246-58. [29]

Fieschi, M. & Joubert, M., "Some Reflections on the Evaluation of Expert Systems in Medicine," Methods of Information in Medicine, 25(1), 1986, pp15-21. [3, 20, 25]

Fieschi, M., "Towards Validation of Expert Systems as Medical Decision Aids," Int. Jour. of Biomedical Computing, 26, 1990, pp93-108. [20]

Fitter, M.J. & Robinson, D., "The Evaluation of Computer Systems for Use in the Consulting Room," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-90), 40, R. O'Moore, S. Bengttson, J. Bryant & J.S. Bryden, eds, Springer-Verlag, London, England, 1990, np. [20]

Fitter, M.J. et al., Report on Methodology for Assessment of Suitability of Knowledge-Based Systems for Chronic Health Care, Eurodiabeta Report A1019 (ed/wp/Ass.Met.), nd. [20]

Fontaine, D., Le Beux, P., Strauss, A. & Morizet, P., "An Approach for Maintaining the Coherence in a Medical Knowledge Base," Proc. of the 5th World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-89), B. Barber, C. Dexian, Q. Dulie & G. Wagner, eds., Singapore, Elsevier North Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1989, pp44-48. [20]

Forsythe, D.E. & Buchanan, B.G., "Broadening Our Approach to Evaluating Medical Expert Systems," Proc. of the 15th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-91), Washington, DC, November 1991, pp8-12. [29]

Fox, J., "Decision Support Systems as Safety-Critical Components: Towards a Safety Culture for Medical Informatics," Methods of Information in Medicine, 32, 1993, pp345-48. [29]

François, P., Robert, C., Astruc, J., Begeu, P., Borderon, J-C., Floret, D., Lagardere, B., Mallet, E., Pautard, J-C. & Demongeot, J., "Comparative Study of Human Expertise and a Expert System: Application to the Diagnosis of Child's Meningitis," Computers and Biomedical Research, 26, 1993, pp383-392. [20]

François, P., Robert, C., Weil, G. & Demongeot, J., "A Protocol for Testing Expert-System Reliability," Technology and Health Care, 2, 1994, pp19-26. [20]

Friedman, C.P. & Wyatt, J.C., Evaluation Methods in Medical Informatics, Springer-Verlag, New York, NY, 1997. [29]

Fryback, D. & Thornbury, J., "Evaluation of a Computerized Bayesian Model for Diagnosis of Renal Cyst vs. Tumor vs. Normal Variant from Urogram Information," Invest Radiol., 11, 1976, pp102-11. [29]

Georgakis, D., Trace, D., Naeymi-Rad, F. et al., "A Statistical Evaluation of the Diagnostic Performance of MEDAS - The Medical Emergency Decision Assistance System," Proc. of the 14th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-90), Washington, DC, November 1990, pp815-19. [29]

Gissi, P., "Logical Checks in a Rule Based Medical Decision Support System," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-87), A. Serio, R. O'Moore, A. Tardini & F. Roger, eds., EDI Press, Rome, Italy, 1987, pp981-985. [20]

Giuse, D., Giuse, N. & Miller, R., "Consistency Enforcement in Medical Knowledge Base Construction," Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 5, 1993, pp245-252. [29]

Giuse, D.A., Giuse, N.B. & Miller, R.A., "Evaluation of Long-Term Maintenance of a Large Medical Knowledge Base," JAMIA, 2, 1995, pp297-306. [29]

Giuse, N., Giuse, D., Miller, R. et al., "Evaluating Consensus among Physicians in Medical Knowledge Base Construction," Methods of Information in Medicine, 32, 1993, pp137-145. [29]

Gottinger, H.W., "Technology Assessment and Forecasting of Medical Expert Systems (MEST)," Methods of Information in Medicine, 27(2), 1988, pp58-66. [3, 25]

Habbema, J., Hilden, J. & Bjerregaard, B., "The Measurement of Performance in Probabilistic Diagnosis," Methods of Information in Medicine, 20(2), 1981, pp97-100. [29]

Hammersley, J.R. & Cooney, K., "Evaluating the Utility of Available Differential Diagnosis Systems," Proc. of the 12th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-88), Washington, DC, 1988, pp220-224. [3, 25, 29]

Hanley, J. & McNeil, B., "The Meaning and Use of the Area under a Receiver Operating Characteristic (ROC) Curve," Radiology, 143, 1982, pp29-36. [29]

Hart, A. & Wyatt, J., "Evaluating Black-Boxes as Medical Decision Aids: Issues Arising from a Study of Neural Networks," Medical Informatics, 15(3), July-September 1990, pp229-236. [20, 29]

Heckerling, P., Elstein, A., Terzian, C. et al., "The Effect of Incomplete Knowledge on the Diagnosis of a Computer Consultant System," Medical Informatics, 16, 1991, pp363-370. [29]

Hersh, W., Hickam, D.H., Haynes, R.B. et al., "Evaluation of SAPHIRE: An Automated Approach to Indexing and Retrieving Medical Literature," Proc. of the 15th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-91), Washington, DC, November 1991, pp808-812. [29]

Hilden, J. & Habbema, J.D.F., "Evaluation of Clinical Decision Aids: More to Think about," Medical Informatics, 15(3), July-September 1990, pp274-284. [20, 29]

Hobbs, F.D.R., Delaney, B.C., Carson, A. et al., "A Prospective Controlled Trial of Computerized Decision Support for Lipid Management in Primary Care," Family Practice, 13(2), 1996, pp133-137. [29]

Indurkhya, N. & Weiss, S.M., "Models for Measuring Performance of Medical Expert Systems," Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 1, 1989, pp61-70. [20, 29]

Kahn, C.E., "Validation, Clinical Trial and Evaluation of a Radiology Expert," Methods of Information in Medicine, 30, 1991, pp268-74. [20, 29]

Kaplan, B. & Lundsgaarde, H.P., "Toward an Evaluation of a Clinical Imaging System: Identifying Benefits," Methods of Information in Medicine, 35, 1996, pp221-229. [29]

Kingsland, L., "The Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems: Experience with the AI/RHEUM Knowledge-Based Consultant System in Rheumatology," Computer-Assisted Medical Decision Making, J. Reggia & S. Tuhrim, eds., Springer-Verlag, New York, NY, 1985 , pp212-221. [29]

Kingsland, L.C., "Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems: Experience with the AI/RHEUM Knowledge-Based Consultation System in Rheumatology," Selected Topics in Medical Artificial Intelligence, P.L. Miller, ed., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1988, pp212-221. [3, 20, 25]

Klessens, P., Binkhuysen, F., Ottes, F. et al., "Diagnostic Evaluation of a PACS Subsystem Using Mammographs: An ROC Analysis," Medical Informatics, 13, 1988, pp323-326. [29]

Kors, J.A., Sittig, A.C. & van Bemmel, J.H., "The Delphi Method to Validate Diagnostic Knowledge in Computerized ECG Interpretation," Methods of Information in Medicine, 29, 1990, pp44-50. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Kotzke, K. & Pretschner, D.-P., "Possibilities of Software Phantoms for Quality Control of Knowledge-Based Systems in Nuclear Medicine," Methods of Information in Medicine, 31, 1992, pp126-34. [20]

Krause, P., Fox, J., O'Neil, M. & Glowinsky, A., "Can We Formally Specify a Medical Decision Support System?" IEEE Expert, 8(3), June 1993, pp56-61. [20]

Kulikowski, C., "Medical Expert Systems: Issues of Validation, Evaluation and Judgment," Record of the IEEE Symp. on Policy Issues in Information and Communication Technologies in Medical Applications, IEEE Press, New York, NY, 1988, pp45-56. [3, 20, 25]

Lau, L. & Warner, H., "Performance of a Diagnostic System (ILIAD) as a Tool for Quality Assurance," Computers and Biomedical Research, 25, 1992, pp314-23. [29]

Lehmann, E.D., Deutsch, T., Roudsari, A.V., Carson, E.R. & Sonksen, P.H., "Validation of a Metabolic Prototype to Assist in the Treatment of Insulin-Dependent Diabetes Mellitus," Medical Informatics, 18(2), 1993, pp83-101. [19, 20]

Leicester, H., Roudsari, A., Lehmann, E. et al., "Methodological Issues in Validating Decision-Support Systems for Insulin Dosage Adjustment," Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 6, 1994, pp161-173. [29]

Leitich, H., Adlassnig, K.P. & Kolarz, G., "Development and Evaluation of Fuzzy Criteria for the Diagnosis of Rheumatoid Arthritis," Methods of Information in Medicine, 35(4-5), 1996, pp334-342. [29]

Lobach, D. & Hammond, W., "Development and Evaluation of a Computer-Assisted Management Protocol (CAMP): Improved Compliance with Care Guidelines for Diabetes Mellitus," Proc. of the 18th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-94), Washington, DC, 1994, pp787-791. [29]

Lucas, P.J.F., "Development and Validation of HEPAR, An Expert System for the Diagnosis of Disorders of the Liver and Biliary Tract," Medical Informatics, 16(3), 1991, pp259-270. [20]

Lundsgaarde, H.P., "Evaluating Medical Expert Systems," Social Science in Medicine, 24(10), 1987, pp805-819. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Mars, N.J.I. & Miller, P.L., "Knowledge Acquisition and Verification Tools for Medical Expert Systems," Medical Decision Making, 7(1), 1987, pp6-11. [3, 20, 25]

McCrea, J.D., McCredie, M.R., McSherry, D.M. & Brooks, P.M., "A Controlled Evaluation of Diagnostic Criteria in the Development of a Rheumatology Expert System," British Jour. of Rheumatology, 28, 1989, pp13-17. [20]

Michel, C., Botti, Fieschi, M., Joubert, M., San Marco, J. & Casanova, P., "Validation of a Knowledge Base Intended for General Practitioners to Assist in Treatment of Diabetes," Proc. of the World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-86), R. Salamon, B. Blum, M. Jorgensen, eds., North Holland Publishing Co., Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1986, pp122-127. [20]

Middleton, B., Shwe, M. & Heckerman, D., "Probabilistic Diagnosis Using a Reformulation of the INTERNIST-1/QMR Knowledge Base. II: Evaluation of Diagnostic Performance," Methods of Information in Medicine, 30, 1991, pp256-267. [29]

Miller, P., Shaw, C., Rose, J. et al., "Critiquing the Process of Radiologic Differential Diagnosis," Computer Programs and Methods in Biomedicine, 22, March 1986, pp21-25. [29]

Miller, P.L. & Sittig, D.F., "The Evaluation of Clinical Decision Support Systems: What Is Necessary Versus What Is Interesting," Medical Informatics, 15(3), July-September 1990, pp185-1990. [20, 29]

Miller, P.L., "Evaluation of Artificial Intelligence Systems in Medicine," Computer Programs and Methods in Biomedicine, 22, 1986, pp5-11. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Miller, P.L., "Evaluation of Artificial Intelligence Systems in Medicine," Selected Topics in Medical Artificial Intelligence, P.L. Miller, ed., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1988, pp203-211. [3, 25, 29]

Miller, P.L., "Evaluation of Artificial Intelligence Systems in Medicine," Proc. of the 9th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-85), Baltimore, MD, 1985, pp281-286. [20]

Molino, G., Molino, F., Furia, D. et al., "Computer Aided Diagnosis in JAUNDICE: Comparison of Knowledge Based and Probabilistic Approaches," Methods of Information in Medicine, 35(1), 1996, pp41-51. [29]

Nakache, J.P., Gueguen, A., Dougados, M. & Nguyen, M., "Evaluation and Validation of a Functional Index in Ankylosing Spondylitis," Proc. of the 5th World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-89), B. Barber, C. Dexian, Q. Dulie & G. Wagner, eds., Elsevier North Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1989, pp262-265. [20]

Nelson, S.J., Blois, M.S., Tuttle, M.S., Erlbaum, M., Harrison, P., Kim, H., Winkelman, B., Yamashita, D., "Evaluating RECONSIDER - A Computer Program for Diagnostic Prompting," Jour. of Medical Systems, 9(5/6), December 1985, pp379-388. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Nohr, C., "The Evaluation of Expert Diagnostic Systems - How to Assess Outcomes and Quality Parameters?" Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 6 1994, pp123-135. [29]

Norris, J., Cuddigan, J. & Ryan, S., "Developing a Method for Validating the Output of Computerized Expert Systems in Nursing," Proc. of the 7th Conf. on Classification of Nursing Diagnoses, A.M. McLane, ed., St. Louis, MO, C. V. Mosby, 1987, pp160-167. [5, 20]

Nykänen, P. & Nuutila, P., "Validation and Evaluation of a System for Thyroid Disorders," Expert Systems with Applications, 3, 1991, np. [20]

Nykänen, P., Chowdhury, S. & Wigertz, O., "Evaluation of Decision Support Systems in Medicine," Computer Programs and Methods in Biomedicine, 34, 1991 pp229-238. [20, 29]

Nykänen, P., ed., Issues in Evaluation of Computer-Based Support to Clinical Decision Making, Sydpol Working Group 5, Oslo, University Press, 1990. [20]

Nykänen, P., et al., "Guidelines for the Evaluation of Computer-Based Support to Clinical Decision Making," Proc of the Scandinavian Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (SCAI-89), Tampere, Finland, 1989, pp395-402. [3, 20, 25]

O'Moore, R.R. & Engelbrecht, R., "The Evaluation of Medical Decision Support/Expert Systems," System Engineering in Medicine, J. Talmon & J. Fox, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1990, pp263-273. [20, 29]

Petrucci, K., Jacox, A., McCormick, K. et al., "Evaluating Appropriateness of a Nurse Expert System's Patient Assessment: Urological Nursing Information System (UNIS)," Computers in Nursing, 10(6), 1992, pp243-249. [29]

Petrucci, K., Petrucci, P., Canfield, K., et al., "Evaluation of UNIS: Urological Nursing Information System," Proc. of the 16th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-92), Washington, DC, November 1992, pp43-47. [20, 29]

Phelps, C. & Hutson, A., "Estimating Diagnostic Test Accuracy Using a 'Fuzzy Gold Standard'," Medical Decision Making, 15, 1995, pp44-57. [29]

Plugge, L.A., Verhey, F.R.J. & Jolles, J., "A Desktop Expert System for the Differential Diagnosis of Dementia: An Evaluation Study," Int. Jour. of Technology Assessment in Health Care, 6(1), 1990, pp147-156. [20, 29]

Poirier, T.I. & Guidici, R.A., "Drug Interaction Microcomputer Software Evaluation: The Medical Letter Drug Interactions Program," Hospital Pharmacy, 25(5), 1990, p458. [29]

Poirier, T.I. & Guidici, R.A., "Evaluation of Drug Interaction Microcomputer Software: Part 1-Hansten Drug Interaction Knowledge Base Program," Hospital Pharmacy, 23(12), 1988, p1062. [29]

Poirier, T.I., "Evaluation of Drug Interaction Microcomputer Software: Dambro's Drug Interactions," Hospital Pharmacy, 25(1), 1990, np. [29]

Pool, K. & Finitzo, T., "Evaluation of a Computer-Automated Program for Clinical Assessment of the Auditory Brain Stem Response," Ear and Hearing, 10, 1989, pp304-310. [29]

Porter, J., Kingsland, L.I. & Lindberg, D., "The AI/RHEUM Knowledge-Based Computer Consultant System in Rheumatology: Performance in the Diagnosis of 59 Connective Tissue Disease Patients from Japan," Arthritis and Rheumatology, 31, 1988, pp219-226. [29]

Pringle, M., Robins, S. & Brown, G., "TIMER: A New Objective Measure of Consultation Content and its Application to Computer Assisted Consultations," British Medical Jour, Clinical Research Edition, 293, 1986, pp20-22. [29]

Quaglini, S., Stefanelli, M., Barosi, G. & Berzuini, A., "A Performance Evaluation of the Expert System ANEMIA," Computers and Biomedical Research, 21(4), 1988, pp307-323. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Quaglini, S., Stefanelli, M., Barosi, G. & Berzuini, A., "Evaluating the Performance of ANEMIA," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (AIME-87), J. Fox, M. Fieschi & R. Engelbrecht, eds., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1987, pp229-238. [3, 20, 25]

Rabelo, A., Rocha, A.R., de Souza, A.D., Ximenez, A.A., Lobo, N., Carvalho, D., Filho, J.W., de Oliveira, K.M., de Souza, L.A. & Werneck, V., "An Expert System for Diagnosis of Acute Myocardal Infarction: Software Quality Assurance Procedures," Proc. of the 3<u>rd</u> European Workshop on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems (EUROVAV-95), Chambery, France, June 1995, pp173-187. [5]

Rautaharju, P.M. & Smets, P.H., "Evaluation of Computer ECG Programs. The Strange Case of the Golden Standard," Computers and Biomedical Research, 12, 1979, pp39-46. [20]

Reggia, J.A. & Tuhrim, R.S., "Performance Assessment," Computer-Assisted Medical Decision Making, J.A. Reggia & R.S. Tuhrim, eds., Springer-Verlag, New York, NY, 1985, pp32-34. [20]

Reggia, J.A., "Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems: A Case Study in Performance Assessment," Proc. of the 9<u>th</u> IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-85), Baltimore, MD, 1985, pp287-291. [6, 20, 29]

Reggia, J.R., "Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems: Case Study in Performance Assessment," Selected Topics in Medical Artificial Intelligence, P.L. Miller, ed., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1988, pp222-230. [3, 20, 25, 29]

Reid, J. & Kenny, G., "Evaluation of Closed-Loop Control of Arterial Pressure after Cardiopulmonary Bypass," British Jour. of Anesthesiology, 59, 1987, pp247-255. [29]

Rossi-Mori, A. & Ricci, F.L., "Comprehensive Criteria for Evaluation and Design of Knowledge Based Systems in Medicine," System Engineering in Medicine, J. Talmon & J. Fox, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1990, np. [20]

Rossi-Mori, A. & Ricci, F.L., "On the Assessment of Medical Expert Systems," Expert Systems and Decision Support in Medicine, Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics, 36, O. Rienhoff, V. Piccolo & B. Schneider, Springer-Verlag, 1988, pp292-295. [3, 20, 25]

Rossi-Mori, A. & Ricci, F.L., "Some Comments on the Evaluation of Medical Expert Systems," Proc of the AIM Workshop 6, EEC, Brussels, Belgium, November 1987, np. [20]

Rossi-Mori, A., Pisanelli, D.M. & Ricci, F.L., "Evaluation Stages and Design Steps for Knowledge-Base Systems in Medicine," Medical Informatics, 15(3), July-September 1990, pp191-204. [20, 29]

Rossi-Mori, A., Pisanelli, D.M. & Ricci, F.L., "The Role of Knowledge-Based Systems in Medicine: Epistemological and Evaluation Issues," Proc. of the COMAC Meeting, Maastricht, The Netherlands, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1989, pp16-18.3. [20]

Rovani, C., Jeun, Maitre, X., Degoulet, P., Suaquet, D., Aime, F., Lavril, M., Devries, C., Chatellier, G., Plovin, P.F. & Corvol, P., "Worst Situation Evaluation of an Expert System in Hypertension Management," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics (MIE-87), A. Serio, R. O'Moore, A. Tardini & F. Roger, eds., EDI Press, Rome, Italy, 1987, pp967-973. [20]

Schecke, T.H., Popp, H.J., Rau, G., Käsmacher, H. & Kalff, G., "Design of a Knowledge-Based Decision Support System for Anesthesia Using Simulators Supporting Knowledge

Acquisition and Validation," Proc. of the European Congress on Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, J. Hunter, J. Cookson & J. Wyatt, eds., Springer-Verlag, London, England, 1989, pp108-112. [20]

Schewe, S., Scherrmann, W. & Gierl, L., "Evaluation and Measurement of Benefit of an Expert System for Differential Diagnosis in Rheumatology," Expert Systems and Decision Support in Medicine, Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics, 36, O. Rienhoff, V. Piccolo & B. Schneider, Springer-Verlag, 1988, pp352-354. [20, 25]

Schneider, J., Renner, R., Engelbrecht, R. & Piwernetz, K., "DIAMON: First Evaluation Results," Proc. of the 5th World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-89), B. Barber, C. Dexian, Q. Dulie & G. Wagner, eds., Singapore, Elsevier North Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1989, np. [20]

Schoknecht, G., "Zum Problem der Validierung Diagnostischer Verfahren," Biomedizinische Technik, 24, November 1979, pp262-266. [20]

Shahsavar, N., Ludwigs, U., Blomqvist, H. et al., "Evaluation of a Knowledge-Based Decision Support System for Ventilator Therapy Management," Artificial Intelligence in Medicine, 7(1), 1995, pp37-52. [29]

Shwe, M.A., Tu, S.W. & Fagan, L.M., "Validating the Knowledge Base of a Therapy Planning System," Methods of Information in Medicine, 28(1), January 1989, pp36-50. [3, 6, 19, 20, 25, 29]

Simborg, D. & Whiting-O'Keefe, Q., "Evaluation Methodology for Ambulatory Care Information Systems," Medical Care, 20, 1982, pp255-265. [29]

Skaug, K., "Practical Experience in Validation of an Existing Clinical Data Management System: A Case Study from Nycomed Imaging AS, Norway," Proc. of the Drug Information Association (DIA) Conf. on Computer Validation, London, England, January, 1996, np. [29]

Spiegelhalter, D., "Evaluation of Clinical Decision Aids with an Application to a System for Dyspepsia," Statistics in Medicine, 2, 1983, pp207-216. [20, 29]

Valluy, L., Nykänen, P., Rantanen, J., Salmela, J., Gränroos, P. & Lumio, J., "An Approach to Combine Knowledge Validation and Evaluation with Development in Medical AI," Proc of the Scandinavian Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (SCAI-89), Tampere, Finland, 1989, pp865-875. [3, 20, 25]

van Bemmel, J.H. & Willems, J.L., "Standardization and Validation of Medical Decision-Support Systems: The CSE Project," Methods of Information in Medicine, 29, 1990, pp261-262. [20]

van Bemmel, J.H., Plokker, H.W., Hengeveld, S.J. & Talmon, J.L., "Structured Evaluation of ECG Processing Packages," Proc of MEDIS-78, Osaka, Japan, 1978, pp259-260. [20]

Van der Lei, J., Musen, M., van der Does, E. et al., "Comparison of Computer- Aided and Human Review of General Practitioners' Management of Hypertension," Lancet, 338, 1991, pp1504-1508. [29]

Verdaguer, A., Patak, A., Sancho, J.J., Sierra, C. & Sanz, F., "Validation of the Medical Expert System PNEUMON-IA," Computers and Biomedical Research, 25(6), December 1992, pp511-526. [19, 20]

Waxman, H. & Worley, W., "Computer-Assisted Adult Medical Diagnosis: Subject Review and Evaluation of a New Microcomputer-Based System," Medicine, 69, 1990, pp125-136. [29]

Weber, J., Bartels, P., Griswold, W. et al., "Colonic Lesion Expert System: Performance Evaluation," Analytical and Quantitative Cytology and Histology, 10, 1988, pp150-159. [29]

White, R., Hong, R., Venook, A. et al., "Initiation of Warfarin Therapy: Comparison of Physician Dosing with Computer-Assisted Dosing," Jour. of General Internal Medicine, 2, 1987, pp141-148. [29]

Whitebeck, C. & Brooks, R., "Criteria for Evaluating a Computer Aid to Clinical Reasoning," Jour. of Medicine and Philosophy, 8, 1983, pp51 - 65. [20, 29]

Wied, G., Bartels, P., Bibbo, M. et al., "Computer Recognition of Ectocervical Cells: Classification Accuracy and Spatial Resolution," Acta. Cytology, 21, 1977, pp753-764. [29]

Willems, J. & Pardaens, J., "Reproducibility of Diagnostic Results by a Multivariate Computer ECG Analysis Program (AVA 3.5)," European Jour. of Cardiology, 6, 1977, pp229-243. [29]

Willems, J., Abreu-Lima, C. & Arnaud, P., "Evaluation of ECG Interpretation Results Obtained by Computer and Cardiologists," Methods of Information in Medicine, 29, 1990, pp308-316. [29]

Willems, J., Abreu-Lima, C. & Arnaud, P., "The Diagnostic Performance of Computer Programs for the Interpretation of Electrocardiograms," New England Jour. of Medicine, 325, 1991, pp1767-1773. [29]

Wyatt, J. & Spiegelhalter, D., "Evaluating Medical Decision Aids: What to Test, and How?," Systems Engineering in Medicine, J. Talmon & J., Fox, eds., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1990, np. [3, 25]

Wyatt, J. & Spiegelhalter, D., "Evaluating Medical Expert Systems: What to Test and How?" Medical Informatics, 15(3), July-September 1990, pp205-217. [20, 29]

Wyatt, J. & Spiegelhalter, D., "Field Trials of Medical Decision-Aids: Potential Problems and Solutions," Proc. of the 15th IEEE Annual Symp. on Computer Applications in Medical Care (SCAMC-91), Washington, DC, November 1991, pp3-7. [29]

Wyatt, J., "Lessons Learned from the Field Trial of ACORN, An Expert System to Advise on Chest Pain," Proc. of the 5th World Conf. on Medical Informatics (MEDINFO-89), B. Barber, D. Cao, D. Qin & G. Wagner, eds., Singapore, Elsevier North Holland, Amsterdam, The Netherlands, 1989, pp111-115. [20, 29]

Wyatt, J., "The Evaluation of Clinical Decision Support Systems: A Discussion of the Methodology Used in the ACORN Project," Lecture Notes in Medical Informatics

(AIME-87), J. Fox, M. Fieschi & R. Engelbrecht, eds., Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, 1987, pp15-24. [20]

Wyatt, J.C., "Clinical Data Systems, Part III: Developing and Evaluating Clinical Data Systems," Lancet, 344, 1994, pp1682-1688. [29]

Yamashita, D.T., Erlbaum, M.S., Harrison, P.B. & Winkelman, B.R., "Preliminary Evaluations of RECONSIDER a Diagnostic Prompting Program," Proc. of the AAMSI Congress, D.A.B. Lindberg, E.E. VanBrunt & M.A. Jenkin, eds., 1983, pp92-96. [20]

Yokoi, M., Uozumi, Z., Okamoto, N. et al., "Clinical Evaluation on 5 Years' Experience of Automated Phonocardiographic Analysis," Japanese Heart Jour., 18, 1977, pp482-490. [29]

Yu, V.L., Fagan, L.M., Wraith, S.M., Clancey, W.J., Scott, A.C., Hannagan, J.F., Blum, R.L. & Cohen, S.N., "Antimicrobial Selection by a Computer: A Blinded Evaluation by Infectious Disease Experts," Jour. of the American Medical Association, 242(12), 1979, pp1279-1282. [19, 29]

Mineral Exploration

Gaschnig, J., "Preliminary Performance Analysis of the PROSPECTOR Consultant System for Mineral Exploration," Proc. of the 6th Int. Joint Conf. on Artificial Intelligence, Morgan Kaufmann, San Mateo, CA, 1979, pp308-310. [19]

Mission-Critical Software

Duke, E.L., "V & V of Flight and Mission-Critical Software," IEEE Software, 6(3), May 1989, pp39-45. [30]

Wen, W., Callahan, J. & Napolitano, M., "Develop Verifiable Neuronal Network Controller," Proc. of the Workshop on AI Applications to Aviation, Toulouse, France, November 1996, np. [30]

Natural Language Generation

Maybury, M.T., "Evaluation Spaces: A Framework for Evaluating Natural Language Generation Systems," Proc. of the AAAI-90 Workshop on Evaluating Natural Language Generation Systems, Boston, MA, July 1990, np. [29]

Scheduling Systems

Choi, H-J., Liatsos, V., El-Kholy, A.& Richards, B., "Recovering from Failure in Temporal Planning," Proc. of 12th European Conf. on Artificial Intelligence (ECAI'96), Workshop on Cross-Fertilization in Planning, Budapest, Hungary, August 1996, pp31-35. [30]

Elleby, P., Fargher, H.E. & Addis, T.R., "Evaluating a Knowledge Based Scheduling Systems," Proc. of the Colloq. on the Computing and Control Division, Testing Expert Systems, December 1987, pp2/1-2/4. [20]

Honma, M., Nakano, A., Ishida, H. & Tsuruta, S., "Validation of an Elevator Maintenance Engineer Scheduling AI System and its Knowledge Refinement", Proc. of 12th Annual Florida Artificial Intelligence Research Symp., Orlando, FL, May 1999, pp521-525. [30]

Honma, M., Nakamura, H., Nakano, A. & Tsuruta, S., "Knowledge Refinement Approach through Incorporating Case-Based Knowledge in Maintenance Engineer Scheduling AI System", Proc. of the 1999 IEEE Int. Conf. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, Tokyo, Japan, October 1999, ppV814-V819. [30]

Kunz, J.C. & Husain, N., "Validating Knowledge Systems: A Scheduling Example," Proc. of the 1991 IEEE. Int. Conf. on Robotics and Automation, Sacramento, CA, April 1991, pp2780-2784. [20]

Tsuruta, S., Egushi, T., Yanai, S. & Ooshima, T., "Dynamic Goal-Centered Coordination AI System: Application and the Validation Problem," Proc. of 42nd Int. Ilmenau Scientific Colloq., Ilmenau, Germany, 1997, pp53-58. [30]

Software Engineering

Ramsey, C.L. & Basili, V.R., "An Evaluation of Expert Systems for Software Engineering Management," IEEE Trans. on Software Engineering, 15(6), June 1989, p747. [29]

Space Applications

Andert, E.P. & Frasher, C. "A Verifiable, Autonomous Satellite Control System," Proc. of the 1989 IEEE Aerospace Applications Conf., IEEE 89TH0233-7, Colorado, 1989, np. [27]

Barbaliscia, F., Masullo, P.G. & Fornari, M., "Software Package for the Performance Evaluation of Satellite Communications Systems with Adaptive Allocation of On-Board Common Source," IEEE Trans. on Communications, 40(6), 1992, p1003. [29]

Rushby, J. & Crow, J., Evaluation of an Expert System for Fault Detection, Isolation, and Recovery in the Manned Maneuvering Unit, NASA Contractor Report CR-187466, SRI International, Menlo Park CA, 1990. [6, 29]

Speech & Text Understanding

Chinchor, N., Hirschman, L. & Lewis, D.D., "Evaluating Message Understanding Systems: An Analysis of the Third Message Understanding Conference (MUC-3)," Computational Linguistics, 19(3), 1993, pp410-49. [29]

Detmer, W.M., Shiffman, S., Wyatt, J.C. et al., "A Continuous Speech Interface to a Decision Support System: An Evaluation Using a Wizard of Oz Experimental Paradigm," JAMIA, 2(1), 1995, pp46-57. [29]

Lehnert, W. & Sundheim, B., "A Performance Evaluation of Text-Analysis Technologies," AI Magazine, 12, 1991, pp81-94. [29]

Survey Data Analyses

Sunayama, W., Oshawa, Y. & Yachida, M., "Validating Questionnaire Data Analysis Systems by Shrinking Iterative Questionnaires," <u>Proc. of the IJCAI-97 Workshop on Validation, Verification & Refinement of AI Systems and Subsystems</u>, Nagoya, Japan, August 1997, pp65-66. [30]

System/Product Design

Boswell, R., Craw, S. & Rowe, R., "Knowledge Refinement for a Design System," <u>Proc. of the European Knowledge Acquisition Workshop (EKAW-97)</u>, E. Plaza & R. Benjamins, eds., Sant Feliu de Guixols, Spain, 1997, Springer-Verlag, Berlin, Germany, pp49-64. [22]

Boswell, R., Craw, S. & Rowe, R., "Refinement of a Product Formulation Expert System," <u>Proc of the ECAI-96 Workshop on Validation, Verification and Refinement of Knowledge-Based Systems</u>, Budapest, Hungary, August 1996, pp74-79. [22]

Telecommunications Applications

Grogono, P., Preece, A.D., Shinghal, R. & Suen, C.Y., "A Survey of Evaluation Techniques Used for Expert Systems in Telecommunications," <u>Expert Systems with Applications</u>, 5(2/3), 1992, pp395-401. [5]

REFERENCES

This bibliography was compiled from several other sources. The contributions of these sources are acknowledged by the numbers within brackets at the end of each bibliographic entry.

[1] G. Playle & C. Beckman, Knowledge-Based Systems and Automated Software Validation and Verification.

[2] KBS VVT Tools, 25 October 1996,
http://www.csd.abdn.ac.uk/~apreece/Research/vvtools.html

[3] Englebrect, R., "Assessment and Evaluation of Information Technology in Medicine," <u>Studies in Health Technology and Informatics</u>, 17, E.M.S.J. van Gennip & J.L. Talmon, eds., IOS Press, Amsterdam, 1995, pp 51-66.

[4] R. T. Plant, Tools for the Validation & Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, 1985-1995 References, Department of Computer Information Systems, University of Miami, Coral Gables, FL 33124

[5] References on V&V of Knowledge-Based Systems,
http://www.cs.bris.ac.uk/~dattani/TN-703.html

[6] Alun Preece, Pedro Meseguer, & Bob O'Keefe, Verification, Validation & Testing of Knowledge-Based Systems: An Annotated Selective Bibliography, March 15, 1995, http://www.csd.abdn.ac.uk/~apreece/Research/vvbiblio.html

[7] Gonzales, A.J., Xu, L. & Gupta, U.M., "Validation Techniques for Case-Based Reasoning Systems," IEEE Trans. on Systems, Man, and Cybernetics, 28(4), July 1998, pp465-477.

[8] Abstracts for the AAAI-97 Workshop on Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, http://www.aaai.org.Workshops/1997/validation-ws97.html.

[9] Preece, A., Publications of Alun Preece, www.csd.abdn.ac.uk/~apreece/pubs/

[10] European Symposium on the Validation and Verification of Knowledge-Based Systems, Leuven, Belgium, June 1997, http://www.econ.kuleuven.ac.be/congres/EuroVav/proceedings.htm

[11] Graph-Based Approaches to Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee, 25 October 1996, http://www.uwm.edu/~derek/kbsvvt/metgraph.html

[12] Network-Based Approaches to Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee, 25 October 1996, http://www.uwm.edu/~derek/kbsvvt/metnet.html

[13] Other Approaches to Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee, 25 October 1996, http://www.uwm.edu/~derek/kbsvvt/metother.html

[14] Dissertations on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee, 25 October 1996, http://www.uwm.edu/~derek/kbsvvt/refdiss.html

[15] Books on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee, 29 October 1996, http://www.uwm.edu/~derek/kbsvvt/refbook.html

[16] Bibliography on the Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems, University of Wisconsin-Milwaukee, 25 October 1996, http://www.uwm.edu/~derek/kbsvvt/refbib.html

[17] Publications of Marc Ayel, Universite de Savoie, France, http://lia.univ-savoi.fr/~mayel/publis.html.

[18] Publications of J. Vanthienen, Katholieke Universiteit Leuven, Belgium, 1997, http://www.econ.kuleuven.ac.be/tew/academic/infosys/members/vthienen/pubhtm.htm

[19] Kristen Iden, Bibliography on the Validation of Expert Systems, Turner Fairbank Highway Research Center, nd,

[20] J. L. Talmon & R. van der Loo, Literature on Assessment of Information Technology and Medical KBS Evaluation: Studies and Methodologies, www-vatam.unimaas/ATIM/ATIM_new.htm.

[21] Antoniou, G., Publications, 9 April 1998 (in Antoniou & Antoniou 2)

[22] Craw, S., Publications, (in S. Craw & Craw 2)

[23] O'Leary, D.E., Publications, (in O'Leary 1993-1998)

[24] Rousset, M.-C., Publications, (in Rousset)

[25] VATAM Bibliography (in VATAM Bibliog)

[26] VALID Bibliography (in VALID Project Lit)

[27] Andert, E.P., Publications, 18 October 1998, (in ESS@ VV&T)

[28] Meseguer, P. & Plaza, E., 1994 (in VALID 2)

[29] Buchanan, B.G., "Verification and Validation of Knowledge-Based Systems: A Representative Bibliography," Proc. of the Workshop on Evaluation of Knowledge-Based Systems, Bethesda, MD, December 1995, np.

[30] Gonzalez, A.J. & Knauf, R., Personal Communication, 4 June 2002.